1. This document has been submitted by the Chairmen of the Animals and Plants Committees.

## Proposal for the Self-Evaluation of the Scientific Committees: Performance Analysis Chart

## Methodology

- 1. Classify the tasks and duties assigned to the Committees (defined in Resolution Conf. 11.1) in two or three *priority levels*: HIGH, MEDIUM or LOW.
- 2. For each task or duty define the *performance level*: HIGH, MEDIUM or LOW.
- 3. Where MEDIUM or LOW performance is identified and only for MEDIUM and HIGH PRIORITY tasks, clearly define the specific *gaps* that have led Committees to carry out these tasks at low or medium performance levels.
- 4. For each of the above (MEDIUM and HIGH PRIORITY tasks with MEDIUM or LOW *performance level*) try to identify the major *factors* that could be systematically *affecting the performance* of the Committees in the development of that task or duty.
- 5. Propose specific ways (*improvement proposals*) that can help to improve fulfilment of the tasks or duties (e.g. amendment of resolutions, budget assignment/distribution, meetings structure, capacity building).
- 6. For HIGH PRIORITY tasks, define simple *indicators* that could be used periodically to monitor the improvement in the performance and the way and process by which these can be measured.

Note: In order to evaluate each field, the summary chart presented as Table 2, which is an internal, dynamic, live document of the AC and PC can be used as a reference. It includes all the information compiled by the Secretariat and provided as Annex 3 and Annex 4 of document PC16 Doc. 7 (Rev. 1). Table 2 could also be complemented during the meeting, with additional information on tasks carried out by committees under the different items, but it would not be of much help in evaluating the performance of the Committees, given their live, dynamic nature.

## II. Specific product to be delivered to the External Evaluation Working Group of the Standing Committee

- 1. Summary of activities and recommendations as reflected in pages 1 and 2 of this Working Group report.
- 2. Performance Analysis Chart (Tables 1a and 1b).
- 3. Assessment of tasks and duties assigned to Committees (Tables 2a and 2b).
- 4. Assessment of performance and difficulties encountered by Committee members as indicated in Table 3.

	TABLE 1a. PLANTS AND ANIMALS COMMITTEES TERMS OF REFERENCE					
Tasks/Duties assigned to Committees (and its members) by the CoP (Resolution Conf. 11.1)	Priority	Performance level	Gaps	Factors affecting performance	Improvement proposals	Indicators
1.1. a) provide advice and guidance to the Conference of the Parties, the other committees, working groups and the Secretariat, on all matters relevant to international trade in animal and plant species included in the Appendices, which may include proposals to amend the Appendices;	1	1		Some assignments from CoP and SC are neither scientific nor technical, or are beyond the resources of the technical committees and the Committees focus on higher priorities.	The CoP and SC should consider whether tasks/duties assigned to technical committees are indeed of technical/scientific nature before they are assigned.	
1.2. b) assist the Nomenclature Committee in the development and maintenance of a standardized list of species names;	3	1				
1.3. c) assist the Secretariat with the implementation of the Resolution on the Identification Manual and Decisions related to it and,  upon request of the Secretariat, review proposals to amend the Appendices with regard to possible identification problems;	3	1		Limited available technical expertise and limited scope of work for Committees. Budgetary limitations to conducting the work	Encourage parties and NGOs to develop materials and provide information, particularly as part of proposals submitted	
1.4. d) cooperate with the Secretariat on the implementation of its programme of work to assist Scientific Authorities;	1	2	Once members arrive in the venue, performance is 1. Performance is sometimes affected by members not being able to attend workshops	No available funds to cover Committee members' time contributed to training efforts. Also time and administrative restrictions.	Funding sources should be identified and approached. Parties should ensure that their nominees to Committees have the time and conditions to address CITES work, and know job description and requirements.	All workshops include participation of Committee members. Members' involvement in training workshops should go up. The level of support from the nominating

					party or region for the representative should increase.
1.5. e) develop regional directories that list the botanists and zoologists in each region who are experts in CITES-listed species;	3	PC 1- AC 3	PC has considered it a top priority in the past and the task has been addressed, so priority was reassessed at 3. AC has not considered it a priority but this may change in the near future.		
1.6. f) establish a list of those taxa included in Appendix II that are considered as being significantly affected by trade, and review and assess all available biological and trade information including comments by the range States on these taxa to:					
i) exclude all species for which there is adequate information to conclude that trade is not having a significant detrimental effect on their populations;	1	1			
ii) formulate recommendations for remedial measures for those species for which trade is believed to be having a detrimental effect; and					
iii) establish priorities for projects to collect information for those species for which there is insufficient information available on which to base a judgement as to whether the level of trade is detrimental;					

