## **RESULTS OF GLOBAL-TWIX QUESTIONNAIRE**

Please find below the results of the GLOBAL-TWIX questionnaires which you all kindly filled in several months ago. Your answers are summarised in the tables, and specific comments made are highlighted in green.

These results will be submitted to the CITES Secretariat in the near future. If you have any comments or questions, <u>please get back to me before the 13<sup>th</sup> of April 2011</u>.

# Many thanks again for your participation!

### Aim of the project

1) The EU-TWIX Advisory Group and EIA advised to work with existing regional systems/create regional systems first, and that these regional systems may feed a global system. Do you think that this is a desired option?

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: The EU-TWIX experience shows that enforcement agencies need to be encouraged by the Administrator to be involved and submit data (the Administrator sends reminders when necessary, shares the results of analyses with users so that they can see something coming out of the systems etc.). The mailing list associated with the EU-TWIX database also reminds officials about the database on a daily basis. The EU-TWIX system (database and mailing list) may easily be replicated in other regions than Europe, and such regional systems may feed the one single, global database. This option needs to be considered carefully as regional systems may be more manageable than one single global system - in early stages at least.)

We should aim to work with regional systems first

We should work towards a global system from the onset

Answers	Regional systems first	Global system from the onset
NZ CITES MA	X	
German CITES MA	X	
INTERPOL	X	X
WCO		X
TRAFFIC	X	
USFW		X
UNEP-WCMC		X
VS (EU-TWIX)	X	
СТ	X	

# Additional comments:

2) What should the aim of Global-TWIX database be?

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: EU-TWIX data are analysed regularly and results are presented to European enforcement officials. Besides, officials may access the database online anytime to view and/or extract data.)

Storing data for statistical analyses of illegal trade trends at world level

Real-time use/viewing of data by information by officials

Other

Please specify:

Answers	Statistical analyses	Real time	Other
NZ CITES MA	X	X	
German CITES MA	X	X	
INTERPOL		X	Х
WCO	X	X	Х
TRAFFIC	X		
USFW	X	X	Х
UNEP-WCMC	X	X	Х
VS (EU-TWIX)	X	Х	
СТ	X	X	

Additional comments:

# Administrating staff

3) Would the Global-TWIX database require a dedicated staff (for the maintenance and running of the system, data transfer when necessary, quality check of the data etc.)?

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: there is currently 1.5 staff running the EU-TWIX system (database and mailing list); one full-time staff is required to run the EU-TWIX database. A total of 26 EU countries currently report data to the system.)

Yes

If yes, how many staff do you think would be required to run the system?:

No

Answers	YES	NO
NZ CITES MA	1 per region	
German CITES MA	X	
INTERPOL	X	
WCO	X	
TRAFFIC	1	
USFW	X	
UNEP-WCMC		Х
VS (EU-TWIX MANAGER)	1	
СТ	2	

### Additional comments:

4) Which agency would manage the Global-TWIX database?

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: EU-TWIX is a joint project of the Belgian Federal Police, Customs and CITES Management Authority, and TRAFFIC Europe. The system is currently managed by TRAFFIC Europe on behalf of the four project partners. Please note that the CITES Expert Enforcement Group agreed that GLOBAL-TWIX ought to be run by an international and intergovernmental body.)

CITES Secretariat	
WCO	
INTERPOL	
UNEP-WCMC	
TRAFFIC	
Another NGO	
Other	
Please specify:	

Answers	CITES	WCO	INTERPOL	UNEP-	TRAFFIC	Another	Other
	Secretariat			WCMC		NGO	
NZ CITES MA				Х	Х		
German CITES MA		Х	Х	Х			
INTERPOL			Х				
WCO	Х	Х	Х				
TRAFFIC	Х						
USFW	Х				Х		
UNEP-WCMC				Х			
VS (EU-TWIX)		Х		Х	Х		
СТ	Х	Х			Х		

Additional comments:

### Participating agencies and access to the database

5) How would the Global-TWIX database be accessed by users?

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: The EU-TWIX database currently holds over 30,000 seizures data and is currently available online for officials who have personal access codes to access the system. Data may be extracted and pasted into Excel for analysis.)

Online (system allowing users to extract and enter data)

Data should be sent periodically by the Administrator to officials

Other

Please specify:

Answers	Online	Administrator	Other
NZ CITES MA	Х		
German CITES MA	Х		
INTERPOL	Х		
WCO	Х	X	
TRAFFIC	Х		
USFW	Х		
UNEP-WCMC	Х		
VS (EU-TWIX)	Х		
СТ	Х		

### Additional comments:

### 6) Which agencies should have access to the GLOBAL-TWIX database?

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: Currently the following agencies have access to EU-TWIX: CITES MA's, Customs, Police, Environmental Inspection Services, Interpol, Europol, WCO, the CITES Secretariat, and relevant staff from the European Commission. Some of these agencies do not currently submit data to the system.)

