CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Fifty-fourth meeting of the Standing Committee Geneva (Switzerland), 2-6 October 2006

Interpretation and implementation of the Convention

General compliance issues

GUIDELINES FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE CONVENTION

- 1. This document has been prepared by the Chairman of the Standing Committee's Working Group on Compliance.
- 2. The Working Group held a number of meetings on the margins of the 53rd meeting of the Standing Committee (SC53, Geneva, June July 2005) and the progress made during those discussions is described in the summary record of SC53.
- 3. After SC53, the Chairman circulated a revised version of the draft Guidelines on compliance with the Convention which reflected the text that had been agreed at that time as well as the text on which no agreement had yet been reached. He also provided some comments and suggestions between double slash marks.
- 4. The Chairman advised the Committee at SC53 that he hoped additional negotiations on the text could be completed through electronic mail. He therefore initiated such discussions and several Parties responded by submitting comments and proposing changes to the text, which was accessible on an internet forum hosted by the Government of Australia. For easy reference, the proposed changes are compiled into a single document (see Annex), together with the draft version of the guidelines that was circulated by the Chairman after SC53.
- 5. Some useful background information on compliance with the Convention was recently brought to the Chairman's attention by the Secretariat. At an earlier stage of the Committee's discussions on compliance guidelines, the Secretariat contracted Mr Veit Koester (former head of the CITES Management Authority of Denmark) to prepare an analysis of the desirability and feasibility of establishing a special compliance committee in CITES. His written report has been made available as SC54 Inf. 3. In addition, Mr Peter H. Sand (former Secretary-General of CITES) has published an article on 'Sanctions in the Case of Non-Compliance and State Responsibility: pacta sunt servanda Or Else?' which focuses primarily on CITES. It is contained in a book entitled Ensuring Compliance with Multilateral Environmental Agreements: Academic Analysis and Views from Practice, pp. 259-271, Brill Academic Publishers (www.brill.nl), 2006.
- 6. The Chairman recommends that the Working Group meet again at the beginning of SC54 and report in the course of the meeting. He may ask the Working Group to consider forming a small drafting group that could meet in parallel with SC54 sessions and then provide the results of its work to meetings of the full Working Group that occur on the margins of SC54. This could help the Working Group to complete the final draft guidelines before the end of the present meeting.
- 7. On the basis of the report of the Working Group, the Standing Committee can decide how it wants to proceed with this issue.

CITES Compliance guidelines, juxtaposed texts per 2 August 2006-08-03

<u>Underscored text</u>: additions

....: deletions //between double slashes//: comments

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
I Legal basis, objectives, scope	I Objectives and scope	I Objectives, scope	I Objectives, scope
1. The objective of these guidelines is to promote, facilitate and achieve compliance with the Convention and, in particular, to assist Parties in meeting their obligations regarding such compliance.	1. The objective of these guidelines is to promote, facilitate and achieve compliance with the Convention and, in particular, to assist Parties in meeting their obligations regarding such compliance.	1. The objective of these guidelines is to inform Parties and others of CITES practice concerning promoting, facilitating and achieving compliance with the Convention and, in particular, assisting Parties in meeting their obligations regarding	1. The objective of these guidelines is to promote, facilitate and achieve compliance with the Convention and, in particular, to assist Parties in meeting their obligations regarding such compliance. Specifically, the
Specifically, the guidelines describe and clarify current practice in order to facilitate the handling of matters of compliance within the Convention, both in individual cases and in matters of general interest.	Specifically, the guidelines describe and clarify current practice in order to facilitate the handling of compliance matters relating to the Convention, both in Party-specific matters and in matters of general interest.	such compliance. Specifically, the guidelines describe and clarify current practice in order to facilitate the handling of matters of compliance within the Convention, both in individual cases and in matters of general interest.	guidelines describe and clarify current practice in order to facilitate the handling of matters of compliance within the Convention, both in individual cases and in matters of general interest.
2. These guidelines apply to issues of compliance relating to the obligations under the Convention, taking into account relevant resolutions. Particular attention should be paid to the following: a. Designation of Management Authority(ies) and Scientific Authority(ies) (Art. IX), b. Permitting trade in CITES-listed specimens only to the extent	2. These guidelines apply to compliance matters relating to the Convention, taking into account relevant resolutions. Particular attention should be paid to the following: a. designating Management Authority(ies) and Scientific Authority(ies) (Article IX), b. permitting trade in CITES-listed specimens only to the extent	2. These guidelines address issues of compliance relating to the obligations under the Convention, taking into account relevant resolutions as they relate to treaty obligations. Particular attention should be paid to the following: a. Designation of Management Authority(ies) and Scientific Authority(ies) (Art. IX), b. Permitting trade in CITES-	2. These guidelines apply to issues of compliance relating to the obligations under the Convention, taking into account relevant resolutions. Particular attention should be paid to the following: a. Designation of Management Authority(ies) and Scientific Authority(ies) (Art. IX), b. Permitting trade in CITES-listed specimens only to the extent

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
consistent with the procedures laid	consistent with the procedures laid	listed specimens only to the extent	consistent with the procedures laid
down in the Convention (art. III, IV,	down in the Convention (Articles III,	consistent with the procedures laid	down in the Convention (art. III, IV,
V, VI, VII and XV),	IV, V, VI, VII and XV),	down in the Convention (art. III, IV,	V, VI, VII and XV),
c. Taking appropriate domestic	c. taking appropriate domestic	V, VI, VII and XV),	c. Taking appropriate domestic
measures to enforce the provisions	measures to enforce the provisions	c. Taking appropriate domestic	measures to enforce the provisions
of the Convention and prohibit trade	of the Convention and prohibit trade	measures to enforce the provisions	of the Convention and prohibit trade
in violation thereof (Art. VIII para. 1),	in violation thereof (Article VIII	of the Convention and prohibit trade	in violation thereof (Art. VIII para. 1),
d. Maintenance of records of	paragraph. 1),	in violation thereof (Art. VIII para. 1),	d. Maintenance of records of trade
trade and submission of periodic	d. maintaining records of trade	d. Maintenance of records of	and submission of periodic reports
reports (Art. VIII, paras 7 and 8),	and submitting periodic reports	trade and submission of periodic	(Art. VIII, paras 7 and 8),
e. Responding to	(Article. VIII, paragraphs 7 and 8),	reports (Art. VIII, paras 7 and 8),	e. Responding to communications
communications of the Secretariat or	e. responding to communications	e. Responding to	of the Secretariat related to
the Standing Committee related to	of the Secretariat or the Standing	communications of the Secretariat	information that a species included
information that a species included	Committee related to information	as soon as possible related to	in Appendix I or II is being adversely
in Appendix I or II is being adversely	that a species included in Appendix I	information that a species included	affected by trade in specimens of
affected by trade in specimens of	or II is being adversely affected by	in Appendix I or II is being adversely	that species or that the provisions of
that species or that the provisions of	trade in specimens of that species or	affected by trade in specimens of	the Convention are not being
the Convention are not being	that the provisions of the	that species or that the provisions of	effectively implemented (Article XIII).
effectively implemented (Article XIII).	Convention are not being effectively	the Convention are not being	
	implemented (Article XIII).	effectively implemented (Article XIII).	
3. These guidelines are without	3. These guidelines are without	3. These guidelines are without	3. These guidelines are without
prejudice to any dispute settlement	prejudice to any dispute settlement	prejudice to any dispute settlement	prejudice to any dispute settlement
procedure under the Convention.	procedure under the Convention.	procedure under the Convention.	procedure under the Convention.
II General Principles	II General Principles	II General Principles	II General Principles
A positive, supportive and	A positive, supportive and	A positive, supportive and	A positive, supportive and non-
non-adversarial approach is taken	non-adversarial approach should be	non-adversarial approach is taken	adversarial approach is taken
towards issues of non-compliance,	taken towards issues of non-	towards issues of non-compliance,	towards issues of non-compliance,
with the aim of ensuring long-term	compliance, with the aim of ensuring	with the aim of ensuring long-term	with the aim of ensuring long-term
compliance.	long-term compliance.	compliance.	compliance.
·		·	·
2. These guidelines and ensuing	2. These guidelines and ensuing	2. Compliance matters are	2. Within CITES, compliance issues
compliance measures are applied in	compliance measures should be	reviewed and ensuing compliance	are applied in a fair, consistent and
a fair, consistent and transparent	applied in a fair, consistent and	measures are applied in a fair,	transparent manner, while taking
manner, while paying particular	transparent manner, while paying	consistent and transparent manner.	into account the special needs of
attention to the special needs of	particular attention to the special	In developing compliance	developing country Parties, in
developing country Parties, in	needs of developing country Parties,	measures particular attention is paid	particular, least developed and small

