# CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Fifty-fourth meeting of the Standing Committee Geneva (Switzerland), 2-6 October 2006

## Interpretation and implementation of the Convention

## Trade control

#### TRADE IN APPENDIX-I SPECIES

- 1. This document was prepared by the CITES Secretariat. The report in Annex 2 was prepared by the UNEP World Conservation Monitoring Centre.
- 2. At its 13th meeting (Bangkok, 2004), the Conference of the Parties adopted Decision 13.20 on Trade in Appendix-I species, as follows:

The Standing Committee shall:

- a) conduct a review of trade in Appendix-I plant and animal species, through UNEP-WCMC. The review should take into account all exports, re-exports, and imports of Appendix-I specimens, including the species name, the source and purpose codes, existing exemptions and all other relevant information for the last five years. The identity of individual Parties should be protected in the report; and
- b) consider the UNEP-WCMC report and draft recommendations, if necessary, based on the analysis of Appendix-I trade, at its 54th meeting, and present these recommendations for consideration at the 14th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.
- 3. At its 53rd meeting (Geneva, June July 2005), the Standing Committee agreed on the terms of reference for the required review. These are shown in Annex 1.
- 4. In accordance with Decision 13.20, the Secretariat contracted UNEP-WCMC to conduct the review and their report is attached as Annex 2. The work was funded by the Government of Ireland, to which the Secretariat wishes to express its appreciation.

# Recommendations

- 5. The Standing Committee is mandated to draft recommendations, if necessary, based on the attached report. On the basis of the conclusions of UNEP-WCMC contained in the section entitled Discussion (see page 20), the Secretariat suggests the Standing Committee consider the following possible actions:
  - a) The Secretariat should examine the evidence of cases where it appears that there might have been a contravention of the Convention and discuss this with the States concerned. If necessary, it should initiate the procedure provided in Article XIII of the Convention and, in this case, it should inform the Standing Committee.
  - b) Parties should be reminded that the Conference of the Parties, in Resolution Conf. 12.10 (Rev. CoP13) (Guidelines for a procedure to register and monitor operations that breed

Appendix-I animal species for commercial purposes), has agreed that "Parties shall restrict imports for primarily commercial purposes, as defined in Resolution Conf. 5.10, of captive-bred specimens of Appendix-I species to those produced by operations included in the Secretariat's Register and shall reject any document granted under Article VII, paragraph 4, if the specimens concerned do not originate from such an operation and if the document does not describe the specific identifying mark applied to each specimen". As it appears that this agreement is not always respected, the Conference or the Standing Committee should consider what action to take in cases where trade is authorized contrary to this agreement. [The Secretariat takes this opportunity to reiterate its opinion that the 'Register of captive-breeding operations for Appendix-I species' serves no useful purpose.]

- c) The Clearing House should be asked to advise the Standing Committee as to which body should consider how to deal with the problem that Management Authorities may be unaware of imports that have taken place when specimens are shipped by mail (seeds of cacti and orchids for example).
- d) With regard to the use of source codes on permits and in annual reports, the Animals and Plants Committees should take into considerationg the comments in the report from UNEP-WCMC when preparing their document for CoP14 regarding production systems.

SC54 Doc. 20 Annex 1

#### TERMS OF REFERENCE

### Review of trade in Appendix I plant and animal species

- 1. From the CITES trade database, produce summary tables of all records of trade in Appendix-I species for the years 1999-2003, indicating the taxon, the type of specimen, the quantity traded (including units of measurement), and the source and purpose codes.
- 2. Separate-out the data relating to captive-bred and artificially propagated specimens.
- 3. Regarding the data on trade under Article III (specimens declared as anything other than source 'C', 'D', or 'A' and presumed to be wild-taken), conduct an analysis in order to identify where possible:
  - a) species traded at levels that appear to UNEP-WCMC to give cause for concern about the wild population; and
  - b) indications of trade that could be commercial in nature (e.g. transactions declared as commercial or transactions involving large numbers of specimens).
- 4. Regarding the data on trade under the exemptions provided for in Article VII, paragraph 4, 5 or 7 (captive-bred and artificially propagated specimens with source 'A', 'C' and 'D'), conduct an analysis in order to:
  - a) identify indications of false declarations that the specimens were bred in captivity or artificially propagated [e.g. noteworthy levels of trade in taxa not commonly bred in captivity, taking into account AC16 Inf. 15 (list of commonly-bred Appendix-I species) and other appropriate sources];
  - b) identify indications that specimens of Appendix-I animal species produced in breeding operations not included in the Secretariat's register are being traded for commercial purposes; and
  - c) determine what conclusions can be drawn from the data indicating the levels of trade in specimens that were bred in captivity or artificially propagated (including conclusions regarding the levels of commercial and non-commercial trade).
- 5. Identify indications of trade that appears to be illegal (e.g. where the reported imports of a species into one country from another exceeds the reported level of exports, or where a permit number reported by the importing and exporting Parties refer to different species, source codes or quantities, or where there are other significant inconsistencies).
- 6. Prepare a report summarizing the findings indicated above and with explanations in each case and without reference to individual Parties, for consideration by the Standing Committee, at its 54th meeting.

#### REVIEW OF TRADE IN APPENDIX I ANIMAL AND PLANT SPECIES

A report prepared by the UNEP World Conservation Monitoring Centre under contract to the CITES Secretariat

#### Introduction

Article III of the Convention lays down the provisions that regulate trade in specimens of species included in Appendix I, and Article VII specifies possible exemptions and other special provisions relating to those rules. This report examines all trade in specimens of Appendix-I taxa traded between 1999 and 2003, as reflected by the data reported by the Parties in their annual reports, amounting to some 89,000 records for fauna and 43,000 records for flora. Attempts have been made to identify trade in wild specimens that may be unsustainable, and also to identify trade that could be commercial in nature, whether or not reported as such. Trade in specimens reportedly bred in captivity or artificially propagated has been examined to determine whether any such declaration is doubtful, taking account of the list of commonly-bred Appendix-I species contained in document AC16 Inf. 15, and other available sources. Analysis has been made of specimens likely to have originated in an operation included in the Secretariat's Register and detailed cross checking of export permit numbers has been carried out where possible indications of illegal trade have been detected.