1.7. g) assess information on those species for which there is evidence of a change in the volume of trade or for which specific information is available to indicate the necessity for review;	1	1				
1.8. h) undertake a periodic review of animal or plant species included in the CITES Appendices by:						
i) establishing a schedule for reviewing the biological and trade status of these species;						
ii) identifying problems or potential problems concerning the biological status of species being traded;			PC has continued to conduct this process continually. AC has			
iii) consulting the Parties on the need to review specific species, working directly with the range States in the selection process, and seeking their assistance in such reviews; and	1	1	directed effort to clarification of the selection process			
iv) preparing and submitting amendment proposals resulting from the review, through the Depositary Government, for consideration at meetings of the Conference of the Parties;						
1.9. i) make available advice on management techniques and procedures for range States requesting such assistance;	1-2	PC 2 – AC n/a	Question on whether parties are aware of this possibility	PC: this process has been growing over the past few years. AC has not received requests of assistance. This is a reactive process that is triggered by parties. If parties do not request	PC: To produce more materials that assist parties in management techniques. AC: Raise awareness of the possibility to obtain this assistance.	Manuals, checklists, and case studies are made available to parties. An improved scientific basis for management

1.10. j) draft resolutions on matters related to animals or plants, for consideration by the Conference of the	1	1		assistance and if Committees have a large work load already, this process becomes ad-hoc.		techniques and procedures
Parties;  1.11. k) perform any other functions that may be entrusted to them by the Conference of the Parties or the Standing Committee; and	1	2	Varied levels of performance, depending on the internal assignment of priorities by Committees	Limitations of time, funds, scope, degree of technical/scientific involvement in issues	As part of the decision making process, consideration should be given to whether specific issue is in the mandate of the Scientific Committees and in the scope of the Strategic Action Plan. Further, financial and time implications of mandates to Committees should be considered	All issues directed to Committees are integral to the Committee's mandate and the Strategic Action Plan. All issues are addressed with the appropriate amount of time, energy, and other resources
1.12. I) report to the Conference of the Parties and, if so requested, to the Standing Committee, on the activities they have carried out or supervised between meetings of the Conference;	1	1				
1.13. RESOLVES further that the Animals Committee shall also deal with issues related to the transport of live animals;	2	1				

	TABLE 1b. NOMENCLATURE COMMITTEE TERMS OF REFERENCE					
Tasks/Duties assigned to Committees (and it's members) by the CoP (Resolution Conf. 11.1)	Priority	Performance level	Gaps	Factors affecting performance	Improvement proposals	Indicators
3.1. i) cause standardized nomenclatural references for animal and plant taxa, to the level of subspecies or botanical variety and including synonyms, to be prepared, or propose for adoption existing nomenclatural references, as appropriate, for all species listed in the Appendices to the Convention;	1	1		Good performance only possible due to additional scientific and financial support from parties, scientific institutions and NGOs. This comment is relevant for all the tasks assigned to the NC.	Restoration of a dedicated budget line for NC would ensure an ongoing effective committee which could respond to the future demands of the CoP. Much of the current work lies on the good will and support of individual parties.	
3.2. ii) upon its acceptance of a new or updated reference (or part thereof) for a given taxon, after following the procedure described below, present this to the Conference of the Parties for adoption as the standard reference for that taxon;	1	1				
<ul><li>3.3. iii) ensure that the highest priorities in developing the standard reference lists of animal and plant names and synonyms be:</li><li>A. species names of animals and plants listed at the species level in the Appendices;</li></ul>	1	1				
<ul><li>B. generic names of animals and plants listed at the genus or family level in the Appendices; and</li><li>C. family names of animals and plants</li></ul>						

listed at the family level in the Appendices;					
<b>3.4.</b> iv) review the existing Appendices with regard to the correct use of zoological and botanical nomenclature;	2	1			
3.5. v) upon request from the Secretariat, review proposals to amend the Appendices to ensure that correct names for the species and other taxa in question are used;	1	1	Although this task is reactive. A more effective process would be if the NC was more actively involved/consulted during the preparation of proposals.	Implementation of consultation procedure with the NC early in the development of a proposal.	
3.6. vi) ensure that changes in nomenclature recommended by a Party do not alter the scope of protection of the taxon concerned; and	1	1			
3.7. vii) make recommendations on nomenclature to the Conference of the Parties, other committees, working groups and the Secretariat;	1	1			