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
particular the least developed and the small island developing States among them.	in particular the least developed and the small island developing States among them.	to the circumstances of developing country Parties.	island developing States.
3. As a general rule, findings and communications in compliance matters are not treated confidentially. Exceptions to this rule are possible, inter alia for the following reasons: a. to protect information provided by an affected Party and which that Party has requested, with supporting reasons, be kept confidential. b. to avoid threats to the safety of individuals, c. to protect confidential business information, d. to avoid the disclosure of information that could jeopardize the survival of populations of species included in the Appendices of the Convention, or e. to avoid compromising a judicial investigation.	3. As a general rule, findings and communications in compliance matters are not treated confidentially. However, the Standing Committee may decide to treat such findings and communications as confidential for, inter alia, the following reasons: a. to protect information provided by an affected Party and which that Party has requested, with supporting reasons, be kept confidential. b. to avoid threats to the safety of individuals, c. to protect confidential business information, d. to avoid the disclosure of information that could jeopardize the survival of populations of species included in the Appendices of the Convention, or e. to avoid compromising a judicial investigation. Where the Standing Committee decides to treat findings and communications as confidential, it shall provide reasons.	3. As a general rule, findings and communications in compliance matters are not treated confidentially. Exceptions to this rule are possible, inter alia for the following reasons: a. to protect information provided by an affected Party and which that Party has requested, with supporting reasons, be kept confidential. b. to avoid threats to the safety of individuals, c. to protect confidential business information, d. to avoid the disclosure of information that could jeopardize the survival of populations of species included in the Appendices of the Convention, or e. to avoid compromising a judicial investigation.	3. Non-compliance issues are actioned as quickly as possible.
4. Decision on whether to close or keep open debates in individual compliance matters is taken according to the Rules of Procedure of the body seized with the matter.	4. Decisions on whether to close debates in Party specific compliance matters are taken according to the Rules of Procedure of the body seized with the matter and are	4. Decision on whether to close or keep open debates in individual compliance matters is taken according to the Rules of Procedure of the body seized with the matter.	4. A decision on whether to close or keep open debates, or to release communications (correspondence, documents), in individual compliance matters is taken according to the

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
	<u>reasoned</u> .		Rules of Procedure of the body considering the matter.
5. In their communications with an affected Party the Standing Committee and the Secretariat should make sure that the information provided and the requests for information made to the Party are effectively received by the competent authorities of the Party.	5. In their communications with an affected Party the Standing Committee and the Secretariat makes sure that the information provided and the requests for information made to the Party are effectively received by the competent authorities of the Party.	5. In their communications with an affected Party the Standing Committee and the Secretariat take steps to make sure that the information provided and the requests for information made to the Party are effectively received by the competent authorities of the Party.	5. In the interests of transparency, as a general rule, findings in compliance matters are not treated confidentially.
III The various bodies and their compliance-related tasks	III The various bodies and their compliance-related tasks	III The various bodies and their compliance-related tasks	III The various bodies and their compliance-related tasks
•	,	Compliance matters are taken up by various CITES bodies. Some of these functions include:	•
1. As the supreme body of the Convention, the Conference of the Parties: a. provides general policy guidance on compliance issues, b. directs and oversees the handling of compliance matters particularly through the identification of key obligations and procedures, and c. reviews as needed decisions of the Standing Committee related to specific issues of non-compliance adopted pursuant to paragraph 38.	1. As the supreme body of the Convention, the Conference of the Parties: a. provides general policy guidance on compliance matters, b. directs and oversees the handling of compliance matters particularly through the identification of key obligations and procedures, and c. reviews as needed decisions of the Standing Committee related to Party- specific compliance matters adopted pursuant to paragraph xx.	1. As the supreme body of the Convention, the Conference of the Parties: a. provides general policy guidance on compliance issues, b. directs and oversees the handling of compliance matters particularly through the identification of key obligations and procedures, and c. reviews as needed decisions of the Standing Committee related to specific issues of non-compliance adopted pursuant to paragraph 38.	 As the supreme body of the Convention, the Conference of the Parties: provides general policy guidance on compliance issues, directs and oversees the handling of compliance matters particularly through the identification of key obligations and procedures, and reviews, as needed, decisions of the Standing Committee related to specific issues of non-compliance.
The Conference of the Parties may decide to carry out itself the tasks normally entrusted to the Standing Committee as described in Sections IV and V below. //Para. added after	1bis When the Conference of the Parties decides to carry out itself the tasks entrusted to the Standing Committee as described in Sections IV and V, these guidelines apply	The Conference of the Parties may decide to carry out itself the tasks normally entrusted to the Standing Committee as described in Sections IV and V below.	

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
WG meeting.//	mutatis mutandis.		
2. As the executive body of the Convention, the Standing Committee, acting in accordance with instructions from and authority delegated by the Conference of the Parties, examines general and specific compliance matters, including: a. monitoring and assessing overall compliance, b. advising and assisting Parties in complying with the Convention; c. verifying information and making determinations regarding compliance issues; and d. making decisions and recommendations regarding compliance measures.	2. As the executive body of the Convention, the Standing Committee, acting in accordance with instructions from and authority delegated by the Conference of the Parties, examines general and Party-specific compliance matters, including: a. monitoring and assessing overall compliance with the Convention, b. advising and assisting Parties in complying with the Convention; c. verifying information and making determinations regarding compliance matters; and d. making decisions and recommendations regarding compliance measures.	2. As the executive body of the Convention, the Standing Committee, acting in accordance with instructions from and authority delegated by the Conference of the Parties, examines general and specific compliance matters, including: a. monitoring and assessing overall compliance, b. advising and assisting Parties in complying with the Convention; c. verifying information: and d. making recommendations regarding compliance measures.	2. As the executive body of the Convention, the Standing Committee, acting in accordance with instructions from and authority delegated by the Conference of the Parties, examines general and specific compliance matters, including: a. monitoring and assessing overall compliance, b. advising and assisting Parties in complying with the Convention; c. verifying information; and d. making decisions and recommendations regarding compliance measures.
 As technical advisory bodies of the Convention, the Animals and Plants Committees advise and assist the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties with regard to compliance matters, inter alia by undertaking necessary reviews, consultations, assessments and reporting. The Secretariat assists and supports the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties in carrying out their functions 	 As technical advisory bodies of the Convention, the Animals and Plants Committees advise and assist the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties with regard to compliance matters, inter alia, by undertaking necessary reviews, consultations, assessments and reporting. The Secretariat assists and supports the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties in carrying out their functions 	 As technical advisory bodies of the Convention, the Animals and Plants Committees advise and assist the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties with regard to compliance matters, inter alia by undertaking necessary reviews, consultations, assessments and reporting. The Secretariat assists and supports the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties in carrying out their functions 	 As technical advisory bodies of the Convention, the Animals and Plants Committees advise and assist the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties with regard to compliance matters, including by undertaking necessary reviews, consultations, assessments and reporting. The Secretariat assists and supports the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties in carrying out their functions
concerning compliance matters according to the procedures set out in these guidelines.	concerning compliance matters according to the procedures set out in these guidelines	concerning compliance matters according to <u>established</u> procedures.	concerning compliance matters according to the procedures set out in these guidelines.

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
IV General monitoring and facilitation of compliance	IV General monitoring and facilitation of compliance	IV General monitoring and facilitation of compliance	IV General monitoring and facilitation of compliance
1. The Secretariat is responsible for day-to-day monitoring of compliance. It receives, assesses and communicates to the Parties information on compliance matters. It advises and assists Parties in complying with the Convention, draws their attention to possible issues of non-compliance, makes recommendations for restoring compliance and tracks the implementation of compliance-related decisions of the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties.	1. The Secretariat is responsible for day-to-day monitoring of compliance with the Convention. It: (a) receives, assesses and communicates to the Parties information on compliance matters, (b) advises and assists Parties in complying with the Convention, (c) draws their attention to possible compliance matters, (d) makes recommendations for restoring compliance, and (e) tracks the implementation of compliance-related decisions of the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties.	1. The Secretariat plays a key role in the day-to-day monitoring of compliance. It receives, assesses and communicates to the Parties information on compliance matters. It advises and assists Parties in complying with the Convention, draws their attention to possible issues of non-compliance, makes recommendations for restoring compliance and tracks the implementation of compliance-related recommendations of the Standing Committee and decisions and resolutions of the Conference of the Parties.	1. The Secretariat is responsible for day-to-day monitoring of compliance. It receives, assesses and communicates to the Parties information on compliance matters. It advises and assists Parties in complying with the Convention, draws their attention to possible issues of non-compliance, makes recommendations for restoring compliance and tracks the implementation of compliance-related decisions of the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties.
2. Annual and biennial reports, legislative texts as well as other special reports and responses to information requests provide the primary, but not exclusive, means of monitoring compliance with the Convention. To that end, the Secretariat advises Parties at least 60 days in advance of deadlines applicable to reporting and other obligations under the Convention.	2. Annual and biennial reports, legislative texts as well as other special reports and responses to information requests, for example within significant trade reviews and national legislation projects, provide the primary means of monitoring compliance with the Convention. To that end, the Secretariat advises Parties at least 60 days in advance of deadlines applicable to reporting and other obligations under the Convention.	2. Annual and biennial reports, legislative texts as well as other special reports and responses to information requests provide the primary, but not exclusive, means of monitoring compliance with the Convention. To that end, the Secretariat advises Parties at least 60 days in advance of deadlines applicable to reporting and other obligations under the Convention.	2. Annual and biennial reports, legislative texts as well as other special reports and responses to information requests provide the primary, but not exclusive, means of monitoring compliance with the Convention. To that end, the Secretariat advises Parties at least 60 days in advance of deadlines applicable to reporting and other obligations under the Convention.
3. The Secretariat reports on a regular basis to the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties on its activities	3. The Secretariat reports on a regular basis to the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties on its activities undertaken	3. The Secretariat reports on a regular basis to the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties on its activities	3. The Secretariat reports on a regular basis to the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties on its activities

