

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Fifty-seventh meeting of the Standing Committee
Geneva (Switzerland), 14-18 July 2008

Interpretation and implementation of the Convention

Species trade and conservation

Review of Significant Trade

REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS TO SUSPEND TRADE MADE MORE THAN TWO YEARS AGO

1. This document has been prepared by the Secretariat.
2. In the context of the implementation of Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP13) on *Review of Significant Trade in specimens of Appendix-II species*, the Standing Committee has recommended that Parties do not accept imports of specimens of a number of species from certain States, until recommendations of the Animals and Plants Committees made under this Resolution are implemented by those States. A list of such recommendations currently in force, together with their date of application and, in a small number of cases, any limited exceptions to the recommendation, can be found in Notification to the Parties No. 2007/004 of 22 January 2007.
3. Paragraph v) of the Resolution states that:

the Standing Committee, in consultation with the Secretariat and the Chairman of the Animals or Plants Committee, shall review recommendations to suspend trade that have been in place for longer than two years and, if appropriate, take measures to address the situation.
4. In accordance with this paragraph, the Secretariat commissioned a study to review such recommendations to suspend trade established prior to September 2003 and the full report of this study is presented in Annex 2 to the present document in English only, the language in which it was submitted. As the Review of Significant Trade only became applicable to plants after the 11th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (Nairobi, April 2000), all of the cases reviewed concern animal species.
5. On the basis of this report, the Secretariat has discussed these cases with the Chairman of the Animals Committee and their recommendations are presented in Annex 1 of the present document.
6. The Committee is asked to note that, as a consequence of the adoption of new nomenclatural references at the 14th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (The Hague, June 2007), the following species names mentioned in Annexes 1 and 2 of the present document have changed since the Committee made its recommendations:

Old name	New name
<i>Lama guanicoe</i>	<i>Lama glama guanicoe</i>
<i>Geochelone pardalis</i>	<i>Stigmochelys pardalis</i>
<i>Chamaeleo campani</i>	<i>Furcifer campani</i>

Old name	New name
<i>Chamaeleo furcifer</i>	<i>Calumma furcifer</i>
<i>Chamaeleo globifer</i>	<i>Calumma globifer</i>
<i>Chamaeleo lateralis</i>	<i>Furcifer lateralis</i>
<i>Chamaeleo linotus</i>	<i>Calumma linota</i>
<i>Chamaeleo malthe</i>	<i>Calumma malthe</i>
<i>Chamaeleo monoceras</i>	<i>Furcifer monoceras</i>
<i>Chamaeleo oustaleti</i>	<i>Furcifer oustaleti</i>
<i>Chamaeleo pardalis</i>	<i>Furcifer pardalis</i>
<i>Chamaeleo verrucosus</i>	<i>Furcifer verrucosus</i>

7. On 28 December 2007, the Secretariat received a letter and report from the Management Authority of the United Republic of Tanzania requesting the withdrawal of the recommendation to suspend trade in *Agapornis fischeri*. The information in the report (provided here in Annex 3 in English only, the language in which it was submitted) was also taken into account while considering the recommendations made regarding this species.

Recommendation

8. The Standing Committee is invited to adopt the recommendations made by the Secretariat and the Chairman of the Animals Committee contained in Annex 1 to the present document.

SUMMARY OF CASES CONSIDERED AND RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SECRETARIAT AND
CHAIRMAN OF THE ANIMALS COMMITTEE

1. Argentina

Lama guanicoe (now *Lama glama guanicoe*)

- a) **Original concerns and recommendations of the Animals Committee (AC):** Although international trade levels were probably not a threat to the survival of the species on a global basis, some local populations might be adversely affected. The Committee recommended that Argentina should:
- within 3 months, provide the biological basis for its management programme and details of the mechanisms for controlling trade.
 - within 12 months, investigate reports of undocumented trade in meat and advise the Secretariat of the results.
- b) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** The Management Authority (MA) did not provide information on the biological basis of its management programme to the AC within the deadline set, though subsequently provided information on the estimated population and on exports in some years, and noted that a new system for managing the species was being introduced.
- c) **Comments of the Secretariat:** As the Standing Committee (SC) recommendation not to accept imports from Argentina specifically exempts wool from live shearing, this suspension no longer appears to be relevant to Argentina's trade policies for this species, which limits exports to wool sheared from live animals.
- d) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *L. guanicoe* from Argentina.

2. Democratic Republic of the Congo

a) *Geochelone pardalis* (now *Stigmochelys pardalis*)

- i) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** A total of 2,650 live *G. pardalis* were reported as exported from Democratic Republic of the Congo in 1995 and 1996 while there were doubts that the species actually occurred in that country. The AC recommended that the Democratic Republic of the Congo should:
- within 3 months, provide information on the distribution and abundance of this species in its country; and the justification, or the scientific basis by which it had established that the quantities exported would not be detrimental to the survival of the species.
- ii) **Summary of MA's response:** No response to the recommendations was received by the Secretariat.
- iii) **Comments of the Secretariat:** There have been no CITES-reported exports from the Democratic Republic of the Congo since 1999. It appears that the MA is waiting for information on the current status of the species to be provided by scientific institutions in the country prior to deciding upon any further actions.
- iv) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *G. pardalis* from the Democratic Republic of the Congo if the MA confirms to the Secretariat that it will not issue

export permits for this species until it has established a process for making non-detriment findings to the satisfaction of the Secretariat and Chairman of the AC.