TABLE 2	2A. SUMMARY OF TASKS AN DU	TIES ASSIGNED AND CARRIED OUT BY THE SCIENTIFIC COMI	<u>MITTEES</u>
Tasks/Duties assigned to Committees (and it's members) by the CoP (Resolution Conf. 11.1)	Strategic vision tasks	Specific instructions given by the cop	Results
1.1. Advice and guide CoP, Committees, WG's, Secretariat (all matters relevant to international trade)	<ul> <li>1.1.4. Ensure adequate review and adoption of policies and legislation (e.g. land tenure; access to natural resources; harvesting; transporting, handling and housing of live specimens; and effective seizures, fines and penalties), which may be having a significant impact on the conservation status of species or implementation of the Convention.</li> <li>2.2.2. Encourage Parties to consult with the Animals and Plants Committees as appropriate to assist in the preparation of proposals to amend the Appendices.</li> <li>2.4.1. In collaboration with enforcement agencies, identify the needs for and potential benefits of innovative technologies.</li> <li>2.4.2. In collaboration with Parties, international agencies, and relevant research entities, identify the available technologies (e.g. digital</li> </ul>	Resolution Conf. 8.9 The Trade in Wild-Caught Animal Specimens; and Decisions 10.79 to 10.82. Implementation of Resolution Conf. 8.9 (Trade in wild-caught animal specimens). Decisions 11.106 to 11.109. Implementation of Resolution Conf. 8.9 (Rev.) (Trade in specimens of Appendix-II species taken from the wild).  Resolution Conf. 8.13. Use of Coded-Microchip Implants for Marking Live Animals in Trade.  Decision 10.78. Universal tagging system for the identification of crocodilian skins.	recommendations for several species of previous review cycles and initiated post-CoP10 review of species in significant trade. Detailed instructions in Decisions 10.79 to 10.82. Actions reported in document Doc. 11.41.1. Prepared proposal for revision of Resolution Conf. 8.9 (document Doc. 11.41.2). (CoP10-CoP12); PC supported the review of plants in Madagascar (CoP10-CoP11).  Fulfilled. Reported on developments in microchipimplant technology. Proposed revision to Resolution Conf. 8.13 in Document Doc. 11.50. (CoP10-CoP11)  Fulfilled. Proposal made in Document Doc. 11.51 — subsequently adopted as Resolution Conf. 11.12 on Universal tagging system for the identification of crocodilian skins. (CoP10-CoP11)

	barcodes, holograms, DNA tests) relevant to assisting the better implementation of the Convention.  2.4.4. Develop with relevant institutions collaborative research projects for testing the appropriateness of new and forthcoming technologies.	Decision 11.162. Universal labelling system for the identification of caviar.	Fulfilled. Report on the development of a uniform marking system for sturgeon parts and derivatives and aquaculture stocks to assist in subsequent identification of the species presented to CoP 11. (document Doc. 11.53). (CoP10-CoP11).
SC54 Inf. 5		Resolution Conf 9.15. Conservation of edible-nest swiftlets of the genus Collocalia.	Collaborated with the Secretariat to explore mechanisms for the effective and secure labelling of caviar that is subject to repackaging and re-export (document CoP12 Doc. 42.2). (CoP11-CoP12)
5 – p. 9		Resolution Conf. 9.17. Status of international trade in shark species.	Fulfilled. Reviewed conservation and management of and trade in Collocalia spp. and activities of ASEAN Task Force for the Conservation of
		Decisions 10.73 and 10.74. Biological and trade status of sharks.	Edible-Nest Swiftlets. (Document Doc. 11.11.1). (CoP10-CoP11)
		Decision 11.94. The Biological and trade status of sharks.	Tasks completed by CoP10. Repealed and replacement by two Decisions which AC proposed (Doc 11.11.1). (CoP10-CoP11)
		Resolution 12.6. Conservation and management of sharks.	Fulfilled. AC Chairman participated in technical

technology, microchips,

Decision 13.43. Sharks.  Resolution Conf. 10.16. Specimens of animal species bred in captivity.  Decision 10.77. Specimens of animal species bred in captivity.  Decision 10.77. Specimens of animal species bred in captivity.  Fulfilled. Document	ng group to draft basics
Decision 10.77. Specimens of animal species bred in captivity.	with FAO. (Reported in ment Doc. 11.11.1). 0-CoP11) ed. Report in document 2 Doc. 10.1. (CoP11-
	ed. Activities reported in ment CoP13 Doc. 35. 2-CoP13)
	gress (CoP13-CoP14).
Consensur Decisions 10.75 and 10.76 (document	discussion but no nsus reached yet. ment Doc. 11.11.1). 0-CoP11)
Decision 11.97. Seahorses and other members of the family Syngnathidae	ed. Report provided to nd revision of Resolution 10.16 proposed. ment Doc. 11.48). 0-CoP11)
Decision 12.60. Sea cucumbers.	gress (CoP13-CoP14).
cucumbers forward a	n deferred and carried rd as Decisions 11.100 1.115. (CoP10-CoP11)
	ed. Participated in cal workshop and