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
undertaken under these guidelines.	under these guidelines.		undertaken under these guidelines.
V Party-specific compliance issues	V Party-specific compliance matters	V Party-specific compliance issues	V Party-specific compliance issues
A. Detection [identification] of potential compliance issues	A. Identification of potential compliance matters	A. Identification of potential compliance issues	A. Identification of potential compliance issues
The Secretariat provides individual Parties concerned with information it receives which indicates that they may have compliance problems, and communicates with these individual Parties to determine whether compliance problems exist. Compliance problems are often identified within significant trade reviews, national legislation projects and national reporting programmes.	The Secretariat provides individual Parties concerned with information it receives which indicates that they may have compliance problems, and communicates with these individual Parties to determine whether compliance problems exist. Compliance problems are often identified within significant trade reviews, national legislation projects and national reporting programmes	1. In implementing Article XIII, the Secretariat provides the management authority of individual Parties concerned with information it receives which indicates that they may have compliance problems, and communicates with these individual Parties to determine whether compliance problems exist. Compliance problems are often identified within significant trade reviews, national legislation projects and national reporting programmes.	1. The Secretariat provides individual Parties concerned with information it receives which indicates that they may have compliance problems, and communicates with these individual Parties to determine whether compliance problems exist. Compliance problems are often identified within significant trade reviews, national legislation projects and national reporting programmes.
2. In response, the Party will, as soon as possible, inform the Secretariat of any relevant facts in so far as its laws permit and, where appropriate, propose remedial action. Where the Party considers that an inquiry is desirable, such inquiry may be carried out by one or more persons expressly authorized by the Party.	2. In response, the Party will, as soon as possible, inform the Secretariat of any relevant facts in so far as its laws permit and, where appropriate, propose remedial action. Where the Party considers that an inquiry is desirable, such inquiry may be carried out by one or more persons expressly authorized by the Party.	2. In response, the Party, as soon as possible, informs the Secretariat of any relevant facts in so far as its laws permit and, where appropriate, propose remedial action. Where the Party considers that an inquiry is desirable, such inquiry can be carried out by one or more persons expressly authorized by the Party.	2. In response, the Party will, as soon as possible, inform the Secretariat of any relevant facts in so far as its laws permit and, where appropriate, propose remedial action. Where the Party considers that an inquiry is desirable, such inquiry may be carried out by one or more persons expressly authorized by the Party.
3. Any Party concerned over trade in Appendix-II or –III species conducted by another Party may bring the matter up directly with that Party. If this fails to produce results,	3. Any Party concerned over trade in Appendix-II or –III species conducted by another Party may bring the matter up directly with that Party. If this fails to produce results,	3. Any Party concerned over trade in Appendix-II or –III species conducted by another Party can bring the matter up directly with that Party. If this fails to produce results,	3. Any Party concerned over trade in Appendix-II or —III species conducted by another Party may bring the matter up directly with that Party. If this fails to produce results,

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
it may call upon the Secretariat for assistance.	it may call upon the Secretariat for assistance.	it can call upon the Secretariat for assistance.	it may call upon the Secretariat for assistance.
4. Parties themselves may give the Secretariat early warning of any compliance problems, including the inability to provide information by a certain deadline, and indicate the reasons for these problems and if any assistance is required.	4. Parties themselves may give the Secretariat early warning of any compliance problems, including the inability to provide information by a certain deadline, and indicate the reasons for these problems and if any assistance is required.	4. Parties themselves <u>are always</u> <u>urged to give</u> the Secretariat early warning of any compliance problems, including the inability to provide information by a certain deadline, and indicate the reasons for these problems and if any assistance is required.	4. Parties themselves may give the Secretariat early warning of any compliance problems, including the inability to provide information by a certain deadline, and indicate the reasons for these problems and if any assistance is required.
5. Where compliance problems are identified, the Parties in question are given every opportunity to correct them within reasonable time limits, if necessary with the assistance of the Secretariat. The time limits, whether set by the Standing Committee or by the Secretariat, are defined according to the nature of the problem and the Party's capacity to take corrective action.	5. Where compliance problems are identified, the Parties in question are given every opportunity to correct them within reasonable time limits, if necessary with the assistance of the Secretariat. The time limits set by the Secretariat, are defined according to the nature of the problem and the Party's capacity to take corrective action	5. Where compliance problems are identified, the Parties in question have the opportunity to correct them within reasonable time limits, if necessary with the assistance of the Secretariat. (see Resolution 11.3)	
B. [Non-compliance submissions] //Chair's suggestion//	B. Non-compliance submissions procedure	B. [Non-compliance submissions]	C: Consideration of non-compliance issues
1. If the Party fails to take sufficient corrective action, the matter is brought to the attention of the Standing Committee, in the form of a "non-compliance submission", by the Party itself; a. [One or more other Parties]; b. [the Secretariat in direct contact with the Party concerned],; c. [The Conference of the Parties]; or	Notwithstanding paragraph 1bis below, if the Party fails to take sufficient corrective action within the time limits set by the Secretariat, the matter is brought to the attention of the Standing Committee, in the form of a "noncompliance submission", by the Secretariat. 1 bis A matter of compliance, in the	 If the Party fails to take sufficient corrective action, the matter is brought to the attention of the Standing Committee, typically by: a. the Party itself; b. [One or more other Parties]; c. [the Secretariat preferably in direct contact with the Party concerned],; 	1. Where the Secretariat has identified or has been informed of a non-compliance issue, the Secretariat assesses the underlying information to determine its reliability and relevance, compiles supplementary information, both corroborating and contradicting, and consults with the affected Party.

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
d. [The Standing Committee]. [section on non-Parties] //Chair awaits suggestions on this point, which is unclear to him.//	form of a "non-compliance submission", may also be brought to the attention of the Standing Committee by: a. the Party itself; b. One or more other Parties; c. The Conference of the Parties; or d. The Standing Committee. 1 ter Non-Compliance submissions may also concern trade between Parties and non-Parties.	d. [The Conference of the Parties]; or e. [The Standing Committee].	
2. Reports to the Standing Committee are generally made in writing and include details as to which specific obligations are concerned and an assessment of the reasons why the affected Party may be unable to meet those obligations. Given the immediacy/urgency of some compliance issues, verbal/oral reporting may be appropriate. Corroborating [or contradicting/additional or supplemental] information, or indication of where such information may be found, should be provided. The non-compliance submission may include proposals for remedial action. [link to para 29]	2. <u>Submissions</u> to the Standing Committee are generally made in writing and include details as to which specific obligations are concerned and an assessment of the reasons why the affected Party may be unable to meet those obligations. Given the immediacy/urgency of some compliance matters, verbal/oral reporting may be appropriate in some specific cases but oral reports should not become the rule. Corroborating [or contradicting/additional or supplemental] information, or indication of where such information may be found, should be provided. The non-compliance submission may include proposals for remedial action.	2. Reports to the Standing Committee are generally made in writing and include details as to which specific obligations are concerned and an assessment of the reasons why the affected Party may be unable to meet those obligations. Given the immediacy/urgency of some compliance issues, verbal/oral reporting https://example.com/has/been/ appropriate	