b) *Hippopotamus amphibius*

- i) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** The Review indicated that the species was widely distributed in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, but with populations mainly concentrated in two national parks, and decreasing. The species was known to be hunted for meat, teeth/tusks and possibly skins. From 1994 to 1996, gross exports of over 22 tons of teeth/tusks were reported from Democratic Republic of the Congo. The AC recommended that Democratic Republic of the Congo:
 - within 3 months, provide detailed information on management measures in place to monitor wild populations of the species and implement the requirements of Article IV, paragraph 2, of the Convention when authorizing exports.
- ii) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** No response to the recommendations was received by the Secretariat.
- iii) **Comments of the Secretariat:** According to a planned Ministerial Decree (Arrêté No. 020 du 20 mai 2006), *H. amphibius* was to be reclassified as a fully protected species.
- iv) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *H. amphibius* from the Democratic Republic of the Congo if the MA confirms to the Secretariat that the above mentioned Ministerial Decree has been signed and is in force.

c) *Poicephalus robustus*

- i) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** *P. robustus* was said to frequent the montane forests of the Democratic Republic of the Congo up to 2,750 m, and occurred regularly in the lowlands of the south, but not in great numbers. From 1991 to 1996, there were reported commercial exports of 400 live birds. The AC recommended that the Democratic Republic of the Congo:
 - within 3 months, provide information on the justification, or the scientific basis by which it had established that the quantities currently exported would not be detrimental to the survival of the species and on the distribution and abundance of this species in its country.
- ii) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** No response to the recommendations was received by the Secretariat.
- iii) **Comments of the Secretariat:** No exports from the Democratic Republic of the Congo have been reported since 2000.
- iv) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *P. robustus* from the Democratic Republic of the Congo if the MA establishes a cautious export quota in consultation with the Secretariat and the Chairman of the AC.

3. Lithuania

Lynx lynx

- a) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** A review of trade indicated that a decreasing number of felid species was available to the fur trade, with apparent fluctuations in the number of skins in the trade from 1983 to 1989 and a slight fall in trade after 1986. Exports from the USSR were fairly stable from 1985 to 1989 at an average of approximately 5,000 skins per year. It was felt at the time that the harvest of and trade in *L. lynx* should be closely monitored

in the future. Populations of *L. lynx* in the USSR were believed to be the largest in the world, spread from the Pacific coast to the western border with isolated populations in the Carpathians and central Asia. No specific information was provided on *L. lynx* populations in Lithuania. The AC recommended that:

- within 3 months, the Russian Federation and other relevant independent states that formerly constituted the USSR should establish export quotas for the species and inform the Secretariat of the level of these quotas.
- b) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** No response to the recommendations was received by the Secretariat.
- c) **Comments of the Secretariat:** It is apparent that the original AC recommendation was issued as a blanket recommendation to several of what were at the time newly independent range States for *L. lynx*, without full knowledge of whether trade was taking place from the individual countries. Given the ban on hunting of *L. lynx* in Lithuania at the time the recommendation was made, the original AC recommendation and the SC recommendation to suspend imports would not appear to have been relevant when issued, and remain irrelevant given the continuing ban on hunting and export in this country.
- d) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *L. lynx* from Lithuania.

4. Madagascar

- a) *Chamaeleo* spp. [except *C. lateralis*, *C. oustaleti*, *C. pardalis* and *C. verrucosus* (now *Furcifer lateralis*, *F. oustaleti*, *F. pardalis* and *F. verrucosus* respectively)]
- i) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** Six Malagasy *Chamaeleo* species (*C. furcifer*, *C. globifer*, *C. linotus*, *C. malthe*, *C. campani* and *C. monoceras*) were included in the Review of Significant Trade. The numbers of specimens reported in international trade from 1986 to 1990 ranged from zero to just over 1,000, depending on the species involved. Information available was insufficient to assess the impact of trade in the species in question, though concern was expressed with regard to trade in several species, particularly those with restricted ranges. CITES annual report data analysis showed that relatively large numbers of specimens in trade were only being identified to the generic level, i.e. as *Chamaeleo* spp. The AC then chose to make recommendations to Madagascar at the generic level rather than at the species level. The AC recommended that MG should regularly submit copies of all export permits issued to the Secretariat and with 12 months:
- suspend exports of all but four *Chamaeleo* spp. pending science-based harvest quotas;
 - provide the biological basis for determining that exports of these species would not be detrimental;
 - cease to issue export permits that did not indicate the species involved;
 - implement a system to verify the identification of specimens before they were exported; and
 - undertake scientifically based field assessments of the species before allowing exports to resume.
- ii) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** No response initially. Later a proposal for "Investigation into the status of *Chamaeleo* spp. and *Phelsuma* spp. in Madagascar and the development of a management programme" was approved by the SC. In 1995, the MA notified the Secretariat that it would not issue export permits without specifying the species to be exported. The Secretariat was satisfied that this particular recommendation had been implemented. In November 1995, the MA provided a two-page summary of data on the

number of known sites, extent of range habitat type and suggested annual quotas for all *Chamaeleo* species, but there was no evidence at that time that exports were suspended.