Only agencies contributing data	
Or the following agencies specifically:	
CITES Management Authorities	
CITES Scientific Authorities	
Police	
Customs	
Environ. Inspection Services	
CITES Secretariat	
	3

WCO	
INTERPOL	
EUROPOL	
UNODC	
UNEP-WCMC	
NGO's	
Other	

Please specify:

Answers	CITE S MA	CIT ES SA	Poli ce	Cus tom s	Insp Ser v.	CIT ES Sec	WC O	INT ERP OL	EUR OP OL	UN OD C	UNE P- WC MC	NG O	Oth er
NZ CITES MA	Х			Х		Х	Х	Х					
German CITES	Х		Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х				
MA													
INTERPOL	Х		Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х					
WCO	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х		Х
TRAFFIC	Х		Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х			
USFW													
UNEP-WCMC													
VS (EU-TWIX)	Х		Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х			
CT	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х		Х		

### Additional comments:

# Content of database and use

### 7) What type of data should be gathered in the GLOBAL-TWIX database?

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: EU-TWIX currently holds most seizures made by EU enforcement authorities, *i.e. there is some minor filtering of the incoming data using the same 'filtering thresholds' as WCO.* When analyses are carried out, data can easily be sorted in Excel and unwanted data (e.g. small cases) may be taken out if needed.)

All seizures data

 $\square$ 

Only commercial cases (i.e. seizures excluding 'tourist souvenirs' cases)

Large cases only (N.B. thresholds would need to be set for this)

Other

Please specify:

Answers	All	Commercial	Large cases	Other
NZ CITES MA	Х			
German CITES MA		Х		
INTERPOL	Х			
WCO	Х	Х		
TRAFFIC	Х			
USFW	Х			
UNEP-WCMC				Х
VS (EU-TWIX)	Х			
СТ	Х			

### 8) What fields should be included in the GLOBAL-TWIX database?

Please open the attached Excel table entitled 'Annex 1\_fields' and select the fields which you would like to see featuring in the GLOBAL-TWIX database (the fields suggested in the table are those currently featuring in the EU-TWIX database): How to use this table?

# I. SHEET 1: 'FIELDS'

a) According to the <u>example provided in row 4 ('example of selection')</u>, please put a **'1'** in the cell under the field if you would like to keep this field;

### OR

Put a '0' in the cell under the field if you suggest NOT to keep this field.

### **IMPORTANT:**

a) Please delete the example before filling in your choices;

b) Some fields have an (\*) next to them and are highlighted in lighter green. There are the <u>fields for</u> which some options are available to users when they want to extract or enter data. You will see the options available for these fields on sheet 2 'Options for fields'.

### II. SHEET 2: 'OPTIONS FOR FIELDS'

b) If you would like to suggest deletions/deletions/rewording of those options, please strike through the option which you would like to delete and highlight the cell in red;

Write in the new options which you would like to suggest and highlight these in green

An example is shown to you under the field 'Direction' (column R). <u>Please delete this before filling in your suggestions.</u>

9) The fields in the attached table which you just reviewed currently do not include 'enforcement effort' (for example, the number of seizures made in a given country reflects illegal trade trends in this country but also the enforcement effort put in by the agencies). Do you think that a measure of enforcement effort should be recorded in GLOBAL-TWIX?

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: Enforcement effort is currently not recorded in EU-TWIX but this is sometimes that is being considered for the future.)

 $\square$ 

Yes, enforcement effort should be recorded

No, enforcement effort should not be recorded

Answers	YES	NO
NZ CITES MA		Х
German CITES MA		Х
INTERPOL		Х
WCO		
TRAFFIC	Х	
USFW	Х	
UNEP-WCMC	Х	
VS (EU-TWIX)	Х	
СТ	Х	

### Additional comments:

### 10) Should the database contain nominal information?

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: The EU-TWIX database does not currently hold any nominal information because this is not an option from a legal point of view.)

Yes

Answers	YES	NO
NZ CITES MA		Х
German CITES MA	X	
INTERPOL	X	
WCO	X	
TRAFFIC		Х
USFW	X	
UNEP-WCMC	X	
VS (EU-TWIX)		Х
CT	X	Х

Additional comments:

11) Should the GLOBAL-TWIX database contain additional information to seizures data such as the contact details of rescue centres, forensic laboratories, wildlife experts and prices of specimens in trade?