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
3. [(29), The Secretariat assesses the underlying information to determine its reliability and relevance, compiles supplementary information, both corroborating and contradicting, and consults with the affected Party, and reports to the Standing Committee Whoever reports a compliance problem to the SC copies that report simultaneously to the concerned Party.	3. [(29), The Secretariat assesses the information underlying the submission to determine its reliability and relevance, compiles supplementary information, both corroborating and contradicting, and consults with the affected Party, and reports to the Standing Committee within [x] days.] 3 bis Except for submissions made in accordance with B1bis(a), the Secretariat shall forthwith send the submission to the Party concerned.	3. [(29), The Secretariat assesses the underlying information to determine its reliability and relevance, compiles supplementary information, both corroborating and contradicting, and consults with the affected Party, and reports to the Standing Committee Whoever reports a compliance problem to the SC copies that report simultaneously to the concerned Party.	3. The Secretariat reports to the Standing Committee when it is of the opinion that the affected Party is not satisfactorily engaging on the compliance issue or achieving progress towards compliance. Reports to the Standing Committee are simultaneously forwarded to the affected Party by the Secretariat.
4. [(30) The Standing Committee [] should ensure the expedited handling of a non-compliance submission.]	4. [(30) The Standing Committee [] should ensure the expedited handling of a non-compliance submission.]	4. [(30) The Standing Committee [] ensures the expedited handling of a non-compliance submission.]	4. When considering a non-compliance issue, the Secretariat, or the Standing Committee, consider the nature, (underlying) cause(s), degree and frequency of non-compliance and whether the affected Party has taken or planned any steps to achieve compliance before making a decision that issues of non-compliance exist.
 5. (28) The Standing Committee can/should/will/may reject noncompliance submissions which it considers are: de minimis [trivial], or manifestly ill-founded. Where the Standing Committee has decided that the submission is not trivial or manifestly ill-founded, the Party concerned shall be given the right to provide comments within [a 	 5. (28) The Standing Committee should/will reject non-compliance submissions which it considers are: de minimis [trivial], or manifestly ill-founded. Where the Standing Committee has decided that the submission is not trivial or manifestly ill-founded, the Party concerned shall be given the right to provide comments within a reasonable time as set out by the 	 5. (28) The Standing Committee is able to reject matters which it considers are: de minimis [trivial], or ill-founded. Where the Standing Committee determines that the submission is not trivial or ill-founded, the Party concerned is given the right to provide comments within [a reasonable time as set out by the 	5. The Secretariat, or the Standing Committee, may gather or request further information on a non- compliance issue whenever such information may be needed and, if it is unavailable, may seek an invitation from the Party concerned to undertake the gathering and verification of information in the territory of that Party or wherever such information may be found. This may be carried out by the Secretariat

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
reasonable time as set out by the Committee]	Committee.	Committee]	or by the regional representatives.
[Information gathering and fact-finding]		[Information gathering and fact- finding]	
6. (31) The Standing Committee [] considers the submission as well as other information and observations with a view to establishing relevant facts and finding a solution [and securing an amicable solution of the matter].	6. (31) The Standing Committee considers the submission as well as any relevant information and observations with a view to establishing relevant facts and finding a solution.	6. (31) The Standing Committee considers the submission as well as other information and observations with a view to establishing relevant facts and finding a solution [and securing an amicable solution of the matter].	
7. (33) []The Standing Committee []may gather or request further information on a non-compliance submission whenever such information may be found and may seek an invitation from the Party concerned to undertake the gathering and verification of information in the territory of that Party or wherever such information may be found. This may be carried out by the Secretariat or by the regional representatives.	7. (33) The Standing Committee may gather or request further information on a non-compliance submission whenever such information may be found and may seek an invitation from the Party concerned to undertake the gathering and verification of information in the territory of that Party or wherever such information may be found. This may be carried out by the Secretariat or by the regional representatives.	7. (33) []The Standing Committee decides whether to gather or request further information and whether to seek an invitation from the Party concerned to undertake (either by itself or with the cooperation of its regional representative) the gathering and verification of information in the territory of that Party or wherever such information may be found	
8. When considering a non-compliance submission, the Standing Committee also considers the nature, (underlying) cause(s), degree and frequency of non-compliance and whether the affected Party has taken or planned any steps to restore compliance before making a determination that issues of non-compliance exist.	8. //Deletion proposed as these factors should not be addressed in the context of the determination of a compliance matter, but only in the context of the adoption of measures//	8. When considering a non-compliance submission, the Standing Committee also considers the nature, (underlying) cause(s), degree and frequency of non-compliance and whether the affected Party has taken or planned any steps to restore compliance before making a determination that issues of non-compliance exist.	

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
C. Right of consultation and	C. Right of consultation and	C. Right of consultation and	B. Opportunity for consultation and
participation	participation	participation	participation
1. A Party has the right to be consulted formally on any non-compliance submission and to participate in discussions of the Standing Committee [and the Conference of the Parties] with respect to its own compliance. It [is not entitled to][may not] [does not], however, take part in the preparation and adoption of any decisions, measures or recommendations of the Standing Committee [or the Conference of the Parties].	1. A Party has the right to be consulted formally on any non-compliance submission and to participate in discussions of the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties with respect to its own compliance. It [is not entitled to][may not] [does not] however, take part in the preparation and adoption of any decisions, measures or recommendations of the Standing Committee or the Conference of the Parties.	1. A Party is consulted formally on any non-compliance submission and is able to participate in discussions of the Standing Committee [and the Conference of the Parties] with respect to its own compliance	1. The affected Party will have the opportunity to participate in discussions with respect to its own compliance. Participation by the affected Party assists in developing a workable solution to achieve compliance while seeking to accommodate as far as possible the circumstances of that Party
2. If a Party cannot access the financial resources needed to participate in CITES meetings where its own compliance is being considered, it may request assistance from the Secretariat or the Standing Committee in identifying such resources.	2. If a Party cannot access the financial resources needed to participate in CITES meetings where its own compliance is being considered, it may request assistance from the Secretariat or the Standing Committee in identifying such resources.	2. If a Party cannot access the financial resources needed to participate in CITES meetings where its own compliance is being considered, it can request assistance from the Secretariat or the Standing Committee in identifying such resources.	2. If a Party cannot access the financial resources needed to participate in CITES meetings where its own compliance is being considered, it may request assistance from the Secretariat or the Standing Committee in identifying such resources.
			3. The Secretariat will endeavour to confirm that competent authorities of the affected Party have received compliance related communications.
D. Measures to restore compliance	D. Measures to achieve compliance	D. Measures to restore compliance	D. Measures to achieve compliance
1. If the Standing Committee determines that a compliance problem does exist, it issues a formal notice to the concerned Party informing it that it is in noncompliance, explaining the reasons	1. If the Standing Committee determines that a compliance problem does exist it may take one or more of the following measures to address compliance matters:	1. If the Standing Committee determines that a compliance problem does exist, it issues a formal notice to the concerned Party informing it of the determination, explaining the reasons for that	1. Where compliance problems are identified, the Secretariat, on its own initiative or under direction of the Standing Committee, notifies the affected Party of the non-compliance issue and requests corrective action.

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
for that conclusion and requesting a	a. the provision of advice,	conclusion and requesting a	
response. It also offers advice and	information and appropriate	response. It also offers advice and	
assistance to solve the issue.	facilitation of assistance and other	assistance to solve the issue.	
	capacity-building support to the		
	affected Party [through the		
	Secretariat or another body;]		
	b. [direct contact with the		
	affected Party by a representative of		
	the Standing Committee with a view		
	to helping it find a solution];		
	c. special reporting by the		
	affected Party;		
	c bis issuance of a formal		
	caution/notice/ statement of concern		
	to an affected Party		
	warning/informing it that there is a		
	compliance problem, requesting a		
	response;		
	d. recommended specific actions		
	to be undertaken by the affected		
	Party;		
	e. in-country technical		
	assessment and verification mission,		
	upon the invitation of the Party		
	concerned, [by the Secretariat, one		
	or several members of the Standing		
	Committee or, depending on the		
	assessment needs, by an		
	independent review team];		
	f. public notification of		
	compliance problems sent through		
	the Secretariat by the Standing		
	Committee to all Parties advising		
	that compliance problems have been		
	brought to the attention of a Party		
	and that, up to that time, there has		
	been no satisfactory response or		
	action;		

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
	g. a compliance action plan to be submitted to the Standing Committee by the affected Party identifying steps needed for a Party to comply, a timetable for when those steps should be completed and means to assess satisfactory completion. [During this period, no additional measures would be applied [related to this instance of non-compliance] provided that progress in returning to compliance continued to be made]; h. recommendation of a temporary suspension of commercial or all trade in specimens of one or more CITES-listed species, consistent with Article XIII of the Convention. Such a recommendation may be made in cases where a Party's non-compliance is persistent, the Party is showing no intention to achieve compliance and the Standing Committee determines that this situation is likely to be detrimental to the survival of one or more CITES-listed species.		
2. If a Party fails to respond to such notice //timeline?// or if its compliance problem is not solved in spite of the assistance offered, the Standing Committee may warn the Party that it is still out of compliance. The Committee may then decide upon one or more of the following graduated measures destined at		2. If a Party fails to respond to such notice //timeline?// or if its compliance problem is not solved in spite of the assistance offered, the Standing Committee can warn the Party that a problem still exists. To date, the Committee has decided upon, or recommended to the COP, as appropriate, the following types of	2. The affected Party is given every opportunity to correct the issue within reasonable time limits, if necessary with the assistance of the Secretariat. The time limits, whether set by the Standing Committee or by the Secretariat, are defined according to the nature of the problem and the Party's capacity to