- iii) **Comments of the Secretariat:** In response to a country-based Review of Significant Trade, Madagascar has established a CITES Action Plan which in large part is specifically aimed at dealing with commercial export of Appendix-II listed species, of which *Chamaeleo* spp. form a part. In the case of *Chamaeleo* spp., most exports of these species are now reported at species rather than genus level, which should enable a more precise evaluation of the implementation of Article IV, paragraphs 2 (a) and 3, of the Convention for these species.
- iv) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should:
- request the AC to re-evaluate its recommendations concerning the export of *Chamaeleo* spp. (except *C. lateralis*, *C. oustaleti*, *C. pardalis* and *C. verrucosus*) from Madagascar on a species by species basis; and
 - agree that its recommendations to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *Chamaeleo* spp. [except *C. lateralis*, *C. oustaleti*, *C. pardalis* and *C. verrucosus*] from Madagascar should be withdrawn in cases where the AC considers that the provisions of Article IV, paragraphs 2 (a) and 3, of the Convention are being complied with.

b) *Coracopsis vasa*

- i) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** Habitat loss was regarded as the primary threat, although at the time of Review (1991), the species appeared to be common in Madagascar. A total population estimate was given of greater than 30,000 birds, based on anecdotal field information, and it was uncertain whether the Malagasy population was stable or decreasing in numbers. International trade decreased during 1986 to 1990 from 724 specimens in 1986 to 75 in 1990. In 1991, levels of trade were probably not affecting target populations of *C. vasa*; however, there was a suggestion that trade levels increased sharply in 1991, which would have indicated that continual monitoring was needed. The AC recommended that Madagascar:
- within 3 months (12 January 1994), provide details of the biological basis for determining that exports of specimens of the species would not be detrimental and, by 23 December 1994, set a cautious annual export quota.
- ii) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** The MA responded with comments and a draft project proposal for presentation at the 32nd meeting of the SC. The Secretariat asked what action had been taken to implement the AC recommendation, and requested a copy of the strategy referred to by the MA. A two-page summary of the principles of the strategy was provided, but the SC did not consider this response sufficient. No cautious export quota was set by Madagascar. In March 1995, a proposal for Project S-084 "Investigation into the population status of *Agapornis cana* and *Coracopsis vasa* in Madagascar and the development of a management programme for their conservation" prepared by the MA was approved by the SC but funds were not raised for the project.
- iii) **Comments of the Secretariat:** In response to a country-based Review of Significant Trade, MG has established a CITES Action Plan which in large part is specifically aimed at dealing with commercial export of Appendix-II listed species, including *Coracopsis vasa*. For this species, it is questionable whether a detailed and expensive survey of the species in the wild is necessary to ensure the establishment of sustainable harvest quotas, particularly in view of the relatively low expected level of demand in international trade.
- iv) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *C. vasa* from Madagascar, if the MA establishes a cautious export quota in consultation with the Secretariat and the Chairman of the AC.

- c) *Phelsuma* spp. (except *P. laticauda*, *P. lineata*, *P. madagascariensis* and *P. quadriocellata*)
- i) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** Seven Malagasy *Phelsuma* species were included in the Review of Significant Trade (*Phelsuma barbouri*, *P. breviceps*, *P. flavigularis*, *P. quadriocellata*, *P. seippi*, *P. serraticauda*, and *P. standingi*). Reported trade in *Phelsuma* species from 1986 to 1990 ranged from 15 for *Phelsuma seippi* to over 18,000 for *P. quadriocellata*. Information available was insufficient to assess the impact of trade in the species in question, though concern was expressed with regard to trade in several species, particularly those with restricted ranges. CITES annual report data analysis in conjunction with these reviews showed that relatively large numbers of specimens in trade were only being identified to the generic level, i.e. as *Phelsuma* spp. The AC then chose to make recommendations to the MA of Madagascar at the generic level rather than at the species level and made recommendations as detailed in paragraph 4 a) i).
- ii) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** See paragraph 4 a) ii)
- iii) **Comments of the Secretariat:** See paragraph 4 a) iii).
- iv) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should:
- request the AC to re-evaluate its recommendations concerning the export of *Phelsuma* spp. (except *P. laticauda*, *P. lineata*, *P. madagascariensis* and *P. quadriocellata*) from MG on a species-by-species basis; and
 - agree that its recommendations to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *Phelsuma* spp. (except *P. laticauda*, *P. lineata*, *P. madagascariensis* and *P. quadriocellata*) from Madagascar should be withdrawn in cases where the AC considers that the provisions of Article IV, paragraphs 2 (a) and 3 of the Convention are being complied with.