		<b>Decision 12.62</b> . Stony corals.	reviewed its outcome. (Document CoP12 Doc. 43) (CoP11-CoP12)  Progress reported in document CoP13 Doc. 37.1. Most tasks accomplished. (CoP12-CoP13)  In progress (CoP13-CoP14).
SC54 lnf. 5 – p.		Decision 13.96. Fossil corals.  Decision 11.101. Operations that breed Appendix-I animal species for commercial purposes.	Largely fulfilled: amendments to Resolution Conf. 11.10 proposed, document on coral production systems produced, list of coral genera that cannot be identified to species and/or genus level established. Further work needed on fossil coral – continued as Decision 12.62. (CoP11-CoP12)
). 11		Resolution Conf. 12.10. Guidelines for a procedure to register and monitor operations that breed Appendix-I animal species for commercial purposes. Decision 11.102. Operations that breed Appendix-I animal species for commercial purposes.	Progress reported in document CoP13 Doc. 38. Proposals incorporated in Resolution Conf 12.3 (Rev. CoP13) and Proposal CoP13 Prop. 36. Remaining work continued in further Decisions (13.95 to 13.97). (CoP12-CoP13)
		Decision 12.78 paragraphs a) and b). Operations that breed Appendix-I animal species for commercial purposes.	No consensus achieved on list of Appendix-I species that are critically endangered in the

		<b>Decision 11.165.</b> Trade in traditional medicines.	wild and/or known to be difficult to breed or keep in captivity. (CoP11-CoP12)
			Advised on one request to register a commercial captive-breeding operation. (CoP12-CoP13)
		Decision 11.118. Annotations for medicinal plants in the Appendices; Decisions 13.50 to 13.52. Medicinal plants.	Activity carried forward as Decision 11.102 (Rev. CoP12). (CoP11-CoP12)
SCA/ Inf A		Decisions 11.103 to 11.105.  Trade in time-sensitive research samples.	Fulfilled. Progress reported in document CoP13 Doc. 56.1; proposed recommendations incorporated in Resolution Conf. 12.10 (Rev. CoP13). (CoP12-CoP13)
n 10		Resolution Conf. 11.1 (Rev. CoP12). Establishment of Committees.  Decisions 11.102 (Rev. CoP12) and Decision 12.78	Secretariat asked the AC for assistance in implementing paragraph a) of Decision 11.165, but AC could not provide purpose for or benefits from compiling inventories of operations that breed animals
		paragraph c). Relationship between ex situ production and in situ conservation.	for medicinal purposes. (CoP11-CoP12)
			Not undertaken – carried forward as Decision 11.118 (Rev. CoP12). (CoP11-
		Decision 13.68. Production systems for specimens of CITES-listed species.  Decision 12.43. Pancake	CoP12); In progress (CoP13-CoP14).

	to	ortoises	Fulfilled. Produced document
			for SC54 and document
		ecision 10.76. Trade in alien pecies.	CoP12 Doc. 51. (CoP11-CoP12)
		ecision 12.24. Technical	Provided comments on four draft amendment proposals from Parties. (CoP12-CoP13)
			Activities reported in document CoP13 Doc. 56.3.1. AC was unable to implement Decision 11.102 (Rev. CoP12) and 12.78, paragraph c). Task reassigned to SC in Decision 13.78. (CoP12-CoP13)
			In progress (CoP13-CoP14).
			Much work done. Progress reported in AC chair's report at CoP13, Doc E13-09-1-1, items 52-55.
			Discussed in AC 21 and again in AC 22 with a document. Ongoing work.
			Discussed at AC 19 and AC 20 and reported back to the SC after AC 20.
1.2. Assist Nomenclature			
Committee		_	

1.3. Assist Secretariat (ID Manual, identification problems of proposals)	2.4.2. In collaboration with Parties, international agencies, and relevant research entities, identify the available technologies (e.g. digital technology, microchips, barcodes, holograms, DNA tests) relevant to assisting the better implementation of the Convention.  2.4.4. Develop with relevant institutions collaborative research projects for testing the appropriateness of new and forthcoming technologies.	Resolution Conf. 8.13. Use of Coded-Microchip Implants for Marking Live Animals in Trade.  Decision 10.78. Universal tagging system for the identification of crocodilian skins.  Resolution Conf. 10.12. Conservation of Sturgeons.  Decision 11.162. Universal labelling system for the identification of caviar.	Fulfilled. Reported on developments in microchip-implant technology. Proposed revision to Resolution Conf. 8.13 in Document Doc. 11.50. (CoP10-CoP11)  Fulfilled. Proposal made in Document Doc. 11.51 — subsequently adopted as Resolution Conf. 11.12 on Universal tagging system for the identification of crocodilian skins. (CoP10-CoP11)  Fulfilled. Report on the development of a uniform marking system for sturgeon parts and derivatives and aquaculture stocks to assist in subsequent identification of the species presented to CoP 11. (document Doc. 11.53). (CoP10-CoP11).  Collaborated with the Secretariat to explore mechanisms for the effective and secure labelling of caviar that is subject to repackaging and re-export (document CoP12 Doc. 42.2). (CoP11-CoP12)
1.4. Cooperate with Secretariat to assist Scientific Authorities	1.7.1. Develop a manual specifying the obligations and procedures of the Scientific Authorities in order to encourage the development of		