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
bringing about compliance with the		measures:	take corrective action.
Convention:		a. advice, information, appropriate	
a. advice, information,		assistance and other capability-	
appropriate assistance and other		building support to the affected Party	
capability-building support to the		through the Secretariat or another	
affected Party through the		body;	
Secretariat or another body;		b. direct contact with the	
b. direct contact with the		affected Party by a representative of	
affected Party by a representative of		the Standing Committee with a view	
the Standing Committee with a view		to helping it find a solution;	
to helping it find a solution;		c. special reporting by the	
c. special reporting by the		affected Party and data verification	
affected Party and data verification		by the Secretariat;	
by the Secretariat;		d. recommended specific actions	
d. recommended specific actions		to be undertaken by the affected	
to be undertaken by the affected		Party;	
Party;		e. in-country technical	
e. in-country technical		assessment and verification mission,	
assessment and verification mission,		upon the invitation of the Party	
upon the invitation of the Party		concerned, by the Secretariat, one or	
concerned, by the Secretariat, one or		several members of the Standing	
several members of the Standing		Committee or, depending on the	
Committee or, depending on the		assessment needs, by an	
assessment needs, by an		independent review team;	
independent review team;		f notification of the	
f. public notification of non-		determination of a compliance	
compliance sent through the		problem sent through the	
Secretariat by the Standing		Secretariat by the Standing	
Committee [or the Conference of the		Committee to all Parties advising	
Parties] to all Parties advising that		that issues have been brought to	
issues of non-compliance have been		the attention of a Party and that, up	
brought to the attention of a Party		to that time, there has been no	
and that, up to that time, there has		satisfactory response or action; //is	
been no satisfactory response or		this implementing Resolution 11.3(e)	
action;		or describing something else?//	
g. agreement between the		g. agreement between the affected	
affected Party and the Secretariat or		Party and the Secretariat or the	
the Standing Committee on a		Standing Committee on a	

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
wG draft as of 1 July 05 compliance action plan with steps needed for a Party to comply, a timetable for when those steps should be completed and means to assess satisfactory completion. During this period, no additional measures would be applied [related to this instance of non-compliance] provided that progress in returning to compliance continued to be made; h. recommended temporary suspension of commercial or all trade in specimens of one or more CITES-listed species, consistent with Article XIII of the Convention. A recommendation to suspend trade may be made in cases where a Party's non-compliance is persistent and the Party is showing no intention to cooperate towards compliance and it is determined that this persistent non-compliance is likely to be detrimental to the		compliance action plan with steps needed for a Party to take, a timetable for when those steps should be completed and means to assess satisfactory completion with no additional measures being applied during this period provided that progress continues to be made; h. recommended temporary suspension of commercial or all trade in specimens of specific species or taxa of concern or of all CITES-listed species, consistent with Article XIII of the Convention.	Australia's text
survival of one or more CITES-listed species. 3. The list of measures above is not necessarily exhaustive. The measures decided upon and the deadlines set for the Party to reply to communications and implement the recommended measure(s) should be decided case-by-case, taking into account the Party's capacity, economic, administrative or other, to restore effective compliance, cf. paragraph II, 2 above. These considerations, together with the	3. The list of measures above is not necessarily exhaustive.	3. The measures decided upon and the deadlines set for the Party to reply to communications and implement the recommended measure(s) should be decided case-by-case, taking into account the Party's capacity, economic, administrative or other, to restore effective compliance, cf. paragraph II, 2 above. These considerations, together with the legal and technical ones, should be clearly set out in the	3. One or more of the following measures may be used to bring about compliance with the Convention: a. advice, information, appropriate assistance and other capability-building support to the affected Party through the Secretariat or another body; b. direct contact with the affected Party by a representative of the Standing Committee with a view to

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
legal and technical ones, should be		Committee's recommendations.	helping it find a solution;
clearly set out in the Committee's			c. special reporting by the affected
recommendations.			Party and data verification by the
			Secretariat;
			d. recommended specific actions to
			be undertaken by the affected Party; e. in-country technical assessment
			and verification mission, upon the
			invitation of the Party concerned, by
			the Secretariat, one or several
			members of the Standing Committee
			or, depending on the assessment
			needs, by an independent review
			team;
			f. public notification of non-
			compliance sent through the
			Secretariat by the Standing
			Committee to all Parties advising
			that issues of non-compliance have
			been brought to the attention of a Party and that, up to that time, there
			has been no satisfactory response or
			action;
			g) agreement between the affected
			Party and the Secretariat or the
			Standing Committee on a
			compliance action plan with steps
			needed for a Party to comply, a
			timetable for when those steps
			should be completed and means to
			assess satisfactory completion.
			h) recommend temporary suspension
			of commercial or all trade in
			specimens of one or more CITES- listed species, consistent with
			Article XIII of the Convention. A
			recommendation to suspend trade
			may be made in cases where a
			may be made in cases where a

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
			Party's non-compliance is persistent and the Party is showing no intention to cooperate towards compliance
4. Where compliance measures are being developed, the possible conservation impact must be taken into account and all efforts taken to avoid developing and establishing measures that are likely to bring about negative conservation results, even if these would apply to a limited number of Parties or species.	4. When the Standing Committee decides upon one or more of the abovementioned measures, it shall take into account: a. the capacity of the Party concerned, especially developing country Parties, in particular the least developed and small island developing States amongst them, and Parties with economies in transition; b. such factors as the cause, type, degree and frequency of the compliance problems; c. the possible impact on conservation and sustainable use with a view to avoiding negative results.	4. As compliance measures are being developed for a particular situation, the possible conservation impacts of such measures are taken into account. //this is already covered in II.2//	5. When deciding on compliance measures, the following is taken into account: a) the capacity of the Party concerned, especially developing country Parties, in particular the least developed and small island developing States amongst them, and Parties with economies in transition; b) such factors as the cause, type, degree and frequency of the compliance problems; c) the possible conservation impact

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
-			with a view to avoiding negative conservation results.
E. Monitoring of implementation and return to compliance	E. Monitoring and implementation of measures	E. Monitoring of measures	E. Monitoring of implementation and return to compliance
1. The Standing Committee should monitor the actions taken by the Party concerned to restore compliance through, among other things, its submission of progress reports or the submission of reports by the Secretariat.	1. The Standing Committee monitors the actions taken by the Party concerned to implement measures taken pursuant to paragraph D2. In this regard, the Standing Committee may, inter alia: a. require the Party concerned to submit progress reports in accordance with a schedule and a format to be determined by it; b. arrange, upon the invitation of the Party concerned, for an incountry technical assessment and for a verification mission. In the light of progress, the Standing Committee may adjust the measures it has taken, or decide upon additional measures pursuant to paragraph D2.	1. The Standing Committee monitors the actions taken by the Party concerned through, among other things, its submission of progress reports or the submission of reports by the Secretariat.	1. The Secretariat monitors the actions taken by the affected Party. The affected Party may be requested to provide progress reports or the Secretariat may arrange, upon invitation of the affected Party, for an in-country technical assessment and verification mission.
2. Specific actions as well as the date when the Party concerned is expected to return to compliance should be noted in such reports. Deadlines established by the Standing Committee [or the Conference of the Parties]should be adjusted to allow an affected Party that is making good progress to complete the steps needed to restore compliance.	2., 3., 4. <u>:</u>	2. Specific actions as well as timetables are noted in such reports. Deadlines established by the Standing Committee [or the Conference of the Parties] are adjusted to allow an affected Party that is making good progress to complete the steps needed.	2. The Secretariat may report concerns about progress to the Standing Committee. In the light of progress, the Standing Committee may adjust the measures being implemented or decide upon additional measures to achieve compliance.