5. Malawi

Hippopotamus amphibius

- a) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** Information indicated that Malawi was densely populated with around 7,000 to 10,000 *H. amphibius* in 1993 to 1994, with legal culling and illegal hunting for meat, trophies and cash reported. CITES data reported exports from Malawi of 282 carvings, 11 tonnes and 759 individual skins and 6.7 tonnes and 656 individual teeth from 1991 to 1996. The AC recommended that Malawi within 3 months:
- provide detailed information on management measures in place to monitor wild populations of the species and implement the requirements of Article IV, paragraph 2, of the Convention when authorizing exports.
- b) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** No response to the recommendation was received by the Secretariat.
- c) **Comments of the Secretariat:** Malawi's *H. amphibius* population has declined from as many as 10,000 individuals at the time the AC recommendation was made to less than 2,000 at present, although the population is currently considered to be stable. The AC recommendation would appear to be still relevant, especially considering the apparent population decline of the species.
- d) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should maintain its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *H. amphibius* from Malawi pending compliance with the AC recommendations by Malawi.

6. Mali

Poicephalus robustus

- a) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** Information indicated that *P. robustus* was uncommon in Mali, with only one confirmed sighting on the frontier with Guinea. From 1992 to 1996, there were reported exports of approximately 500 live birds from Mali, of which 495 were traded in 1996. The number of specimens exported was of concern considering the rare occurrence of the species in Mali. The AC recommended that, within 3 months, Mali provide information on:
 - the detailed distribution and abundance of this species in its country; and
 - the justification, or the scientific basis by which it had established that the quantities currently exported will not be detrimental to the survival of the species.
- b) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** No response to the recommendations was received by the Secretariat.
- c) **Comments of the Secretariat:** No evidence has emerged to indicate that a viable resident population of *P. robustus* occurs in Mali, the species would appear to occur only as a vagrant in the country.
- d) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should maintain its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *P. robustus* from Mali pending compliance with the AC recommendations, or until Mali confirms that it will not authorize further exports.

7. Moldova

Lynx lynx

- a) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** See paragraph 3 a).
- b) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** Initially no response to the recommendations was received by the Secretariat. In 2006 Moldova wrote to the Secretariat to point out that records of the species occurring in 'Moldova' probably relate to the historical part of Moldova which is now part of Romania and Ukraine and that there is no record of the species occurring in the territory of the Republic of Moldova. They requested that the Standing Committee's recommendation should be withdrawn.
- c) **Comments of the Secretariat:** The Secretariat is not aware of any evidence that this species occurs in the territory of the Republic of Moldova.
- d) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *L. lynx* from Moldova.

8. Mozambique

Cordylus tropidosternum

- a) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** Information indicated that 3,705 specimens of *C. tropidosternum* were exported from Mozambique from 1991 to 1996, with trade having increased between 1993 and 1996, and exceeded quotas in 1995 and 1996. The species was also under threat from other factors and there was insufficient information available on wild population sizes to determine whether current levels of international trade were adding to these. The AC recommended that, within 3 months, the MA of Mozambique provide information on:
 - the distribution and abundance of this species in its country;

- the justification, or the scientific basis by which it had established that the quantities currently exported would not be detrimental to the survival of the species;
 - the procedures used to correctly identify the species [e.g. the identification key and characteristics used to identify this species from other species of the same genus]; and
 - the justification for permitting exports of this species that regularly exceeded the declared annual export quota.
- b) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** The MA provided the Secretariat with information regarding the distribution and relative abundance of *C. tropidosternum* but did not respond to the other recommendations. The procedures used to distinguish this species from related ones and the basis of the implementation of Article IV for *C. tropidosternum* were not elaborated. No explanation of quota control problems that result in the frequent exceeding of annual export quotas was provided.
- c) **Comments of the Secretariat:** There is no information to indicate whether Mozambique intends to undertake surveys or take other actions to address the outstanding issue of non-detriment findings for this species. The associated AC recommendations therefore remain unanswered.
- d) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should maintain its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *C. tropidosternum* from Mozambique, pending compliance with the AC recommendations by Mozambique.

9. Nicaragua

Dendrobates auratus and *D. pumilio*

- a) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** From 1991 to 1996, there were reported exports of 15,218 specimens of *D. auratus* from Nicaragua, most of which were reported as wild-caught. Captive-bred specimens began appearing in trade in 1994, with this species reported to be easy to breed in captivity. The lack of information available on population sizes made it difficult to assess whether exports from Nicaragua had been detrimental to wild stocks. The AC recommended that, within 3 months, Nicaragua should:
- demonstrate to the Secretariat that specimens exported were truly captive-bred in accordance with Resolution Conf. 10.16 (Rev.);
 - provide the Secretariat with information on the number of breeding operations, their stock and annual production;
 - provide information on an assessment of in-country production capacity for captive-bred specimens; and
 - provide information on the administrative and other procedures by which it controlled exports of captive-bred specimens of this species.
- b) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** Initially, Nicaragua did not respond to these recommendations. The Secretariat receiving an apology that recent staff changes prevented a timely response. The Secretariat also had in-depth discussions with the MA, which made a strong commitment that the production of the species in Nicaragua would be investigated and reformed as necessary to comply with CITES requirements.
- c) **Comments of the Secretariat:** At its 49th meeting (SC49, Geneva, April 2003) the SC decided that its current recommendation to the Parties to suspend imports from Nicaragua of *D. auratus* and *D. pumilio* would be withdrawn as soon as Nicaragua established a cautious annual export quota and committed to regular monitoring of the population in the wild. However the main concern of the AC was about the export of captive-bred specimens, which is not within the scope of the Review of Significant Trade.