# Part 1. Purpose codes

The exemptions in Article VII of the Convention relate to trade not being for primarily commercial purposes, as defined in Resolution Conf. 5.10. For this reason, the first stage of the analysis was to investigate the use of the reported purpose of the transaction. Fauna and flora have been considered separately. The preferred purpose codes to be used in annual reports, as specified in Resolution Conf. 12.3 (Rev. CoP13), are as follows:

Table 1. Recommended purpose codes for use in CITES annual reports

В	Breeding in captivity or artificial propagation
E	Educational
G	Botanical gardens
Н	Hunting trophies
L	Law enforcement / judicial / forensic
M	Medical (including biomedical research)
N	Reintroduction or introduction into the wild
Р	Personal
Q	Circuses and travelling exhibitions
S	Scientific
Т	Commercial trade
Z	Zoos

#### **FAUNA**

All of the purpose codes, with the obvious exception of G, have been used for fauna and the table below illustrates the relative importance, in terms of database records, of each of them. We have also examined records where the purpose of the transaction was not reported.

Table 2. Relative percentages of purpose codes for Appendix-I fauna trade records

Code	Percentage of App. I fauna records
Т	43.2
Р	17.0
Н	11.6
none	6.7
Q	5.4
S	5.2
Z	4.6
В	3.3
E	2.4
N	0.3
L	0.1
М	0.1

# Purpose code B – Breeding in captivity or artificial propagation

This code is partially interchangeable with 'Z', as many zoos support breeding programmes, and 'P', as many hobbyists seek to breed their animals, and it is not surprising therefore that a large proportion of the records involve zoo animals. In most of the transactions the numbers of animals involved is small and the great majority are captive-bred. Very few records involve trade from range States. All of the records involve live animals, eggs of live birds or scientific specimens such as sperm samples. No indication of commercial shipments of wild-sourced animals was encountered but captive-bred *Crocodylus porosus* and *C. siamensis* were reported being traded in very large numbers (> 75 000) which one might argue were commercial in nature and perhaps purpose code 'T' would have been equally or perhaps more appropriate.

# Purpose code E – Educational

This code is occasionally used in error for purpose code 'S', e.g. where scientific specimens such as blood and serum are involved. Most of the records however are of confiscated and pre-Convention items such as carvings of tortoiseshell, ivory and whalebone that would appear to be for training seminars and workshops. In many instances the return of the specimens after their use can be observed. No indication of commercial shipments of wild-sourced animals was encountered.

#### Purpose code H – Hunting trophies

The majority of records in this category involve cheetah, leopard and African elephant, with smaller quantities of mountain sheep and goats, rhinoceroses and crocodiles. No indication of commercial shipments of wild-sourced animals was encountered.

# Purpose code L – Law enforcement / judicial / forensic

This code is similar in concept to 'E', particularly where law enforcement might involve training, and mostly involved seized material having source code 'I'. No indication of commercial shipments of wild-sourced animals was encountered.

# Purpose codes M – Medical (including biomedical research) and S – Scientific

The code 'M' is frequently misused, often involving scientific specimens of species unlikely to be traded for medical or biomedical research such as lemurs, marine turtles, cetaceans, etc. For this reason the two purposes have been considered here together.

Nearly all of the records in this category appear to be correctly reported for scientific purposes and involve bones, eggs, feathers, hatchling turtles, hair, skin samples, specimens, teeth, etc. The exceptions are two records in 2001 involving 65 live captive-bred *Falco peregrinus* (one shipment) and 56 live

captive-bred *Chlamydotis undulata* (10 shipments). The trade was reported by the exporting country but not by the importer and in view of the purpose code used may possibly have involved scientific specimens rather than live animals.

#### Purpose code N – Reintroduction or introduction to the wild

All records of trade in this category involved live animals or live birds eggs and were for repatriation of seized animals, introduction from captive-breeding schemes or relocation of surplus animals. No indication of commercial shipments of wild-sourced animals was encountered.

# Purpose code Q - Circuses and travelling exhibitions

This category involves live circus animals such as bears, chimpanzees, elephants, leopards and tigers but also exhibition display items such as carvings and native handicrafts, many of them of pre-Convention origin. No indication of commercial shipments of wild-sourced animals was encountered.

# Purpose code T – Commercial trade

Many Appendix I trade records in this category are of specimens shipped for reasons other than commercial trade. These include hunting trophies, scientific specimens and circus and zoo animals. Ambergris, captive-bred falcons, parrots, exotic pheasants and fish (Scleropages formosus), pre-Convention carvings of ivory, rhinoceros horn and turtle-shell, and products of farmed crocodilians form the bulk of the remaining records. Although the possibility exists to launder wild-caught material through captive-breeding operations, it is difficult to find evidence for this through annual report data and in many instances reported exports/re-exports exceed reported imports as a result of the trade being reported on the basis of permits issued rather than the actual trade that occurred. The only suspect records encountered were of 100 captive-bred Eos histrio (one shipment in 2003) and 90 Probosciger aterrimus (several shipments between 1999 and 2001) reported by the importing countries but not by the countries of export. These do not necessarily indicate illegal trade (i.e. trade occurring without an export permit) but may well be instances, fairly common in trade in Appendix-I taxa, where an import permit has been issued as a prerequisite to an export permit (and reported on the basis of permits issued) but the export then failed to occur. It is not uncommon in such trade for the apparent import to be reported the year preceding the export. One wild-caught species that occurs regularly in commercial trade is Ara macao, however the exporting country has a reservation on its Appendix-I listing. During the five-year period under study, the exporter reported exporting 236 birds however five importing countries, that do not hold a reservation on the Appendix-I listing of this species, reported imports of 178 birds for commercial purposes (see also purpose code 'Z').