	specific training courses for them.  1.7.3. Communicate to the Parties the importance and advisability of including plants experts within the structure of the Scientific Authorities.		
	2.3.1. Develop practical guidance for making non-detriment findings, including a manual and checklist, and samples of non-detriment findings and case studies.		
	2.3.2. Facilitate national and regional training for Scientific Authorities in the issuance of scientifically based non-detriment findings; include the use of the aforementioned guidance on non-detriment findings.		
1.5. Develop regional directories (experts)	1.7.2. Develop regional directories that list the botanists and zoologists in each region who are experts in CITES-listed species.		
1.6. Significant Trade Review (evaluation, formulation of recommendations, prioritize projects).	<ul><li>1.4.4. Develop a simple guide to the Review of Significant Trade.</li><li>2.1.3. Continue the Review of Significant Trade as initiated by the Parties in Resolution Conf.</li><li>8.9 (Rev.)1.</li></ul>	Resolution Conf. 8.9 The Trade in Wild-Caught Animal Specimens.	Fulfilled. Formulated recommendations for several species of previous review cycles and initiated post-CoP10 review of species in significant trade. Detailed instructions in Decisions 10.79 to 10.82. Actions reported in document Doc.

		Decisions 10.79 to 10.82. Implementation of Resolution Conf. 8.9 (Trade in wild-caught animal specimens).	11.41.1. Prepared proposal for revision of Resolution Conf. 8.9 (document Doc. 11.41.2). (CoP10-CoP11)
		Resolution Conf. 8.9 (Rev.). Trade in specimens of Appendix-II species taken fro the wild.	above. (CoP10-CoP11)  m Reviewed 42 species,
SCA/ lpf A		Decision 11.92. Musk deer.	categorized each and formulated recommendations or requests for further information as necessary. Initiated the first country-based Review of Significant Trade, selecting Madagascar. (See also Decisions 11.93, 11.95 and 11.106). (CoP11-CoP12)
n 16		Decisions 11.95 and 11.96 and Resolution Conf. 10.12 (Rev.). Trade in and conservation of sturgeons ar paddlefish.	Four species of Moschus spp. reviewed; recommendations for China and the Russian Federation made. (CoP11-CoP12)
		Resolution Conf. 12.8. Revie of Significant Trade in specimens of Appendix-II species.	Fulfilled. Review of Significant Trade completed for 27 species. Report on implementation of Resolution Conf. 10.12 (Rev.) on Conservation of sturgeons (document CoP12 Doc. 42.1). Consolidation of Resolutions relating to sturgeons and caviar (document CoP12 Doc.

	42.2). (CoP11-CoP12)
	42.2). (COFTI-COFT2)
	Decision 12.75. Evaluation of the Review of Significant Trade.  Finalized reviews of Testudines and Acipenseriformes. Formulated recommendations for four species. Selected 20 new
	Resolution Conf. 12.8. Review of Significant Trade in specimens of Appendix-II species.  Species for reviews. Advised on the implementation of nine previous recommendations. Monitored country-based Review of Significant Trade in Madagascar and assisted in development of Action Plan. (CoP12-CoP13)
	Decisions 12.73 and 12.74. Review of Significant Trade.  Fulfilled. Terms of Reference for the evaluation of the Review proposed in Document CoP13 Doc. 40 and adopted. (CoP12-CoP13).
7 7	Decisions 13.55 and 13.56. Bigleaf mahogany.  PC Selected five taxa for review, considered expert reports on taxa selected earlier and formulated remedial recommendations. Assisted Malagasy Authorities to determine appropriate milestones for assessing the implementation of the action plan (CoP12-CoP13).
	Fulfilled. The review of plants in Madagascar was completed (PC13 Inf. 8) and a follow-up workshop held. The Plants Committee reviewed three of