- d) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *D. auratus* and *D. pumilio* from Nicaragua and instruct the Secretariat to verify with Nicaragua that any exports of captive-bred specimens comply with the requirements of Resolution Conf. 10.16 (Rev.).

10. Peru

Aratinga erythrogenys

- a) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** Available information indicated that despite remaining locally common, the overall increase in recorded trade in *A. erythrogenys* since the early 1980s could constitute a threat if it continued: minimum net CITES-reported imports from 1983 to 1989 ranged from 2,770 to 16,019. The AC recommended that Peru should:
- within 3 months, establish an annual export quota consistent with the sustainable offtake, and notify the Secretariat of this quota for the information of Parties each year; and
 - within 12 months, advise the Secretariat of the scientific basis of its management programme.
- b) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** Although the Secretariat and the MA corresponded, the information required was not provided. However, the MA expressed its intention to conduct a population survey.
- c) **Comments of the Secretariat:** Since the SC made its initial recommendation not to accept imports of *A. erythrogenys* from Peru, the species has been categorized as 'vulnerable' under Peruvian Supreme Decree 34-2004-AG of 22 September 2004 and capture and export prohibited. Under these new circumstances, it would appear that legal international trade is unlikely to be a threat to the species in Peru in the immediate future.
- d) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *A. erythrogenys* from Peru.

11. Rwanda

Hippopotamus amphibius

- a) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** Information indicated that there were not many *H. amphibius* in Rwanda. The largest known population was from the Akagera River on the border between the United Republic of Tanzania and Rwanda. An estimated 1,900 *H. amphibius* were present in the Akagera National Park in 1987 where numbers appeared to have been stable for the previous 20 years, except in the valley of Akagera where they had been severely reduced by poaching. One *H. amphibius* skull was reported in CITES annual report data as being imported from Rwanda during 1991-96. The AC recommended that, within 3 months, Rwanda should:
- provide the Secretariat with detailed information on management measures in place to monitor wild populations of the species and implement the requirements of Article IV, paragraph 2 of the Convention when authorizing exports.
- b) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** No response to the recommendation was received by the Secretariat.
- c) **Comments of the Secretariat:** Since 1992, recorded trade was limited to a single specimen (one tooth) and therefore the recommendations do not appear to be warranted. There is no evidence of significant trade subsequent to the review, but it should be noted that, as the *H. amphibius* populations are small and declining, any future decision to resume exports would need to be taken with caution.
- d) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *H. amphibius* from

Rwanda, but recommend to Rwanda that if any export permits for this species are issued in future this should only be after a very thorough non-detriment finding has been made.

12. Solomon Islands

a) *Corucia zebrata*

- i) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** Information indicated that populations of *C. zebrata* might be declining owing to harvest for trade and other uses and habitat alteration. From 1992 to 1996 there were reported imports of over 14,500 *C. zebrata* from the Solomon Islands. The AC recommended that within 3 months, the competent authority of the Solomon Islands (which was not a CITES Party in 1999):
 - provide detailed information on the distribution and abundance of this species in its country; and
 - explain the biological and scientific basis for authorizing exports of specimens of the species for each year during the period 1993 to 1996, which were substantially in excess of declared annual quotas.
- ii) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** No response to the recommendations was received by the Secretariat.
- iii) **Comments of the Secretariat:** In view of the demand for this species in international trade, the AC's request for information on the status of the species and on the biological basis for exports, as a basis for determining whether Article IV requirements were being met for exports of this species from the Solomon Islands, would appear to be still relevant.
- iv) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should maintain its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *C. zebrata* from the Solomon Islands pending compliance with the AC recommendations by the Solomon Islands. The Secretariat should be requested to send a reminder to the Solomon Islands, which has recently become a Party to the Convention and ask for current information rather than that relating to the period between 1993 and 1996.

b) *Ornithoptera urvillianus*

- i) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** Available information indicated that, while the overall quantity of *O. urvillianus* exported from the Solomon Islands was low compared to exports from Papua New Guinea, there was concern regarding the level of trade in wild-caught specimens from the Solomon Islands for this species, which ranged from 63 to 499 specimens from 1985 to 1990. The AC recommended that, within 3 months, the competent authority of the Solomon Islands should:
 - provide details of the biological basis for determining that the exports of specimens of the species were not detrimental to the survival of the species.
- ii) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** No response to the initial recommendations was received by the Secretariat. After the SC made its recommendation not to accept imports specimens of the species, the Solomon Islands' authorities proposed a "cautious quota" of 4,000 butterflies, but did not provide the basis for this quota.
- iii) **Comments of the Secretariat:** In view of the demand for this species in international trade, the AC's request for information on the status of the species and the biological basis for exports as a basis for determining whether Article IV requirements were being met for exports of this species from the Solomon Islands, would appear to be still relevant.
- iv) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should maintain its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *O. urvillianus* from the Solomon Islands pending compliance with the AC recommendations by the Solomon

Islands. The Secretariat should be requested to send a reminder to the Solomon Islands, which has recently become a Party to the Convention.