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
3. The Party concerned should keep the Standing Committee informed of its progress by submitting summary reports according to a schedule to be determined from case to case.		3. The Party concerned keeps the Standing Committee informed of its progress by submitting summary reports according to a schedule to be determined from case to case.	3. Existing recommendations to suspend trade are reviewed by the Secretariat. If compliance is achieved, the Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee withdraw the
			recommendation for a trade suspension. The Standing Committee withdraws the recommendation to suspend trade if the affected Party has achieved compliance. The Secretariat may recommend that the Standing
			Committe withdraw the recommendation for a trade suspension if the affected Party has made significant progress to achieve compliance. In such cases, the Standing Committee may withdraw the recommendation to suspend
4. In the event of a failure to return to compliance in a timely manner, the Standing Committee should consider other measures consistent with the list of measures provided above.		4. In the event of a failure to resolve the compliance problem in a timely manner, the Standing Committee can consider other measures (see para. D(2) above).	4 The Secretariat notifies the affected Party as soon as possible that compliance has been achieved or when Standing Committee recommendations on its compliance have been made.
5. Existing recommendations to suspend trade should be reviewed at each Standing Committee meeting. They should also be monitored intersessionally by the Secretariat. A recommendation to suspend trade should be withdrawn as soon as a Party has been restored to full compliance, or has shown clear	5. The Standing Committee shall review existing recommendations to suspend trade at each meeting. Where the Standing Committee determines that the Party concerned has: a. achieved compliance, it shall withdraw the recommendation to suspend trade forthwith;	5. Existing recommendations to suspend trade are generally reviewed at each Standing Committee meeting. They are also monitored intersessionally by the Secretariat. A recommendation to suspend trade is withdrawn as soon as the problem has been resolved or has shown clear evidence of having	

WG draft as of 1 July 05	EU text	US text	Australia's text
evidence of having engaged in a process towards that aim.	b. made significant progress in securing compliance, it may withdraw the recommendation to suspend trade.	engaged in a process towards that aim.	
6. The Standing Committee should instruct the Secretariat to notify Parties as soon as it is satisfied that an affected Party has returned to compliance.	6. The Standing Committee should instruct the Secretariat to notify Parties as soon as it is satisfied that an affected Party has <u>achieved</u> compliance.	6. The Standing Committee instructs the Secretariat to notify Parties as soon as it is satisfied that an affected Party has resolved its problem.	
VI Review of overall compliance 1. The Conference of the Parties should review these guidelines at every [alternate] meeting and revise them where appropriate for example to incorporate experience gained in implementing them or other relevant compliance policy documents.	VI Review of overall compliance 1. The Conference of the Parties should review these guidelines at every [alternate] meeting and revise them where appropriate for example to incorporate experience gained in implementing them or other relevant compliance policy documents.	VI Review of overall compliance 1. The Conference of the Parties should review this document periodically and revise it where appropriate for example to reflect evolving practice.	VI Review of overall compliance 1. The Conference of the Parties may review these guidelines periodically and revise them where appropriate for example to incorporate experience gained in implementing them or other relevant compliance policy documents.
Reporting The Standing Committee and the Secretariat shall report to the Conference of the Parties on their activities under these guidelines.	Reporting The Standing Committee and the Secretariat shall report to the Conference of the Parties on their activities under these guidelines.		

JAPAN'S COMMENTS ON THE DRAFT GUIDELINES ON COMPLIANCE WITH THE CONVENTION

- 1. Japan appreciates the work done by the Working Group in elaborating the draft guidelines which Japan considers as a good basis for further discussions.
- 2. The CITES already has a set of mechanisms to promote compliance based on Article 13 of the Convention as well as several separate resolutions including Conf. 11.3 and Conf. 12.8. Japan considers that it would be instrumental to develop the guidelines with the purpose to facilitate consistent application of these mechanisms within the framework of the existing provision and resolutions.
- 3. From this point of view, Japan is pleased to see that some important principles in applying the mechanisms are set out in the draft, which are: positive, supportive and non-adversarial approach, etc.
- 4. On the other hand, Japan is concerned that the draft has some serious inconsistencies with the existing provision and resolutions, which can lead to a misunderstanding that the purpose of the guidelines is to establish a new compliance mechanism rather than to facilitate consistent application of existing mechanisms. It should be clearly recognized that the Standing Committee and the Secretariat were not mandated to establish a new compliance mechanism at the CoP12*.
- 5. Japan considers that it is of critical importance to outline the objective of the guidelines within the text of the guidelines in order to avoid any misunderstanding and confusion. For this purpose, we propose the following:

Provide clearly, at the beginning of the guidelines, the objective of the guidelines which is to ensure the consistent and effective application of the existing compliance-related procedures in the CITES within the framework of the Convention, Conf. 11.3, Conf. 12.8 and other relevant resolutions.

- 6. Japan also considers that it is necessary to remove from the guidelines the inconsistencies with the Article 13, Conf. 11.3, Conf. 12.8 and other resolutions which are the basis of the current compliance procedures.
- 7. One of the most important inconsistencies lies in the role of the Standing Committee. We understand that CITES has five levels of compliance-related procedures in place:
 - a) the general procedure stipulated in Article 13, which provides that the CoP shall review the information provided by the Party and make recommendations it deems appropriate;
 - b) Party-specific procedures of annual reporting under Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP13), in which the Standing Committee is mandated by the CoP to determine which Parties have failed to provide the annual reports required under VIII 7 (a). Accordingly, the CoP recommends to the Parties not to authorize trade in specimens of CITES-listed species with that Party;

This point is manifested in the history of the discussions. At SC46, after considering the Secretariat's proposal "to prepare revision of Resolution Conf. 11.3 to provide a set of procedures and mechanisms", the Standing Committee instructed the Secretariat to prepare a document for CoP12 that does not require the adoption of new decision nor revision of resolutions. At CoP12, after reviewing the document mainly by analyzing existing compliance mechanisms within the CITES, the Parties directed the Secretariat to draft a set of guidelines, on the basis of that document, for consideration by the Standing Committee (Decision 12.84). Since compliance mechanisms are already in place, the draft guidelines has been developed based on those mechanisms as to facilitate consistent application.

Japan would like to request the Working Group to review the draft and correct any inconsistencies. At this stage, we would present our revised version of the draft.

- c) Party-specific procedures of National Legislation development under Conf. 8.4 and Decision 13.82, where the Standing Committee shall consider appropriate measures, which may include recommendations to suspend commercial trade in specimens of CITES-listed species to and from Parties that do not comply with Decisions 13.79, 13.80 or 13.81 or decisions of the Standing Committee in relation to national laws for implementation of the Convention;
- d) Party-specific procedures under Conf. 11.3, where there exists "major problems" with implementation of the Convention, only after the Secretariat works together with the Party concerned to try to solve the problem and offer advice or technical assistance as required and only if the Secretariat recognizes that a solution cannot be readily achieved that the Secretariat brings the matter to the attention of the Standing Committee. Then the Standing Committee may pursue the matter in direct contact with the Party concerned with a view to helping to find a solution. Here the Standing Committee does not have a primary role of resolving the non-compliance issues, but it obtains such role only when the CoP delegates its function to the Standing Committee on an issue by issue basis. It is also worth noting that under Conf. 11.3 the Standing Committee is not authorized in general by the CoP to make recommendation of the punitive nature. On the contrary, Conf. 11.3 allows the Standing Committee only to help the Party in question to find a solution. Japan, therefore, believes that delegation of power by the CoP to the Standing Committee is necessary in the form of CoP resolutions or decisions before the Standing Committee is able to make recommendations of punitive nature including suspension of trade of CITES-listed species; and
- e) for protection of specific Appendix-II species, Conf. 12.8 stands. Under the Conf. 12.8, it is not the Standing Committee but the Animals and Plants Committees in cooperation with the Secretariat that takes the primary responsible role to deal with this matter. It is only after recommendations by the Animals and Plants Committees have failed and the Secretariat recommends the Standing Committee to take appropriate action, that the Standing Committee is able to review the situation and make recommendations which may include, as a last resort, suspension of trade.
- 8. On the other hand, the Section III paragraph 2 of the draft identifies the role of the Standing Committee as to "examine general and specific compliance matters", and the Section III paragraph 1 states that "the CoP may decide to carry out itself the task normally entrusted to the Standing Committee as described in Section IV and V below." Japan believes that these statements will lead to the understanding that the Standing Committee has been provided with functional role of dealing with compliance issues in general without any additional resolution or decision. This understanding contradicts with the existing resolutions as specified in 7. Furthermore, we consider that the Section V. B to E are entirely new non-compliance procedures which doesn't have any basis in the existing resolutions. Therefore, the above section must be replaced by the existing mechanism.
- 9. Japan also proposes that the functions of the Standing Committee and the CoP within the compliance mechanism should be accurately identified based on the existing provision and resolutions.