			the four taxa listed in Decision 12.74. (CoP12-CoP13)
			In progress (CoP13-CoP14)
1.7. Assess trade information to indicate the necessity for review.	<ul> <li>1.4.5. Develop and enhance databases that include information related to species in trade, CITES Decisions and procedures.</li> <li>2.2.3. For identified commodities, develop standardized units of measure for permits, trade analysis and reporting.</li> </ul>	See point 1.8. Periodic review	See point 1.8. Periodic review
1.8. Periodic review (schedule, identify problems, consult Parties, prepare and submit amendment proposals).	2.1.2. Regularly review the Appendices to ensure that listed taxa satisfy the relevant criteria.	Resolution Conf. 9.24 and Decisions 10.71 on improvement of the effectiveness of the Convention.  Regular review of the status of species included in Appendices I and II; Decision 10.83.  Resolution Conf. 11.1 Annex 2 paragraph h). Periodic review of the Appendices.  Decision 11.91. Tursiops truncates ponticus (Black Sea bottlenose dolphin).	AC: Thirty-one species selected for periodic review according to specific criteria, but no reviews completed in time to make proposals to CoP11. (CoP10-CoP11); PC: Following periodic review, 11 species proposals were made to amend the Appendices at CoP11.  Seven were adopted, two adopted as amended, one rejected and one withdrawn (CoP10-CoP11).  Twelve taxa reviewed.  Resulted in proposal Prop. 34 at CoP12, which was adopted. Adopted draft guidelines for identifying species for review. (CoP11-CoP12)

		<b>Decision 11.93.</b> Freshwater turtles and tortoises.	Fulfilled, but no consensus reached on conservation status. (CoP11-CoP12)
		Resolution Conf. 11.1 (Rev. CoP12). Establishment of Committees. Periodic review of animal species included in the Appendices.	Fulfilled. Five species reviewed. Revised resolution produced. (Document CoP12 Doc. 39). (CoP11-CoP12)
		<b>Decision 12.96.</b> Periodic review of the Appendices.	Reviews were suspended, and a joint AC-PC WG developed mechanisms to facilitate future reviews (see Decision 12.96). (CoP12-CoP13)
SC54 Inf 5 -		<b>Decision 13.93.</b> Review of the Appendices.	Fulfilled. Activities and recommendations reported to SC in Annex to document SC50 Doc. 31 and document SC51 Doc. 16. (CoP12-
n 10		<b>Decision 10.87.</b> Periodic review of the appendices (timber).	CoP13) In progress (CoP13-CoP14).
		Resolution Conf. 11.1 Annex 2 paragraph h). Periodic review of the Appendices.	Report from UNEP-WCMC (PC9 document Doc. 17.2) evaluated, but not presented at CoP11 (CoP10-CoP11).
		Decision 11.111. The biological and trade status of Harpagophytum; Decision 13.60. Harpagophytum.	Work undertaken on Orchidaceae and Cactaceae, but no proposals to amend the appendices submitted as a result (CoP10-CoP11).
		Decisions 11.112 and 11.113. Aquilaria spp.	

	Decisions 12.66 to 12.71. Aquilaria species.	Fulfilled. See document CoP12 Doc. 46. (CoP11- CoP12); In progress (CoP13- CoP14).  Fulfilled. Reported in document Doc. 10.2 on work undertaken and recommended new Decisions that were accepted at CoP12. (CoP11- CoP12)
	Decision 11.114. Guaiacum	33,
	spp.	Decision 12.70 was dealt with under recommendations for Malaysia resulting from the Significant Trade Review. Decisions 12.66-69 and 12.71, were completed –
	Decision 13.54. Tree species.	most of this work carried forward as Decisions 13.61-64. (CoP12-CoP13)
		At COP 12 PC reported activities and results of discussion and resolved that Dec. should continue on beyond CoP 12. At CoP 13 PC reported work on Guaiacum and recommended deletion of Dec 11.114
		In progress (CoP13-CoP14).
1.9. Advice Parties on management techniques and procedures	Resolution Conf 9.15. Conservation of edible-nest swiftlets of the genus Collocalia.	Fulfilled. Reviewed conservation and management of and trade in Collocalia spp. and activities of ASEAN Task Force for the Conservation of

SC54 Inf. 5 – p. 22	

		to Resolution Conf. 11.10 proposed, document on coral production systems produced, list of coral genera that cannot be identified to species and/or genus level established. Further work needed on fossil coral – continued as Decision 12.62. (CoP11-CoP12)
1.10. Draft resolutions	Resolution Conf. 8.9 The Trade in Wild-Caught Animal Specimens; Decision 10.88. Significant trade in Appendix-II species.  Resolution Conf. 8.13. Use of Coded-Microchip Implants for Marking Live Animals in Trade.	Fulfilled. Formulated recommendations for several species of previous review cycles and initiated post-CoP10 review of species in significant trade. Detailed instructions in Decisions 10.79 to 10.82. Actions reported in document Doc. 11.41.1. Prepared proposal for revision of Resolution Conf. 8.9 (document Doc. 11.41.2) (CoP10-CoP11); Fulfilled. Amendments to Resolution Conf. 8.9. presented to CoP (document Doc. 11.41.2) and adopted (CoP10-CoP11).
	Resolution Conf. 9.24. Criteria for amendment of Appendix I and II.	Fulfilled. Reported on developments in microchip-implant technology. Proposed revision to Resolution Conf. 8.13 in Document Doc. 11.50. (CoP10-CoP11)
	Decision 11.2. [Annex 2] Review of the criteria.	Fulfilled. As instructed at SC41, formulated terms of reference for the procedure to