## Purpose code Z – Zoos

Records of animals traded for zoo purposes usually involve small numbers and few records involve wild-collected specimens from range States. None of the taxa reported as wild-collected give rise to concern about their wild populations. However for *Ara macao* the level of trade is such that one may suspect the imports are primarily commercial in nature. As noted above, the exporting country has a reservation on its Appendix-I listing and has reported exports of 52 birds for zoo purposes while the two countries of import have reported a total of 124 birds. Cross matching of trade records on the basis of export permit numbers indicates that some of the shipments reported by the importing countries as being for zoo purposes were reported by the exporter as being commercial in nature. Regarding the trade reported for captive-bred specimens of *Crocodylus porosus*, as was noted above for purpose code 'B', the high numbers involved might suggest that purpose code 'T' would be more appropriate.

## Purpose code blank

Many of the records in this category are from Parties that routinely omit to include information about the purpose of each transaction in their annual reports. These data have been carefully scrutinized and the purpose can usually be surmised from the taxon and type of specimen involved e.g. hunting trophies, scientific specimens, zoo animals etc. Information on the original purpose of import is rarely recorded for Customs seizures of which there are many, particularly involving Traditional Chinese Medicines (TCM) and tourist souvenirs.

Purpose codes 'H', 'M', 'N' and 'Z' have not been used for flora and the table below illustrates the relative volume, in terms of database records, of each purpose code reported. We have also examined records where the purpose of the transaction was not reported.

Table 3. Relative percentages of purpose codes for Appendix-I flora trade records

Code	Percentage of App. I flora records
Т	87.3
none	8.0
Р	2.7
В	1.0
G	0.3
S	0.3
E	0.1
L	0.1
Q	0.1

### Purpose code B – Breeding in captivity or artificial propagation

No records of trade in wild–collected material occurs in this category. Almost 70 % of the records with this purpose code were reported in 1999 with a further 22 % in 2000. This uneven distribution, allied to the fact that very few countries have used the code, suggests that its use is highly dependant on the interpretation of the person producing the annual report. From the volumes of plants being traded it appears that many of the records should probably show purpose code 'T'.

## Purpose codes E – Education and L – Law enforcement / judicial / forensic

There are very few records in this category and for some, cross matching of the export permit number reported by both importer and exporter suggest that 'T' would have been more appropriate. Other records indicate repatriation of seized material to the country of original export and specimens to be used for training purposes, etc.

### Purpose code G – Botanical gardens

Very little wild material is reported with this purpose code and most transactions are of small quantities. They appear to involve exchanges between botanic gardens although it is rare for further details to be shown in annual reports.

# Purpose code P – Personal

The only records of trade in wild-sourced material reported for personal purposes appear to relate to TCM and some carved specimens of *Dalbergia nigra*. Although much of the trade involves volumes that might be considered to be commercial in nature, particularly where *Encephalartos* species are involved, all is of artificially propagated specimens.

#### Purpose code Q – Circuses and travelling exhibitions

Many of these records appear to reflect exports to, and return from, plant exhibitions and further details of the exhibitions concerned are sometimes included in annual reports. Very little wild-collected material is involved.

## Purpose code S – Scientific

A very small number of wild-collected specimens, particularly seeds and dried herbarium samples, are recorded in this category. The remainder are artificially propagated specimens and in the small quantities one would expect.

## Purpose code T – Commercial

Although the vast majority of records of Appendix-I specimens of flora in trade indicate that the purpose was commercial, very few of the specimens are recorded as being wild-sourced material. The exceptions are some shipments of *Fitzroya cupressoides* for which the exporting country held a reservation at the time of export, and carvings, timber pieces and veneer of *Dalbergia nigra*, most, if not all of which, is pre-Convention. Much of the trade is in seeds of Appendix-I cacti and it is interesting to note that many more exports are reported than imports – there are over 13,000 export records but just 600 import records. One possible explanation for this is that the material is travelling by mail and the Management Authority of the importing country not being notified by the person importing them. As the specimens are artificially propagated and therefore treated as being in Appendix II there is no requirement for an import permit to be issued prior to granting of the export permit.

# Purpose code blank

As with animal taxa, most of the records in this category are from Parties that routinely omit to include the purpose of transactions in their annual reports, and from Customs seizures. Careful analysis of the data shows no commercial shipments of wild-collected specimens apart from three shipments of *Fitzroya cupressoides* in 2002 for which the exporting country held a reservation at the time of export. The trade was not reported by the countries of import so may not necessarily have taken place.

#### Part 2. Source codes

Article VII of the Convention directs that specimens of an animal species included in Appendix I bred in captivity for commercial purposes, or of a plant species included in Appendix I artificially propagated for commercial purposes, shall be deemed to be specimens of species included in Appendix II. Therefore second stage of the analysis investigated the use of the reported source of the material and once again fauna and flora have been considered separately. Having already investigated all terms and purpose codes in part 1 of the report it was decided, after the initial extraction of the data, to analyse only records having purpose code 'T' and term codes LIV (live), SEE (seed) and SKI (skins).