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: Besides gathering seizures data, the EU-TWIX database also holds four directories which contains the contact details of rescue centres located in Europe, of European wildlife experts to aid with identification of seized specimens, of forensic laboratories to provide analyses, and the average prices of specimens in illegal trade.)

No

Yes, but these should only feature in regional databases feeding GLOBAL-TWIX as these directories are only of regional interest (see question 1)

If yes, which inventories should it hold?:

Rescue centres	
----------------	--

Forensic laboratories

Wildlife experts

Prices of specimens in trade

Another inventory

Please specify:

Answers	Νο	Yes, but only in Regional databases	Centres	Laboratories	Experts	Prices	Other
NZ CITES MA		Х					
German CITES MA		Х					
INTERPOL			Х	Х	Х	Х	
WCO			Х	Х	Х	Х	
TRAFFIC		Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	
USFW	Х						
UNEP-WCMC			Х	Х	X	Х	
VS (EU-TWIX)		Х	Х	Х	X	Х	
СТ			Х	Х	Х	Х	Guides

# 12) In relation to the copyright/authorisation to use the data, could GLOBAL-TWIX data be shared beyond the circle of users?

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: EU-TWIX data are accessible by users who have personal access codes only. However, data may be shared with enforcement colleagues who do not necessarily have access to the database and results may be presented within the broader agency. However, EU-TWIX data may not be made public; this may be done only after having sought the authorisation of the agency which submitted the data in question in the first place).

1- Data used and analysed by users with access codes only

2- Data and results of analyses may be shared by users with their colleagues

3- Data and results of analyses may be made public but after the approval of the agency which submitted the data in question in the first place

4- Data and results of analyses may be made public without any approval

Answers	1	2	3	4
NZ CITES MA	Х	X		
German CITES MA	Х	Х		
INTERPOL		X	X	
WCO		X	X	
TRAFFIC		X	X	
USFW			X	
UNEP-WCMC			X	
VS (EU-TWIX)		X	X	
СТ		Х	Х	

### Additional comments:

13) Do you already have suggestions about the software that should be using to store GLOBAL-TWIX data?

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: EU-TWIX data are currently stored in 'ACCESS' (using 'ACCESS' is an advantage as WCO data are also stored in ACCESS and this facilitates data transfer, but this made the establishment of the website difficult as ACCESS is a complex/heavy system for this purpose).

'ACCESS'		
'ORACLE'		
'KIRIX STRATA' (database-linkin	ng technology/interface)	
Other		
Please specify:		

Answers	ACCESS	ORACLE	KIRIX STRATA	Other
NZ CITES MA			X	
German CITES MA				
INTERPOL				I2 Platform
WCO				
TRAFFIC				I2 Platform
USFW		Х		MYSQL PHP
UNEP-WCMC				
VS (EU-TWIX)				
СТ				MYSQL PHP

14) Should the GLOBAL-TWIX database be associated with a global mailing list? (please note that such global mailing list, ENVIRONET, which is run by WCO, already exists)

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: As noted above, the mailing list associated with the EU-TWIX database reminds officials about the database daily and is partially responsible for the success of the database.)

Yes		
No		

Answers	YES	NO
NZ CITES MA	X	
German CITES MA	X (but regional first)	
INTERPOL	X	
WCO		
TRAFFIC	X (regional only)	
USFW	X	
UNEP-WCMC	X	Х
VS (EU-TWIX)	X	
СТ	X	

### Additional comments:

### 15) Do you think that GLOBAL-TWIX Focal Points should be identified in all participating countries?

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: Each enforcement agency in Europe taking part to EU-TWIX has an 'EU-TWIX' Focal Point, who is generally aware of EU-TWIX issues, decides which staff in their agency should have access to the EU-TWIX database, and is the privileged person of contact for the Administrator. These Focal Points represent a network throughout Europe and their contact details are shared amongst all EU-TWIX users so that officials know whom to contact if they are dealing with a case involving another European country.)

Yes			]
No		Г	1

Answers	YES	NO
NZ CITES MA	X	
German CITES MA	X	
INTERPOL	X	
WCO		
TRAFFIC	X	
USFW	X	
UNEP-WCMC		
VS (EU-TWIX)	X	
СТ	X	

### Additional comments:

### Logistics of data transfer

# 16) How should data be transferred to the GLOBAL-TWIX database?

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: The seizures data of Customs agencies of 23 of 27 EU countries are transferred to the EU-TWIX database via WCO to avoid duplication of data reporting. For the other agencies, the process is as follows: a) Agencies which make many seizures usually send their large batch of data to the Administrator who transfers them to the system (as officials do no have the time to enter so many data online); b) For agencies which make relatively few seizures, the EU-TWIX Focal Point enters their data online. They may contact the Administrator subsequently if, for example, correction of mistakes are needed following data input, if data need to be completed after they had a problem during the data input etc.)