			review criteria for amendment of Appendices I and II. (Document Doc. 11.25). (CoP10-CoP11)
		<b>Decision 12.97.</b> Review of the criteria for amendment of Appendices I and II.	Fulfilled. Participated in Criteria Working Group. Unable to agree on joint proposal with other scientific committee. New listing criteria not adopted at CoP12. (Document CoP12 Doc. 58)
		<b>Decision 10.77</b> . Specimens of	(CoP11-CoP12)
S		animal species bred in captivity.	Fulfilled. Activities reported in document CoP13 Doc. 57.
SC54 Inf 5 - n 03		<b>Decision 10.78.</b> Universal tagging system for the identification of crocodilian skins.	Proposed revision of Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP12) adopted with minor amendments. Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP13). (CoP12- CoP13)
		<b>Decision 11.90.</b> Duties of members of the Committee and their alternates.	Fulfilled. Report provided to CoP and revision of Resolution Conf. 10.16 proposed. (document Doc. 11.48). (CoP10-CoP11)
		<b>Decision 11.93.</b> Freshwater turtles and tortoises.	Fulfilled. Proposal made in Document Doc. 11.51 – subsequently adopted as Resolution Conf. 11.12 on Universal tagging system for the identification of crocodilian
		Decisions 11.95 and 11.96 and Resolution Conf. 10.12 (Rev.). Trade in and	skins. (CoP10-CoP11)

		<del>,</del>
	conservation of sturgeons and paddlefish.  Decisions 11.98 and 11.99.	Relates to the individual functions of the members and alternates members of the committee [later incorporated into Resolution Conf. 11.1 (Rev. CoP12)]. (CoP11-CoP12)
	Trade in hard corals.	Fulfilled. Five species reviewed. Revised resolution produced. (Document CoP12 Doc. 39). (CoP11-CoP12)
	Resolution Conf. 11.1 (Rev. CoP12). Establishment of Committees. Improving regional communication and representation.	Fulfilled. Review of Significant Trade completed for 27 species. Report on implementation of Resolution Conf. 10.12 (Rev.) on Conservation of sturgeons (document CoP12 Doc. 42.1). Consolidation of Resolutions relating to sturgeons and
2	Decision 12.62. Stony corals.	caviar (document CoP12 Doc. 42.2). (CoP11-CoP12)
	Decision 12.78 paragraphs a) and b). Operations that breed Appendix-I animal species for commercial purposes.	Largely fulfilled: amendments to Resolution Conf. 11.10 proposed, document on coral production systems produced, list of coral genera that cannot be identified to species and/or genus level established. Further work needed on fossil coral – continued as Decision 12.62. (CoP11-CoP12)
		Fulfilled. Produced document CoP13 Doc. 11.2 on regional

SC54
54 Inf. 5
- p. 25
•

			communication and representation and Resolution Conf.11.1 (Rev. CoP13) on establishment of Committees (one amendment proposed by AC/PC accepted; four others rejected). (CoP12-CoP13)
			Progress reported in document CoP13 Doc. 38. Proposals incorporated in Resolution Conf 12.3 (Rev. CoP13) and Proposal CoP13 Prop. 36. Remaining work continued in further Decisions (13.95 to 13.97). (CoP12-CoP13)
			Fulfilled. Progress reported in document CoP13 Doc. 56.1; proposed recommendations incorporated in Resolution Conf. 12.10 (Rev. CoP13). (CoP12-CoP13)
	2.1.4. Evaluate trade and biological information on currently unlisted species subject to significant international trade to determine	<b>Resolution Conf. 9.17.</b> Status of international trade in shark species.	Tasks completed by CoP10. Repealed and replacement by two Decisions which AC proposed (Doc 11.11.1). (CoP10-CoP11)
1.11. Other functions entrusted by the CoP or the SC.	whether they would qualify for and benefit from CITES listing.  2.3.5. Provide opportunities for Scientific Authorities to	Resolution Conf. 9.25 (Rev.). Inclusion of species in Appendix III.	No advice requested from parties (CoP10-CoP11).
	exchange information and data (e.g. sharing of non-detriment findings; sharing of data, management plans and case studies; postings to a website;	<b>Decision 10.59.</b> Improvement of the effectiveness of the Convention.	AC and PC Chairmen participated in activities of Strategic Plan Working Group. (Document Doc. 11.12.2).