The preferred source codes, relating to the original source of the species being traded, for use in annual reports, as specified in Resolution Conf. 12.3 (Rev. CoP13), are as follows:

Table 4. Recommended source codes for use in CITES annual reports

Α	Plants that are artificially propagated in accordance with Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP13), paragraph a), as well as parts and derivatives thereof, exported under the provisions of Article VII, paragraph 5, of the Convention (specimens of species included in Appendix I that have been propagated artificially for non-commercial purposes and specimens of species included in Appendices II and III)
С	Animals bred in captivity in accordance with Resolution Conf. 10.16 (Rev.), as well as parts and derivatives thereof, exported under the provisions of Article VII, paragraph 5, of the Convention (specimens of species included in Appendix I that have been bred in captivity for non-commercial purposes and specimens of species included in Appendices II and III)
D	Appendix-I animals bred in captivity for commercial purposes and Appendix-I plants artificially propagated for commercial purposes, as well as parts and derivatives thereof, exported under the provisions of Article VII, paragraph 4, of the Convention
F	Animals born in captivity (F1 or subsequent generations) that do not fulfil the definition of 'bred in captivity' in Resolution Conf. 10.16 (Rev.), as well as parts and derivatives thereof

I	Confiscated or seized specimens
0	Pre-Convention specimens
R	Specimens originating from a ranching operation
U	Source unknown
W	Specimens taken from the wild

#### **FAUNA**

The table below indicates the relative importance of source codes used for specimens of fauna.

Table 5. Relative percentages of source codes for Appendix-I fauna trade records

Code	Percentage of App. I fauna records
W	23.9
0	22.7
D	19.3
С	18.9
ı	6.4
U	5.1
F	3.2
none	0.3
R	0.2

## Source codes C and D

Article VII paragraph 4 states that "specimens of an animal species included in Appendix I bred in captivity for commercial purposes ... shall be deemed to be specimens of species included in Appendix II". Resolution Conf. 10.16 (Rev.) provides definitions of captive breeding and Resolution Conf. 12.10 (Rev. CoP13) states that Parties should restrict imports of captive-bred specimens of Appendix-I species for primarily commercial purposes to those produced by operations included in the Secretariat's Register. At the time of writing (July 2006) the Register covered 119 operations breeding a total of only 22 species of animal. Between 1999 and 2003 there were 134 Appendix-I animal taxa for which there were records of trade where the purpose of the transaction was commercial and the source was either 'C' or 'D'. A breakdown of these records is given in the Table 6 below, where it is also noted whether the species is difficult to breed in captivity according to document Inf. AC.16.15 and whether operations for that species are listed in the Register.

# Source code F

As might be expected, most of the species for which the source code 'F' was used are also found in the list of source 'C' and 'D'. Additional species are *Cheirogaleus medius* (2 live in 2002), *Microcebus murinus* (2 live in 2002), *Hylobates agilis*, (1 live in 1999) *H. pileatus*, (1 live in 1999), *Puma concolor coryi* (3 live in 2001), *Elephas maximus* (2 live in 1999), *Capra falconeri* (1 live in 2002), *Harpya harpyja* (1 live in 2000), *Cyclura carinata* (2 live in 2001) and *Achatinella caesia* (4 live in 2003). From the taxa involved it would seem likely that most, if not all, were probably destined for zoos and none, apart from the three *Puma concolor coryi* came from range States.

## Source code I

This code has been used to indicate either specimens that were seized at the time of an attempt to import them illegally or specimens that were being imported having been seized in the country of consignment.

# Source code O

The records in this category refer to circus animals, personal items and antiques and for most it would seem that the purpose codes 'Q' or 'P' would appear to be more appropriate.

## Source code R

There were only 17 trade records of fauna where the reported source code was 'R' and the term code was either 'LIV' or 'SKI'. Apart from one shipment of 1000 live *Crocodylus niloticus*, and another of 30 live *Amazona ochrocephala auropalliata* for which it is almost certain that the export permit was issued prior to the Appendix-I listing of the species, the taxa involved are not commonly reported as being ranched and it is likely that the code has been used erroneously.

Table 6. Appendix-I animal taxa traded as live or skins where the source was reported as 'C' or 'D' and the purpose was commercial

Appendix I animal taxa reported in trade as source C or D	Registered operation?	Difficult to breed in captivity?	Comments
Eulemur fulvus		?	5 live 2000 probably zoo
Lemur catta		N	16 live 1999-2002 probably zoo
Varecia variegata		N	2 live 1999-2001 probably zoo
Callimico goeldii		N	4 live 2001 probably zoo
Callithrix aurita		N	10 live 2003 probably zoo
Leontopithecus chrysomela		N	22 live 1999-2002 probably zoo
Leontopithecus rosalia		N	7 live 2000-2003 probably zoo
Saguinus oedipus		N	Frequently in trade, probably zoo
Macaca silenus		?	6 live 1999 probably zoo
Mandrillus sphinx		N	7 live 1999-2000 probably zoo
Pygathrix roxellana		N	2 live 1999 probably zoo*
Hylobates lar		N	5 live 1999-2003 probably zoo*
Hylobates syndactylus		N	4 live 2001 probably zoo
Pan troglodytes		N	Frequently in trade, probably zoo or circus
Pongo pygmaeus		N	1 live 2001 probably zoo*
Ailurus fulgens		N	1 live 2001 probably zoo
Helarctos malayanus		?	1 live 2001 probably zoo*
Tremarctos ornatus		?	1 live 2001 probably zoo
Ursus arctos		?	3 live 2001 probably zoo*
Lutra lutra		Υ	2 live 1999 probably zoo*
Mustela nigripes		?	8 live 2000 probably zoo*
Acinonyx jubatus	YES	Υ	5 live and 1 skin <u>not</u> from registered operations, probably zoo and personal
Catopuma temminckii		Υ	2 live 1999 probably zoo*
Herpailurus yaguarondi		Υ	1 live 2001 probably zoo
Leopardus pardalis		?	3 live 2000-2003 probably zoo
Neofelis nebulosa		Υ	2 live 1999 probably zoo*
Oncifelis geoffroyi		Υ	6 live 1999-2002 probably zoo*
Panthera leo persica		Υ	1 live 2002 probably zoo
Panthera onca		?	15 live 1999-2002 probably zoo*
Panthera pardus		N	10 live199-2003 probably zoo
Panthera tigris		N	Frequently in trade, probably zoo or circus