August 2006

CITES Compliance Guidelines

I <u>Legal basis</u>, oObjectives, and scope

1. The objective of these guidelines is to promote, facilitate and achieve compliance with the Convention and, in particular, to assist Parties in meeting their obligations regarding such compliance. Specially, the guidelines <u>aim at facilitating the consistent and effective application of the exsiting compliance related procedures in the CITES within the framework of the Convention, Conf. 11.3, Conf. 12.8 and other relevant resolutions.</u>

Specifically, the guidelines describe and clarify current practice in order to facilitate the handling of matters of compliance within the Convention, both in individual cases and in matters of general interest. [Comment: The word "current practice" does not set an exact boundary of the CITES practices. Therefore, these guidelines should be confined to relevant resolutions.]

- 2. <u>Scope of T</u>these guidelines <u>are</u> apply to issues of compliance relating to the obligations under the Convention, taking into account relevant resolutions. Particular attention should be paid to the following:
- a) Designation of Management Authority(ies) and Scientific Authority(ies) (Art. IX),
- b) Permitting trade in CITES-listed specimens only to the extent consistent with the procedures laid down in the Convention (art. III, IV, V, VI, VII and XV),
- c) Taking appropriate domestic measures to enforce the provisions of the Convention and prohibit trade in violation thereof (Art. VIII para. 1),
- d) Maintenance of records of trade and submission of periodic reports (Art. VIII, paras 7 and 8),
- e) Responding to communications of the Secretariat or the Standing Committee related to information that a species included in Appendix I or II is being adversely affected by trade in specimens of that species or that the provisions of the Convention are not being effectively implemented (Article XIII).
- 3. These guidelines are without prejudice to any dispute settlement procedure under the Convention.

II General Principles

- 1. A positive, supportive and non-adversarial approach is taken towards issues of non-compliance, with the aim of ensuring long-term compliance.
- 2. These guidelines and <u>application of ensuing</u> compliance measures are applied <u>should be in a fair</u>, consistent and transparent manner, while paying particular attention to the special needs of developing country Parties[, in particular the least developed and the <u>small island developing States among them</u>].
- 3. As a general rule, f Findings and communications in compliance matters are not treated confidentially if the Party whose compliance is in question and the relevant bodies such as the Standing Committee, the Animals and Plants Committees and the Secretariat so decided. Exceptions to this rule are possible, inter alia for the following reasons:
- a) to protect information provided by an affected Party and which that Party has requested, with supporting reasons, be kept confidential.
- b) to avoid threats to the safety of individuals,
- c) to protect confidential business information,
- d) to avoid the disclosure of information that could jeopardize the survival of populations of species included in the Appendices of the Convention, or
- e) to avoid compromising a judicial investigation.
- 4. Decision on whether to close or keep open debates in individual compliance matters is taken according to the Rules of Procedure of the body seized with the matter. <u>Unless such decision is made, debates</u> should be closed
- 5. In their communications with an affected Party the Standing Committee and the Secretariat should make sure that the information provided and the requests for information made to the Party are effectively received by the competent authorities of the Party.

III The various bodies and their compliance-related tasks

- 1. As the supreme body of the Convention, t The Conference of the Parties:
- provides general policy guidance on compliance issues,

- directs and oversees the handling of compliance matters particularly through the identification of key obligations and procedures, and
- reviews as needed decisions of the Standing Committee related to specific issues of non-compliance adopted pursuant to paragraph 38. The Conference of the Parties may decide to carry out itself the tasks normally entrusted to the Standing Committee as described in Sections IV and V below.
- examines general and specific compliance issues,
- may make recommendations it deems appropriate, and
- may delegate its authority to the Standing Committee.
- 2. As the executive body of the Convention, t The Standing Committee, acting in accordance with instructions from and authority delegated within the policy decided by the Conference of the Parties, examines general and specific compliance matters, in accordance with the procedure under Conf. 11.3, Conf. 11.17, Conf. 12.8 and Decision 13.82, including:
- monitoring and assessing overall compliance <u>issues</u>,
- advising and assisting Parties in complying with the Convention;
- verifying information and making determinations regarding compliance issues; and
- <u>making determinations of non-compliance under Conf. 11.17 and Conf. 12.8; and</u>
- making decisions and recommendations regarding compliance measures.
- 3. As technical advisory bodies of the Convention, *the Animals and Plants Committees* advise and assist the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties with regard to compliance matters, *inter alia* by undertaking necessary reviews, consultations, assessments and reporting. Regarding the conduct of the Review of Significant Trade, the Animals and Plants Committees, in cooperation with the Secretariat and experts, and in consultation with range States, review relevant information on Appendix-II species and identify problems concerning the implementation of Article IV para 2(a), 3 and 6(a) in accordance with the procedure under Conf. 12.8.
- 4. *The Secretariat* assists and supports the Animals and Plants Committees, the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties in carrying out their functions concerning compliance matters according to the procedures set out in these guidelines the relevant resolutions.

IV General monitoring and facilitation of compliance

- 1. The Secretariat is responsible for day to day monitoring of compliance. It receives, assesses and communicates to the Parties information on compliance matters. It advises and assists Parties in complying with the Convention, draws their attention to possible issues of non-compliance, makes recommendations for restoring compliance and tracks keeps these Parties informed as fully as possible of the implementation of compliance-related decisions and recommendations of the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties.
- 2. Annual and biennial reports, legislative texts as well as other special reports and responses to information requests provide the primary, but not exclusive, means of monitoring compliance with the Convention. To that end, the Secretariat advises Parties at least [60] days in advance of deadlines applicable to reporting and other obligations under the Convention.
- 3. The Secretariat reports on a regular basis to the Standing Committee and the Conference of the Parties on its activities undertaken under these guidelines.

V Party-s Specific compliance issues

- A. Detection [identification] of potential compliance issues
- 1. The Secretariat provides individual Parties concerned with information it receives which indicates that they may have compliance problems, and communicates with these individual Parties to determine consider whether compliance problems exist.

Compliance problems are often identified within significant trade reviews, national legislation projects and national reporting programmes.

- 2. In response, the Party will, as soon as possible, inform the Secretariat of any relevant facts in so far as its laws permit and, where appropriate, propose remedial action. Where the Party considers that an inquiry is desirable, such inquiry may be carried out by one or more persons expressly authorized by the Party.
- 3. Any Party concerned over trade in Appendix-II or -III species conducted by another Party may bring the matter up directly with that Party. If this fails to produce results, it may call upon the Secretariat for assistance.

- 4. Parties themselves may give the Secretariat early warning of any compliance problems, including the inability to provide information by a certain deadline, and indicate the reasons for these problems and if any is assistance required.
- 5. Where compliance problems are identified, the Parties in question are given every opportunity to correct them within reasonable time limits, if necessary with the assistance of the Secretariat. The time limits, whether set by the Standing Committee or by the Secretariat, are defined according to the nature of the problem and the Party's capacity to take corrective action.
- 6. If it does not appear a solution can be readily achieved, the Secretariat brings the matter to the attention of the Standing Committee, which may pursue the matter in direct contact with the Party concerned with a view to helping to find a solution.
- 7. The Secretariat keeps the Parties informed as fully as possible, through notifications, of such implementation problems and of actions taken to solve them, and includes such problems in its report of alleged infractions.

B. [Non-compliance submissions]

- 1. If the Party fails to take sufficient corrective action, the matter is brought to the attention of the Standing Committee, in the form of a "non-compliance submission", by the Secretariat in direct contact with the Party concerned.
- a) the Party itself;
- b) [One or more other Parties];
- c) [the Secretariat in direct contact with the Party concerned];
- d) [The Conference of the Parties]; or
- e) [The Standing Committee].
- 2) Reports to the Standing Committee are generally made in writing and include details as to which specific obligations are concerned and an assessment of the reasons why the affected Party may be unable to meet those obligations. Given the immediacy/urgency of some compliance issues, verbal/oral reporting may be appropriate. Corroborating [or contradicting/additional or supplemental] information, or indication of where such information may be found, should be provided. The non-compliance submission may include proposals for remedial action.[link to para 29]

//--end of discussed text --//

3) [(29), The Secretariat assesses the underlying information to determine its reliability and relevance, compiles supplementary information, both corroborating and contradicting, and consults with the affected Party, and reports to the Standing Committee

Whoever reports a compliance problem to the SC copies that report simultaneously to the concerned Party.

- 4) [(30) The Standing Committee [] should ensure the expedited handling of a non-compliance submission.]
- 5) (28) The Standing Committee can/should/will/may reject non-compliance submissions which it considers are:
- a) de minimis [trivial], or
- b) manifestly ill-founded.