- 1 -Entry of <u>ALL</u> data online using personal access codes
- 2-ALL data sent to the Administrator to be transferred
- 3- Customs data sent by WCO to avoid duplication of data reporting  $\Box$

- 4-<u>Large batches</u> of data sent to the Administrator
- 5-<u>Small batches</u> of data entered online

Other

Please specify:

Answers	1	2	3	4	5	Other
NZ CITES MA			Х	Х	Х	
German CITES MA				X	Х	
INTERPOL						Ecomessage
WCO	Х		Х	Х		
TRAFFIC			Х	Х	Х	
USFW			Х		Х	
UNEP-WCMC						Х
VS (EU-TWIX)			Х	Х	Х	
CT			Х	Х		

### Additional comments:

# 17) Do you think that all national databases of the countries participating data to GLOBAL-TWIX should be standardised with GLOBAL-TWIX to facilitate data transfer?

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: Several EU agencies who did not have a national database were sent the EU-TWIX table template. Other agencies already had a working national database, but were willing to add extra 'EU-TWIX fields' to increase the completeness of their data. The national databases do not always have the same fields as the EU-WTIX database and some manual 'conversion' has to be carried out by the Administrator.)

National databases should be standardised

National databases should NOT be standardised

If no, please explain

Answers	YES	NO
NZ CITES MA		X (but files yes)
German CITES MA		X
INTERPOL	X	
WCO		
TRAFFIC	X	
USFW		X
UNEP-WCMC		
VS (EU-TWIX)	X	
СТ	X	Couldn't

### Additional comments:

# 18) How do you suggest that risks of data duplication in GLOBAL-TWIX are avoided?

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: In Europe, two agencies may deal with the same case within one same country, meaning that they will both record the same seizure case in their respective database which feeds the EU-TWIX database. In some cases, the data are more complete for one of the two agencies involved (for example, if this agency 'completed' the case). The situation in each country had to be

evaluated on an individual basis in order to identify which particular agency ought to submit the data to the EU-TWIX system.)

Your thoughts and suggestions:

### First stages

### 19) What are the priority stages for the establishment of GLOBAL-TWIX?

- 1- Contact all participating agencies and establish the network first
- 2- Establish the website and database structure first  $\Box$
- 3- Start gathering data (for example by working with WCO to transfer all the Customs data)
- 4- Other

Please specify:

Answers	1	2	3	4
NZ CITES MA		Х		
German CITES MA		Х		
INTERPOL	X			
WCO	X			Project plan, meetings and budget
TRAFFIC	Х	Х	Х	
USFW		Х		
UNEP-WCMC	X			
VS (EU-TWIX)	X	Х	Х	
СТ		Х	Х	

### Additional comments:

20) Do you think that seminars/workshops should be held when the GLOBAL-TWIX database is launched so as to update some officials about how to use the system etc?

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: Several meetings were held with EU-TWIX Focal Points at the onset of the project to explain how the system worked.)

Yes			
No			

Answers	YES	NO
NZ CITES MA		X (cost)
German CITES MA	X	
INTERPOL	Х	
WCO	X	
TRAFFIC	Regional	
USFW	Х	
UNEP-WCMC	X	
VS (EU-TWIX)	Regional	
СТ	X	

# 21) Would you have any suggestions about who would possibly finance GLOBAL-TWIX?

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: The EU-TWIX system has received the financial support of the European Commission and the governments of several EU Member States in the past.)

Your thoughts and suggestions:

## Development of GLOBAL-TWIX

22) Do you think that a GLOBAL-TWIX Advisory Group should be established? (possibly as a continuation of the current Working Group)

<u>(Status for EU-TWIX</u>: There is currently an Advisory Group for EU-TWIX which consists of 6 enforcement officials from a variety of agencies (police, Customs, CITES MA's, and Environmental Inspection Services) and from various European countries. This Group advises the Administrator on EU-TWIX issues arising and guides the development of the system so that it meets European officials' needs as closely as possible.)

Yes	
No	

Answers	YES	NO
NZ CITES MA	X	
German CITES MA	X	
INTERPOL	X	
WCO		
TRAFFIC	Regional too	
USFW	X	
UNEP-WCMC	X	
VS (EU-TWIX)	Regional too	
СТ	Х	

Additional comments:

23) Please include below any additional comments which you may have and are not related to the questions above:

Thank you for your contributions!

-end-