c) *Ornithoptera victoriae*

- i) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** Information available indicated the bulk of the trade in *O. victoriae* was in wild-caught specimens from the Solomon Islands, and that the level of trade from this country was of concern (over 2000 specimens in 1988), especially for the subspecies *O. v. victoriae*. This information, and the known restricted range of the seven subspecies that were recognized, prompted the AC to make recommendations. The AC recommended that, within 3 months, the competent Authority of the Solomon Islands (which was not a CITES Party in 1999) should:
 - provide details of the biological basis for determining that the exports of specimens of the species were not detrimental to the survival of the species.
- ii) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** No response to the initial recommendations was received by the Secretariat. After the SC made its recommendation not to accept imports of specimens of the species, the Solomon Islands' authorities proposed a "cautious quota" of 4,000 butterflies, but did not provide the basis for this quota.
- iii) **Comments of the Secretariat:** See paragraph 12 b) iii).
- iv) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should maintain its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *O. victoriae* from Solomon Islands pending compliance with the AC recommendations by the Solomon Islands. The Secretariat should be requested to send a reminder to the Solomon Islands, which has recently become a Party to the Convention.

13. Suriname

Dendrobates tinctorius

- a) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** Information indicated that virtually all wild specimens of *D. tinctorius* recorded in international trade from 1991 to 1996 originated in Suriname (a total of 5,442). Trade in captive-bred animals developed steadily from 1992 onwards and, by 1996, declared captive-bred frogs accounted for approximately 40 % of all specimens traded. The AC recommended that, within 3 months, Suriname should:
 - provide the CITES Secretariat with detailed information on the distribution and abundance of this species (including its different colour varieties) in Suriname;
 - provide detailed information on the scientific basis by which it had established that the quantities currently exported were not detrimental to the survival of the species; and
 - provide detailed information on the number and location of collecting sites [indicating the colour variety(ies) for each collecting site] and period of the year in which collecting was undertaken.
- b) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** A commitment was made to provide information in response to the recommendations by January 2001, however it had not been received by June 2001. The Secretariat was informed that exports of the rarer blue and black-and-blue colour form had been prohibited from October 2000. Suriname considered it a priority to have the import suspension removed, and that it was necessary to conduct field assessments in order to respond effectively to recommendations resulting from the Review of Significant Trade. Unfortunately, owing to a lack of funding, this process has not moved forward. The Government of Suriname is seeking funds to conduct a review of the trade and to provide the information required by the AC.

- c) **Comments of the Secretariat:** Notwithstanding the SC's recommendation not to accept imports, Suriname has established an annual voluntary export quota of 1,886 specimens in recent years. Given the increase in the proportion of the specimens in trade which are from non-wild origin, the original concerns of the AC appear less pressing.
- d) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *D. tinctorius* from Suriname if the cautious annual voluntary export quota of recent years is maintained.

14. Togo

Poicephalus robustus

- a) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** Information indicated that the status of *P. robustus* was uncertain in Togo, with only one confirmed specimen of the species having been collected there, in the 1800s. From 1992 to 1996, there was reported commercial exports of 390 live birds from Togo, although some of these were actually re-exports from the Democratic Republic of the Congo. The AC recommended that, within 3 months, the MA of Togo in January 2000, which was requested to:
 - provide the CITES Secretariat with detailed information on the distribution and abundance of this species in its country; and
 - provide the CITES Secretariat with detailed information on the justification, or the scientific basis by which it had established that the quantities currently exported were not detrimental to the survival of the species.
- b) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** No response to the recommendations was received by the Secretariat.
- c) **Comments of the Secretariat:** Although the number of specimens reported as exports from Togo from 1992 to 1996 is relatively small, and many were actually re-exports, the occurrence of the species in the country is in doubt.
- d) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should maintain its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *P. robustus* from Togo until the AC recommendations are complied with, or until Togo confirms that it will not authorize further exports.

15. Ukraine

Lynx lynx

- a) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** See paragraph 3 a).
- b) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** No response to the recommendation was received by the Secretariat.
- c) **Comments of the Secretariat:** It is apparent that the original AC recommendation was issued as a blanket recommendation to several of what were at the time newly independent range States for *L. lynx*, without full knowledge of whether trade was taking place from the individual countries. No trade in *L. lynx* skins involving the Ukraine is recorded in the CITES trade database.
- d) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *L. lynx* from the Ukraine.

16. United Republic of Tanzania

a) *Agapornis fischeri*

- i) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** Information indicated that the annual recorded trade during 1983 to 1988 ranged from 53,335 to 108,702 specimens, most of which originated in the United Republic of Tanzania. The species was protected in the United Republic of Tanzania, with capture and export allowed under a quota system. The quota adopted for the species in 1989 was 500 birds per exporter, but there was apparently no limit on the number of exporters. In the United Republic of Tanzania, *A. fischeri* used to be common but underwent a widespread and significant decline. Population estimates were not available but reviewers indicated that visits made to many areas within its former range resulted in few or no sightings. The AC recommended that the United Republic of Tanzania should:
 - within 3 months, establish a moratorium on exports until a population survey had been carried out and the results analyzed; and
 - within 12 months, undertake a population survey of the species.
- ii) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** No response to the recommendations was received by the Secretariat. Information submitted recently by the United Republic of Tanzania (see Annex 3 of the present document) indicates that in some areas studied, populations of this species have recovered and that it has become an agricultural pest with thousands of birds being killed annually to protect crops and the livelihoods of local people. A cautious voluntary annual export quota of 10,000 specimens has been notified to the Secretariat in 2007 and 2008.
- iii) **Comments of the Secretariat:** Populations appear to have recovered at least in some areas, although these are still at lower levels than during the 1980s.
- iv) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *A. fischeri* from the United Republic of Tanzania. The United Republic of Tanzania should be encouraged to be vigilant regarding the application of Article IV, paragraph 3, of the Convention to avoid the unsustainable use which occurred in the past.