Where the Standing Committee has decided that the submission is not trivial or manifestly ill founded, the Party concerned shall be given the right to provide comments within [a reasonable time as set out by the Committee]

[Information gathering and fact-finding]

- 6) (31) The Standing Committee [] considers the submission as well as other information and observations with a view to establishing relevant facts and finding a solution [and securing an amicable solution of the matter].
- 7) (33) []The Standing Committee []may gather or request further information on a non-compliance submission whenever such information may be found and may seek an invitation from the Party concerned to undertake the gathering and verification of information in the territory of that Party or wherever such information may be found. This may be carried out by the Secretariat or by the regional representatives.
- 6. When considering a non-compliance submission, the Standing Committee also considers the nature, (underlying) cause(s), degree and frequency of non-compliance and whether the affected Party has taken or planned any steps to restore compliance before making a determination that issues of non-compliance exist.

C. Right of consultation and participation

- 1. A Party has the right to be consulted formally on any non-compliance submission and to participate in discussions of the Standing Committee [and the Conference of the Parties] with respect to its own compliance. It [is not entitled to][may not] [does not], however, take part in the preparation and adoption of any decisions, measures or recommendations of the Standing Committee [or the Conference of the Parties].
- 2. If a Party cannot access the financial resources needed to participate in CITES meetings where its own compliance is being considered, it may request assistance from the Secretariat or the Standing Committee in identifying such resources.

<u>D</u> <u>C</u>. Measures to restore compliance

- 1. If the Standing Committee determines that a In case an alleged non-compliance problem by a specific Party is presented before the Standing Committee, does exist, it issues a formal notice to the concerned Party informing it that it is in non-compliance, explaining the reasons for that conclusion and requesting a response. and if it does not appear a solution can be readily achieved, the Standing Committee may pursue the matter in direct contact with the Party concerned with a view to helping to find a solution. It also offers advice and assistance to solve the issue.
- 2. When considering a non-compliance submission, the Standing Committee also considers the nature, (underlying) cause(s), degree and frequency of non-compliance and whether the affected Party has taken or is planning to take any steps to restore compliance (before making a determination of the existence of non-compliance).
- 2. If a Party fails to respond to such notice (Cda: timeline?) or if its compliance problem is not solved in spite of the assistance offered, the Standing Committee may warn the Party that it is still out of compliance. The Committee may then decide upon one or more of the following graduated measures destined at bringing about compliance with the Convention:
- a) advice, information, appropriate assistance and other capability-building support to the affected Party through the Secretariat or another body;
- b) direct contact with the affected Party by a representative of the Standing Committee with a view to helping it find a solution;

- c) special reporting by the affected Party and data verification by the Secretariat;
- d) recommended specific actions to be undertaken by the affected Party;
- e) in-country technical assessment and verification mission, upon the invitation of the Party concerned, by the Secretariat, one or several members of the Standing Committee or, depending on the assessment needs, by an independent review team;
- f) public notification of non-compliance sent through the Secretariat by the Standing Committee [or the Conference of the Parties] to all Parties advising that issues of non-compliance have been brought to the attention of a Party and that, up to that time, there has been no satisfactory response or action;
- g)—agreement between the affected Party and (Ecu:) the Secretariat or the Standing Committee on a compliance action plan with steps needed for a Party to comply, a timetable for when those steps should be completed and means to assess satisfactory completion. During this period, no additional measures would be applied [related to this instance of non-compliance] provided that progress in returning to compliance continued to be made;
- h) recommended temporary suspension of commercial or all trade in specimens of one or more CITES-listed species, consistent with Article XIII of the Convention. A recommendation to suspend trade may be made in cases where a Party's non-compliance is persistent and the Party is showing no intention to cooperate towards compliance and it is determined that this persistent non-compliance is likely to be detrimental to the survival of one or more CITES-listed species. Cda: Is this last sentence overly fettering the authority of the Parties?)
- 3. The list of measures above is not necessarily exhaustive. The measures decided upon and the deadlines set for the Party to reply to communications and implement the recommended measure(s) should be decided case by case, taking into account the Party's capacity, economic, administrative or other, to restore effective compliance, cf. paragraph II, 2 above. These considerations, together with the legal and technical ones, should be clearly set out in the Committee's recommendations.

(EU deleted)

4. Where compliance measures are being developed, the possible conservation impact must be taken into account and all efforts taken to avoid developing and establishing measures that are likely to bring about negative conservation results, even if these would apply to a limited number of Parties or species.

EU: Replace with:

When the Standing Committee decides upon one or more of the measures in accordance with paragraph 38, it shall take into account:

- a) the capacity of the Party concerned, especially developing country Parties, in particular the least developed and small island developing States amongst them, and Parties with economies in transition;
- b) such factors as the cause, type, degree and frequency of the compliance problems;
- c) the possible conservation impact with a view to avoiding negative conservation results.
- 3. In case of the failure to submit an annual report by a specific Party, the recommendation by the Conference of the Parties not to authorize trade in specimens of CITES-listed species with that Party will automatically be issued upon determination by the Standing Committee under Conf.11.17.
- 4. Regarding national laws for implementation of the Convention, the Standing Committee shall consider appropriate measures, which may include recommendations to suspend commercial trade in specimens of CITES-listed species to and from Parties that do not comply with Decisions 13.79, 13.80 or 13.81, or decisions of the Standing Committee in relation to national laws for implementation of the Convention under Decision 13.82.
- 5. Regarding the review of Significant Trade in specimens of Appendix-II species, where the Standing Committee is recommended by the Secretariat under the procedure of Conf. 12.8 to take appropriate action, the Standing Committee shall make recommendations to the State concerned, or to all Parties. The recommendation may include, as a last resort, a suspension of trade in the affected species with that State. The Secretariat shall notify the Parties of any recommendations on actions taken by the Standing Committee.
- \underline{ED} . Monitoring of implementation and return to compliance
- 1. The Standing Committee should monitor the actions taken by the Party concerned to restore compliance through, among other things, its submission of progress reports or the submission of reports by the Secretariat.

EU: Replace by: The Standing Committee [] shall monitor the actions taken by the Party concerned to implement measures taken pursuant to paragraph 38.

In this regard, the Standing Committee may, inter alia:

(a) require the Party concerned to submit progress reports in accordance with a schedule and a format to be determined by it;

- (b) arrange, upon the invitation of the Party concerned, for an incountry technical assessment and for a verification mission.

 In the light of progress, the Standing Committee may adjust the measures it has taken, or decide upon additional measures pursuant to paragraph 38.
- 2. Specific actions as well as the date when the Party concerned is expected to return to compliance should be noted in such reports. Deadlines established by the Standing Committee [or the Conference of the Parties]should be adjusted to allow an affected Party that is making good progress to complete the steps needed to restore compliance.

EU: may be deleted

- 3. The Party concerned should keep the Standing Committee informed of its progress by submitting summary reports according to a schedule to be determined from case to case.

 EU: may be deleted
- 4. In the event of a failure to return to compliance in a timely manner, the Standing Committee should consider other measures consistent with the list of measures provided above.

 EU: may be deleted
- 5. Existing recommendations to suspend trade should be reviewed at each Standing Committee meeting. They should also be monitored intersessionally (Ecu:) by the Secretariat. A recommendation to suspend trade should be withdrawn as soon as a Party has been restored to full compliance, or has shown clear evidence of having engaged in a process towards that aim.
- EU: Replace with: The Standing Committee shall review existing recommendations to suspend trade at each meeting. Where the Standing Committee determines that the Party concerned has: (a) secured compliance, it shall withdraw the recommendation to suspend trade forthwith; (b) made significant progress in securing compliance, it may withdraw the recommendation to suspend trade.
- 6. The Standing Committee should instruct the Secretariat to notify Parties as soon as it is satisfied that an affected Party has returned to/EU: secured compliance.
- 1. Regarding national laws for implementation of the Convention, the Secretariat compiles and analyses the information submitted by Parties with legislation in Category 2 or 3 under Doc. 10.31 (Rev.) Annex 1 or not yet categorized, under Decision 13.83.

- 2. (a) The Secretariat, for the purpose of monitoring and facilitating the implementation of Conf. 12.8 and the relevant paragraphs of Article IV, reports at each meeting of the Animals and Plants Committees on the implementation by the range States concerned of the recommendation by the Committee.
- (b) A recommendation to suspend the trade of the affected species with the State concerned should be withdrawn only when that State demonstrates to satisfaction of the Standing Committee through the Secretariat, compliance with Article IV paragraph 2(a), 3 or 6(a).
- (c) The Standing Committee, in consultation with the Secretariat and the Chairman of the Animals and Plants Committees, reviews the recommendations to suspend trade that have been in place for more than two years and, if appropriate, takes measures to address the situation.

VI Review of overall compliance

1. The Conference of the Parties should review these guidelines at every [alternate] meeting/ US: periodically/ and revise them where appropriate for example to incorporate experience gained in implementing them or other relevant compliance policy documents.

V Reporting EU: Reporting

The Standing Committee and the Secretariat shall report to the Conference of the Parties on their activities under these guidelines.