Appendix I animal taxa reported in trade as source C or D	Registered operation?	Difficult to breed in captivity?	Comments
Prionailurus b. bengalensis		?	1 live 1999 probably zoo
Uncia uncia		N	5 live 1999 probably zoo
Loxodonta africana		?	1 live 2003 probably zoo*
Equus africanus		N	4 live 2002-2003 probably zoo
Equus grevyi		N	6 live 1999-2003 probably zoo or
			circus
Equus zebra		?	2 live 2002 probably zoo
Tapirus indicus		N	1 live 1999 probably zoo*
Ceratotherium simum cottoni		Υ	1 live 1999 probably zoo
Cervus duvaucelii		N	1 skin 1999 possible misidentification
Addax nasomaculatus		N	30 live 1999-2001
Capra falconeri		N	21 live 1999-2003 probably zoo
Oryx dammah		N	1 live 1999 probably zoo
Oryx leucoryx		N	5 live 2000-2002 probably zoo
Rhea pennata pennata		N	5 live 1999 probably zoo
Spheniscus humboldti		N	39 1999-2003 probably zoo*
Ciconia boyciana		N	3 live 1999-2001 probably zoo*
Anas laysanensis		N	26 live 1999-2002 probably zoo
Branta canadensis leucopareia		N	4 live 2001 probably zoo
Branta sandvicensis		N	Many in trade
Rhodonessa caryophyllacea		?	5 live 2002 possible misidentification
Vultur gryphus		N	4 live 2002 possible re-introduction
Aquila heliaca		?	2 live in 2000 probably personal
Haliaeetus albicilla		N	4 live 2001-2002 probably zoo*
Haliaeetus leucocephalus		N	12 live 1999-2003 probably zoo*
Falco jugger	YES	N	Many in trade
Falco pelegrinoides	YES	N	Many in trade
Falco peregrinus	YES	N	Many in trade
Falco rusticolus	YES	N	Many in trade
Catreus wallichii		?	2 live 2001 probably zoo
Crossoptilon crossoptilon		N	Many in trade
Crossoptilon mantchuricum		N	Many in trade
Lophophorus impejanus		N	Many in trade
Lophura edwardsi		N	Many in trade
Lophura imperialis		N	Many in trade
Lophura swinhoi		N	Many in trade
Polyplectron emphanum		N	Many in trade
Rheinardia ocellata		N	4 live 2001 probably zoo*
Syrmaticus ellioti		N	Many in trade
Syrmaticus mikado		N	Many in trade
Tragopan caboti	YES	N	Many in trade
Grus japonensis		N	8 live 1999-2002 probably zoo
Grus monacha		?	2 live 1999 probably zoo*
Grus vipio		N	5 live 1999 probably zoo*
Rhynochetos jubatus		?	1 live 1999 probably zoo
Chlamydotis undulata		?	12 live 2000 probably zoo*

Appendix I animal taxa reported in trade as source C or D	Registered operation?	Difficult to breed in captivity?	Comments
Caloenas nicobarica	YES	N	Many in trade mostly from registered operations
Amazona barbadensis		N	26 live 1999-2003 probably zoo
Amazona brasiliensis		?	21 live 1999-2003 probably zoo
Amazona leucocephala		N	Regularly in trade
Amazona o. auropalliata		no information	Regularly in trade
Amazona o. oratrix		no information	Regularly in trade
Amazona pretrei		?	21 live 1999-2003 probably zoo*
Amazona rhodocorytha		Υ	18 live 1999-2003 probably zoo
Amazona tucumana		N	14 live 1999-2003 probably zoo
Amazona vinacea		N	> 50 live 1999-2003
Amazona viridigenalis		N	20 live 1999-2003
Anodorhynchus hyacinthinus		N	Regularly in trade
Ara ambigua		N	Regularly in trade
Ara glaucogularis		N	36 live 1999-2003
Ara macao		N	Regularly in trade
Ara militaris		N	> 50 live 1999-2003
Ara rubrogenys		N	> 50 live 1999-2003
Cacatua goffini		N	32 live 1999-2003
Cacatua haematuropygia		N	8 live 2003
Cacatua moluccensis	YES	N	Regularly traded from registered operations
Cyanoramphus novaezelandiae		N	Many in trade
Eos histrio	YES	?	20 live 1999-2001, some from registered operation (also see text)
Eunymphicus cornutus		N	1 live 2001 probably zoo
Guarouba guarouba	YES	N	Regularly traded from registered operations
Pionopsitta pileata		Υ	6 live 2000-2001
Probosciger aterrimus		?	Regularly in trade (also see text)
Propyrrhura couloni		no information	28 live 2003*
Propyrrhura maracana		N	Regularly in trade
Psephotus chrysopterygius		?	26 live 1999-2001
Psephotus dissimilis		N	Regularly in trade
Psephotus pulcherrimus		?	6 live in 2002
Pyrrhura cruentata		N	Regularly in trade
Carduelis cucullata		N	Regularly in trade
Leucopsar rothschildi		N	27 live 1999-2001*
Geochelone nigra		N	2 live 2001 probably zoo*
Geochelone radiata		N	13 live 2003 probably zoo
Testudo kleinmanni		no information	13 live 2000-2003 probably zoo
Alligator sinensis	YES	N	Regularly traded from registered operations