b) *Geochelone pardalis* (now *Stigmochelys pardalis*)

- i) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** In 1991, it was considered that the impact of current levels of trade and conservation status were insufficiently known. Information available indicated that during the period 1986-90, the majority of specimens recorded in international trade originated in the United Republic of Tanzania, with annual reported exports ranging from 1,143 to 5,731 specimens. The AC recommended that, within 3 months, the United Republic of Tanzania should:
 - provide details of the legal protection status of this species; and
 - provide details of the biological basis for determining that exports of specimens of the species will not be detrimental to the survival of the species.
- ii) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** No response to the recommendations was received by the Secretariat. Following the SC's recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of this species from the United Republic of Tanzania, the MA wrote to the Secretariat in 1995 advising that exports of wild-taken specimens had been prohibited since 1991, but that farms in the country were producing ranched and captive-bred specimens.
- iii) **Comments of the Secretariat:** At its 40th meeting (SC40, London, March 1998), the SC agreed to the export of ranched and captive-bred specimens on the condition that annual

export quotas were agreed between the Secretariat and the MA. This information was communicated to the Parties in Notification No. 1998/25 of 30 June 1998. Since that time, in agreement with the Secretariat, the United Republic of Tanzania has established annual export quotas for F1 specimens of less than 8 cm in length.

- iv) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *G. pardalis* from the United Republic of Tanzania if the MA confirms to the Secretariat that it will maintain its export moratorium on wild-caught specimens until it has established a process for making non-detriment findings to the satisfaction of the Secretariat and Chairman of the AC.

c) *Gongylophis colubrinus*

- i) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** In 1991, international trade levels were probably not a threat to the survival of the species globally, but although no information on the population status of *G. colubrinus* in any part of its range was available, local problems in particular range States were considered to require clarification or investigation. It was suggested that this species was unlikely to have been significantly affected by habitat loss and many populations may have existed in areas where collection was difficult and impractical. Reported trade rose steeply in 1988 to a peak of 1,282 specimens but fell to half this quantity in 1989 and 1990. The range of this species in the United Republic of Tanzania was reported as being relatively small and it is possible that local populations were traded at higher levels than reported. In 1993, *G. colubrinus* was not protected in the United Republic of Tanzania and there were no export quotas in place for any reptile species. The AC recommended that, within 3 months, the United Republic of Tanzania should:

- provide details of the biological basis for determining that exports of specimens of the species were not detrimental to the survival of the species; and
- provide details of the status of wild populations of this species.

- ii) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** See paragraph 16. b) ii).

- iii) **Comments of the Secretariat:** At SC40, the SC agreed to the export of ranched and captive-bred specimens on the condition that annual export quotas were agreed between the Secretariat and the MA. This information was communicated to the Parties in Notification No. 1998/25 of 30 June 1998. Since that time, in agreement with the Secretariat, the United Republic of Tanzania has established annual export quotas for F1 specimens of less than 25 cm in length.

- iv) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *G. colubrinus* from the United Republic of Tanzania if the MA confirms to the Secretariat that it will maintain its export moratorium on wild-caught specimens until it has established a process for making non-detriment findings to the satisfaction of the Secretariat and Chairman of the AC.

d) *Malacochersus tornieri*

- i) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** Available information indicated that estimation of population size was difficult due to the isolated nature of the populations. However, it was believed that collection had a considerable impact on wild populations in the United Republic of Tanzania. From 1986 to 1988, the number of specimens of *M. tornieri* reported as exported from the United Republic of Tanzania increased substantially, peaking at 2,579 in 1987. Gross reported exports went on to exceed 5,000 specimens in 1991. The species was protected in the United Republic of Tanzania under the Wildlife Conservation (National Game) Order, 1974, but subsequently exports appeared to have been permitted under a quota system. A survey to locate and evaluate the status of selected populations and levels of utilization was proposed for spring 1992 with the aim of developing a management scheme. The AC recommended that the United Republic of Tanzania should:

- within 3 months, introduce a moratorium on trade, pending evaluation of the results of a population survey and establishment of a sustainable-use management programme.
 - within 12 months, initiate a population survey of the species; and develop a sustainable-use management programme.
- ii) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** See paragraph 16. b) ii).
- iii) **Comments of the Secretariat:** At SC40, the SC agreed to the export of ranched and captive-bred specimens on the condition that annual export quotas were agreed between the Secretariat and the MA. This information was communicated to the Parties in Notification No. 1998/25 of 30 June 1998. Since that time, in agreement with the Secretariat, the United Republic of Tanzania has established annual export quotas for F1 specimens of less than 8 cm in length.
- iv) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *M. tornieri* from the United Republic of Tanzania if the MA confirms to the Secretariat that it will maintain its export moratorium on wild-caught specimens until it has established a process for making non-detriment findings to the satisfaction of the Secretariat and Chairman of the AC.
- e) *Poicephalus cryptoxanthus*
- i) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** In 1991, it was considered that international trade levels were probably not a threat to the survival of the species on a global basis, but that there were local problems in particular range States that required clarification or investigation. Available information indicated that the United Republic of Tanzania was the major and only consistent exporting country of *P. cryptoxanthus* during 1985 to 1990. Reported exports increased from 245 specimens in 1985 to 1,936 in 1990. A total population of *P. cryptoxanthus* estimate was given as greater than 100,000 birds, based on anecdotal field information, with the population regarded as stable. It was not known whether levels of trade were affecting the target populations to any great extent. The AC noted that clarification was required of the status of *P. cryptoxanthus* in the United Republic of Tanzania and of the management programme in place to ensure compliance with Article IV of the Convention. The AC recommended that:
- within 3 months, the United Republic of Tanzania should provide details of the biological basis for determining that exports of specimens of the species were not detrimental to the survival of the species.
- ii) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** No response to the recommendations was received by the Secretariat.
- iii) **Comments of the Secretariat:** The Secretariat understands that, since the recommendation of the SC was made, the United Republic of Tanzania has established a moratorium on the export of specimens of this species, although local traders are still interested in exporting the species.
- iv) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *P. cryptoxanthus* from the United Republic of Tanzania if the MA confirms that if it lifts its export moratorium a cautious export quota will be established in consultation with the Secretariat and the Chairman of the AC.
- f) *Poicephalus meyeri*
- i) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** In 1991, it was considered that international trade levels were probably not a threat to the survival of the species on a global basis, but that there were local problems in particular range States that required clarification or investigation. Available information indicated that *P. meyeri* was common throughout its

range and trade appeared to be the only possible threat to the species. A total population estimate was given as greater than 100,000 birds, based on anecdotal field information, with the population regarded as stable. Reported trade levels fluctuated during 1985-90 with an annual average of 7,070 birds exported, most of which were exports from the United Republic of Tanzania and believed to be wild-caught. Exports for some years were significantly in excess of the harvest and export quotas. The AC noted that, at that time, it was unknown whether the target populations were affected by the trade to any great extent. The AC recommended that:

- within 3 months the United Republic of Tanzania should provide details of the biological basis for determining that exports of specimens of the species were not detrimental to the survival of the species.
- ii) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** No response to the recommendations was received by the Secretariat.
- iii) **Comments of the Secretariat:** See paragraph 16 e) iii).
- iv) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *P. meyeri* from the United Republic of Tanzania if the MA confirms that if it lifts its export moratorium a cautious export quota will be established in consultation with the Secretariat and the Chairman of the AC.
- g) *Poicephalus rufiventris*
- i) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** In 1991, it was considered that international trade levels were probably not a threat to the survival of the species on a global basis, but that there were local problems in particular range States that required clarification or investigation. Available information indicated that annual export levels fluctuated during 1985 to 1990 and averaged at 2,461. The majority of exports were from the United Republic of Tanzania and all specimens were believed to be wild-caught. An export quota system was believed to be in place but there was no clear indication of its biological basis as a fixed number of specimens were allocated for each exporter rather than a total quantity agreed annually for the species. A total population estimate was given as greater than 50,000 birds, based on anecdotal field information, with the population regarded as stable. It was not known whether levels of trade were affecting the target populations to any great extent. The AC recommended that:
- within 3 months, the United Republic of Tanzania should provide details of the biological basis for determining that exports of specimens of the species were not detrimental to the survival of the species.
- ii) **Summary of Management Authority's response:** No response to the recommendations was received by the Secretariat.
- iii) **Comments of the Secretariat:** See paragraph 16 e) iii).
- iv) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *P. rufiventris* from the United Republic of Tanzania if the MA confirms that if it lifts its export moratorium a cautious export quota will be established in consultation with the Secretariat and the Chairman of the AC.
- h) *Tauraco fischeri*
- i) **Original concerns and recommendations of the AC:** In 1991, it was considered that international trade levels were probably not a threat to the survival of the species on a global basis, but that there were local problems in particular range States that required clarification or investigation. Information indicated that the quota system in place in the United Republic

of Tanzania – believed to be the country of origin of most specimens in the trade – but there was no clear indication of its biological basis as a fixed number of specimens were allocated for each exporter rather than a total quantity agreed annually for the species. The setting of quotas in this manner was highlighted as a concern. Reported trade in birds known to be *T. fischeri* was very low, with only 15 recorded in international trade between 1985 and 1990. The AC recommended that:

- within 3 months, the United Republic of Tanzania should provide details of the biological basis for determining that exports of specimens of the species were not detrimental to the survival of the species.
- ii) **Summary of Management Authority’s response:** No response to the recommendations was received by the Secretariat.
- iii) **Comments of the Secretariat:** See paragraph 16 e) iii).
- iv) **Recommendations of the Secretariat and AC Chairman:** The SC should withdraw its recommendation to Parties not to accept imports of specimens of *T. fischeri* from the United Republic of Tanzania if the MA confirms that if it lifts its export moratorium a cautious export quota will be established in consultation with the Secretariat and the Chairman of the AC.