Appendix I animal taxa reported in trade as source C or D	Registered operation?	Difficult to breed in captivity?	Comments	
Crocodylus acutus	YES	N	Regularly traded from registered operations	
Crocodylus cataphractus		?	19 live 2000-2003 probably zoo	
Crocodylus moreletii	YES	N	Regularly traded from registered operations	
Crocodylus niloticus	YES	N	Regularly traded but not from the registered operation	
Crocodylus porosus	YES	N	Regularly traded from registered operations	
Crocodylus siamensis	YES	N	Regularly traded from registered operations	
Osteolaemus tetraspis		N	23 live 2000-2003 probably zoo	
Brachylophus fasciatus		?	7 live 2003 probably zoo	
Cyclura cornuta		?	5 live 2001 probably zoo	
Cyclura cychlura		?	20 live 1999 probably zoo but possibly misidentification	
Python molurus molurus		no information	9 live 1999-2002 probably zoo	
Acrantophis dumerili		N	24 live 1999-2003 probably zoo	
Acrantophis madagascariensis		N	37 live 1999-2003 probably zoo	
Boa constrictor occidentalis		?	11 live 1999-2003 probably zoo	
Epicrates inornatus		Υ	21 live 2002 probably zoo	
Epicrates subflavus		?	20 live 2001-2002 probably zoo	
Sanzinia madagascariensis		?	48 live 1999-2003 probably zoo	
Dyscophus antongilii		?	10 live 2002 probably zoo	
Acipenser brevirostrum		?	900 live 1999 probably breeding	
Scleropages formosus	YES	N	Regularly traded from registered operations	
* denotes that some or all of the trade involved a range State				

# Source code U

Apart from eight live specimens of *Struthio camelus* in 2002 and 210 live specimens of *Crocodylus porosus* in 2000, this category appears to involve mostly long-lived species and skins where both the country of origin and source of the material is unknown and where perhaps the source code 'O' (pre-Convention) might have been more appropriate. Some may involve personal possessions rather than commercial trade.

## Source code W

The majority of records in this category have an incorrect purpose code as they involve hunting trophies, scientific specimens and zoo animals. Exceptions are 50 live *Amazona ochrocephala auropalliata* (for which it is almost certain that the export permit was issued prior to Appendix I listing), and *Ara macao* for which the exporting country holds a reservation.

Table 7 below indicates the relative importance of source codes used for specimens of flora.

Table 7. Relative percentages of source codes for Appendix-I flora trade records

Code	Percentage of App. I flora records
D	47.2
Α	43.8
I	4.2
0	3.7
W	0.7
U	0.2
none	0.1

## Source codes A and D

Article VII, paragraph 4, of the Convention states that specimens of plant species included in Appendix I artificially propagated for commercial purposes shall be deemed to be specimens of species included in Appendix II. Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP13) provides definitions of 'artificially propagated'. Resolution Conf. 9.19 (Rev. CoP13) provides guidelines for the registration of nurseries to be included in the Secretariat's Register of nurseries. At the time of writing (July 2006), the Register contains 101 operations in eight countries. A breakdown of records reported as source 'A' or 'D', which together comprise 91 % of Appendix-I plant records for the period under review, is given in the table below, which also notes whether registered nurseries exist for those species.

Table 8. Appendix-I plant taxa traded as live or seeds where the source was reported as 'A' or 'D' and the purpose was commercial

Appendix I plant taxa reported in trade as source A or D	Registered nursery?	Comments
Agave parviflora	YES	
Nolina interrata		No trade from range States
Pachypodium ambongense		No trade from range States
Pachypodium baronii	YES	
Pachypodium decaryi	YES	
Araucaria araucana	YES	
Ariocarpus agavoides	YES	
Ariocarpus bravoanus	YES	
Ariocarpus fissuratus	YES	
Ariocarpus kotschoubeyanus	YES	
Ariocarpus retusus	YES	
Ariocarpus scaphirostris	YES	
Astrophytum asterias	YES	
Aztekium ritteri	YES	
Coryphantha werdermannii	YES	
Discocactus bahiensis	YES	
Discocactus ferricola		No trade from range States
Discocactus heptacanthus	YES	
Discocactus horstii	YES	
Discocactus placentiformis	YES	
Discocactus pseudoinsignis	YES	
Discocactus zehntneri	YES	

Appendix I plant taxa reported in trade as source A or D	Registered nursery?	Comments
Echinocereus ferreirianus	YES	
Echinocereus schmollii	YES	
Escobaria minima	YES	
Escobaria sneedii	YES	
Mammillaria pectinifera	YES	
Mammillaria solisioides	YES	
Melocactus conoideus	YES	
Melocactus deinacanthus		No trade from range States
Melocactus glaucescens	YES	
Melocactus paucispinus		No trade from range States
Obregonia denegrii	YES	
Pediocactus bradyi	YES	
Pediocactus knowltonii	YES	
Pediocactus paradinei	YES	
Pediocactus peeblesianus	YES	
Pediocactus sileri	YES	
Pelecyphora aselliformis	YES	
Pelecyphora strobiliformis	YES	
Sclerocactus brevihamatus	YES	
Sclerocactus erectocentrus	YES	
Sclerocactus glaucus	YES	
Sclerocactus mariposensis	YES	
Sclerocactus mesae-verdae	YES	
Sclerocactus nyensis		No trade from range States
Sclerocactus papyracanthus	YES	
Sclerocactus pubispinus	YES	
Sclerocactus unguispinus		No trade from range States
Sclerocactus wrightiae	YES	
Strombocactus disciformis	YES	
Turbinicarpus alonsoi	YES	
Turbinicarpus beguinii	YES	
Turbinicarpus bonatzii	YES	
Turbinicarpus booleanus	YES	
Turbinicarpus gielsdorfianus	YES	
Turbinicarpus hoferi	YES	
Turbinicarpus horripilus	YES	
Turbinicarpus jauernigii	YES	
Turbinicarpus knuthianus	YES	
Turbinicarpus laui	YES	
Turbinicarpus lophophoroides	YES	
Turbinicarpus mandragora	YES	
Turbinicarpus x mombergeri	YES	
Turbinicarpus pseudomacrochele	YES	
Turbinicarpus pseudopectinatus	YES	
Turbinicarpus rioverdensis	YES	
Turbinicarpus roseiflorus	YES	
Turbinicarpus saueri	YES	

Turbinicarpus schmiedickeanus YES Turbinicarpus subterraneus YES Turbinicarpus swobodae YES Turbinicarpus valdezianus YES	
Turbinicarpus swobodae YES	
'	
Turbinicarnus valdezianus VFS	
Talibilitioal pub valuozialiub   TED	
Turbinicarpus viereckii YES	
Turbinicarpus ysabelae YES	
Turbinicarpus zaragozae YES	
Uebelmannia buiningii YES	
Uebelmannia gummifera YES	
Uebelmannia pectinifera YES	
Fitzroya cupressoides No trade from range States	
Pilgerodendron uviferum No trade from range States	
Cycas beddomei No trade from range States	
Euphorbia ambovombensis YES	
Euphorbia capsaintemariensis YES	
Euphorbia cremersii No trade from range States	
Euphorbia cylindrifolia YES	
Euphorbia decaryi YES	
Euphorbia francoisii YES	
Euphorbia moratii YES	
Euphorbia quartziticola No trade from range States	
Euphorbia tulearensis No trade from range States	
Fouquieria fasciculata YES	
Aloe albida 81 live from range States	
Aloe albiflora No trade from range States	
Aloe bellatula YES	
Aloe compressa YES	
Aloe descoingsii YES	
Aloe fragilis YES	
Aloe haworthioides YES	
Aloe laeta YES	
Aloe parallelifolia YES	
Aloe parvula YES	
Aloe pillansii YES	
Aloe polyphylla YES	
Aloe rauhii YES	
Aloe versicolor 20 live from range States in 2000	
Aloe vossii 90 live from range States in 2002	
Nepenthes khasiana No trade from range States	
Cattleya trianaei YES	
Dendrobium cruentum Regularly traded from range States	
Laelia jongheana Regularly traded from range States	
Laelia lobata YES	
Paphiopedilum acmodontum YES	
Paphiopedilum adductum YES	
Paphiopedilum appletonianum YES	
Paphiopedilum argus YES	

Appendix I plant taxa reported in trade as source A or D	Registered nursery?	Comments
Paphiopedilum armeniacum	YES	
Paphiopedilum barbatum	YES	
Paphiopedilum barbigerum	YES	
Paphiopedilum bellatulum	YES	
Paphiopedilum bougainvilleanum	YES	
Paphiopedilum bullenianum		No trade from range States
Paphiopedilum callosum	YES	
Paphiopedilum charlesworthii	YES	
Paphiopedilum ciliolare	YES	
Paphiopedilum concolor	YES	
Paphiopedilum dayanum	YES	
Paphiopedilum delenatii	YES	
Paphiopedilum dianthum	YES	
Paphiopedilum druryi	YES	
Paphiopedilum emersonii	YES	
Paphiopedilum exul	YES	
Paphiopedilum fairrieanum	YES	
Paphiopedilum x fanaticum		No trade from range States
Paphiopedilum fowliei	YES	
Paphiopedilum gigantifolium		No trade from range States
Paphiopedilum glanduliferum	YES	
Paphiopedilum glaucophyllum	YES	
Paphiopedilum godefroyae	YES	
Paphiopedilum gratrixianum	YES	
Paphiopedilum haynaldianum	YES	
Paphiopedilum helenae		No trade from range States
Paphiopedilum hennisianum	YES	
Paphiopedilum henryanum		No trade from range States
Paphiopedilum hirsutissimum	YES	
Paphiopedilum hookerae	YES	
Paphiopedilum insigne	YES	
Paphiopedilum javanicum	YES	
Paphiopedilum kolopakingii		No trade from range States
Paphiopedilum lawrenceanum	YES	
Paphiopedilum liemianum	YES	
Paphiopedilum lowii	YES	
Paphiopedilum malipoense	YES	
Paphiopedilum mastersianum	YES	
Paphiopedilum micranthum	YES	
Paphiopedilum niveum	YES	
Paphiopedilum ooii		No trade from range States
Paphiopedilum papuanum		No trade from range States
Paphiopedilum parishii	YES	
Paphiopedilum philippinense	YES	
Paphiopedilum primulinum	YES	
Paphiopedilum purpuratum	YES	
Paphiopedilum randsii		No trade from range States

Appendix I plant taxa reported in trade as source A or D	Registered nursery?	Comments
Paphiopedilum rothschildianum	YES	
Paphiopedilum sanderianum	YES	
Paphiopedilum sangii		No trade from range States
Paphiopedilum schoseri		No trade from range States
Paphiopedilum spicerianum	YES	
Paphiopedilum stonei	YES	
Paphiopedilum sukhakulii	YES	
Paphiopedilum supardii		No trade from range States
Paphiopedilum superbiens	YES	
Paphiopedilum tigrinum		No trade from range States
Paphiopedilum tonsum		No trade from range States
Paphiopedilum urbanianum		No trade from range States
Paphiopedilum venustum	YES	
Paphiopedilum victoria-mariae	YES	
Paphiopedilum victoria-regina		No trade from range States
Paphiopedilum vietnamense		No trade from range States
Paphiopedilum villosum	YES	
Paphiopedilum violascens		No trade from range States
Paphiopedilum wardii	YES	
Peristeria elata	YES	
Phragmipedium besseae	YES	
Phragmipedium boissierianum		Regularly traded from range States
Phragmipedium caricinum	YES	
Phragmipedium caudatum	YES	
Phragmipedium hirtzii	YES	
Phragmipedium klotzschianum		Some trade from range States
Phragmipedium lindenii	YES	
Phragmipedium lindleyanum		No trade from range States
Phragmipedium longifolium	YES	
Phragmipedium pearcei		Regularly traded from range States
Phragmipedium richteri		No trade from range States
Phragmipedium sargentianum	YES	
Phragmipedium schlimii	YES	
Phragmipedium vittatum		150 live from range State 2000-2002
Phragmipedium wallisii	YES	
Renanthera imschootiana		No trade from range States
Vanda coerulea	YES	
Sarracenia oreophila		No trade from range States
Stangeria eriopus		Regularly traded from range States
Ceratozamia hildae		No trade from range States
Ceratozamia kuesteriana		No trade from range States
Ceratozamia latifolia		No trade from range States
Ceratozamia matudae		2 live from range States in 1999
Ceratozamia mexicana		No trade from range States
Ceratozamia microstrobila		No trade from range States
Ceratozamia miqueliana		No trade from range States
Ceratozamia norstogii		No trade from range States

Appendix I plant taxa reported in trade as source A or D	Registered nursery?	Comments
Chigua bernalii		3 live from range States in 2002
Chigua restrepoi		5 live from range States in 2001-2002
Encephalartos aemulans		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos altensteinii		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos arenarius		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos barteri		6 live from range States in 2003
Encephalartos brevifoliatus		4 live from range States 2001-2003
Encephalartos bubalinus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos caffer		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos cerinus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos chimanimaniensis		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos concinnus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos cupidus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos cycadifolius		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos dolomiticus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos dyerianus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos equatorialis		4 live from range States 2000-2001
Encephalartos eugene-maraisii		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos ferox		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos friderici-guilielmi		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos ghellinckii		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos gratus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos heenanii		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos hildebrandtii		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos hirsutus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos horridus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos humilis		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos inopinus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos ituriensis		No trade from range States
Encephalartos kisambo		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos laevifolius		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos lanatus	YES	
Encephalartos latifrons		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos laurentianus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos lebomboensis		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos lehmannii		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos longifolius		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos manikensis		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos middelburgensis		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos msinga		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos munchii		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos natalensis		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos ngoyanus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos nubimontanus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos paucidentatus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos poggei		4 live from range States in 2003
Encephalartos princeps		Regularly traded from range States

Appendix I plant taxa reported in trade as source A or D	Registered nursery?	Comments
Encephalartos pterogonus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos schaijesii		200 seeds from range States in 2003 (reported by importer)
Encephalartos sclavoi		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos sentica		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos septentrionalis		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos tegulaneus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos transvenosus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos trispinosus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos turneri		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos umbeluziensis		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos villosus		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos whitelockii		Regularly traded from range States
Encephalartos woodii		Regularly traded from range States
Microcycas calocoma		No trade from range States

## Source code I

Trade reported as 'LIV' or 'SEE' with purpose code 'T' and source code 'I' was only reported by three Parties and appears to comprise seizures by Customs authorities. The quantities involved were generally very small.

### Source code O

No trade in pre-Convention seeds or live material has been recorded between 1999 and 2003. The only records were of trade in wood and carvings of *Dalbergia nigra*.

## Source code U

Trade records in this category amounted to 80 live specimens exported from non-range States. Consequently source 'A' or 'D' would have been more appropriate.

#### Source code W

With the possible exception of 200 live *Paphiopedilum sanderianum* reported as an export in 2000 from a range State to a country not party to the Convention, range States are not involved. This suggests that the trade is probably in artificially propagated specimens designated 'W' in error.

# Part 3. Discussion

Despite investigating over 130,000 trade records, no instances were found where the trade gave cause for concern about the wild populations. Most of the individual records of trade related to small numbers of specimens, the larger quantities being taxa that are readily bred in captivity or artificially propagated. Although a number of anomalous records were encountered, most appeared to be the result of carelessness in annual report compilation. We have already drawn attention in the text to some of these and reiterate that the shipments involving *Falco peregrinus*, *Chlamydotis undulata*, *Eos histrio* and *Probosciger aterrimus*, if they indeed occurred as reported, may have been in contravention of the Convention. Similarly, imports of *Ara macao* are of sufficient volume to suggest that they are commercial in nature and, although the exporting country for this species holds a reservation on the Appendix-I listing of the species, the countries reporting the imports do not.

Attention has also been drawn to the problem for importing countries, of reporting imports of seeds of artificially propagated cacti and orchids if they are shipped by mail as, being treated as Appendix-II specimens by the exporting country, they would not normally require the prior issuance of an import permit.

Resolution Conf. 12.10 (Rev. CoP13) invites Parties to reject documents granted under Article VII, paragraph 4, of the Convention, if the animal specimens concerned did not originate from an operation listed in the Secretariat's Register or from a species that has not been declared as bred in captivity by a registered operation. However, given the small number of registered captive breeding operations and taxa, it is not surprising that most of the trade appears to come from unregistered sources. The exceptions perhaps are for *Scleropages formosus* and some crocodilians. Furthermore, it is rare for annual reports to declare that registered captive breeding operations were the source of the material so even if the trade emanates from a country with such an operation it is usually impossible to determine this. A similar situation exists for plants in that only eight countries have registered nurseries so most of the trade, although quite clearly in artificially propagated material (and reported as such), is from unregistered facilities.

The analysis has highlighted the importance of accurately reporting the source of the material and the purpose of each transaction but has also noted a certain ambiguity of interpretation that allows different codes to be used for the same transaction. For example, the distinction between 'Medical (including biomedical research)' and 'Scientific' is obscure; a museum specimen could be for both educational and scientific purposes; a hunting trophy is also a personal possession. Similarly the code 'C' has been traditionally used for 'bred in captivity' long before the distinction between 'for commercial purposes' and 'for non-commercial purposes' was made. The introduction of code 'D', without specifically linking it to material produced by operations listed in the Secretariat's Register, produces further possibilities for confusion of the reporting Parties and it should perhaps be noted that this code is frequently used in error for Appendix-II taxa.