SC54
lnf.
О
Ι
0
26

and communication through a		(CoP10-CoP11)
listserver).	Decision 10.72. Improvement	
	of the effectiveness of the	Members handicapped in pre-
2.4.5. Assess progress on a	Convention; Decision 10.84.	Animals Committee meeting
regional basis.		coordination and consultation
		with other countries in their
4.3.2. Participate actively at		region by communication
scientific meetings and		difficulties. Decision 10.72
conferences, and encourage		later incorporated into
participation in CITES issues by		Decision 11.110 (Duties of
the scientific community.	Resolution Conf. 11.1 (Rev.	the members of the
the scientific scinificatity.	CoP12). Establishment of	Committee and the
	Committees. Improving	alternates). (CoP10-CoP11)
	regional communication and	
	representation.	Fulfilled. Produced document
		CoP13 Doc. 11.2 on regional
		communication and
		representation and Resolution
	<b>Decision 11.150.</b> Tortoises	Conf.11.1 (Rev. CoP13) on
	and freshwater turtles.	establishment of Committees
		(one amendment proposed by
		AC/PC accepted; four others
		rejected). (CoP12-CoP13)
	Decision 13.6. Addis Ababa	Fulfilled. Participated in
	Principles and Guidelines for	technical workshop. Produced
	the Sustainable Use of	document CoP12 Doc. 39 and
	Biodiversity.	a revised resolution in
		conjunction with the
		Secretariat. (CoP11-CoP12).
	<b>Decision 13.9.</b> Review of the	Scorotariat. (Soi 11 Soi 12).
	scientific committees.	In progress (CaD12 CaD14)
		In progress. (CoP13-CoP14)
	Decisions 13.12 and 13.13.	
	Improving regional	In progress. (CoP13-CoP14)
	communication and	in progress. (Cur 13-Cur 14)
	representation.	

SC54	
Inf.	
5	
0	
27	

		T		T
			Decisions 12.9 to 12.12. Work programme of the Plants Committee.	In progress. (CoP13-CoP14)
			Decisions 12.13 and 12.14. Regional meetings of the Plants Committee.  Decision 12.24. Technical implementation issues.  Decision 13.8. Global Strategy for Plant Conservation.	Results reported in document CoP13 Doc. 9.2.1. Most work relates to duties found in Resolutions. Regarding Decision 12.12 a report on linkages between Plants Committee activities and the Global Strategy for Plant Conservation of the Convention on Biological Diversity was send to the CBD Secretariat. Decision 12.10 not completed (carried forward as Decision 13.54). (CoP12-CoP13)  Fulfilled. For financial reasons, only the European region was able to hold a regional meeting. Regional directories were completed in the six regions (CoP12-CoP13).  No requests received from the Standing Committee.
1.12. Report to CoP and SC.				
1.13. RESOLVES further that the Animals Committee shall also deal with issues related to the transport of live animals;	1.1.6. Develop further regulations to prevent unnecessary loss during catching, storage and		Resolution Conf. 10.21. Transport of live animals.	Working group established. Poor response from Parties hampered progress. (Document Doc. 11. 54)

SC5	
54	
Inf.	
$\sigma$	
- 1	
9	
28	

transportation of live animals.		(CoP10-CoP11)
	Resolution Conf. 10.21. Transport of live animals.	Collated and analysed the transport mortality reporting forms received from Parties but no systematic review of the causes of mortality, injury or damage to health in transport or means of reducing these undertaken.
	Resolution Conf. 10.21. Transport of live animals.	(document CoP12 Doc. 25). (CoP11-CoP12)
	Decision 12.85. Transport of live animals.	Fulfilled. Activities reported in document CoP13 Doc. 21. (CoP12-CoP13)
	Decisions 13.88 and 13.89. Transport of live specimens.	Progress reported in document CoP13 Doc. 21; activities not completed. Work to be continued in new Decision 13.88. (CoP12-CoP13)
		In progress (CoP13-CoP14).

TABLE 2B.	SUMMARY OF TASKS AN DUTIES ASSIGNED AND CARRI	ED OUT BY THE NOMENCLATURE CO	<u>DMMITTEE</u>
Tasks/Duties assigned to Committees (and it's members) by the CoP (Resolution Conf. 11.1)	Specific instructions given by the cop		Results
3.1. i) cause standardized nomenclatural references for animal and plant taxa, to the level of subspecies or botanical variety and including synonyms, to be prepared, or propose for adoption existing nomenclatural references, as appropriate, for all species listed in the Appendices to the Convention;	Resolution Conf. 10.22. Standard nomenclature.  Decisions 10.90 and 10.91. The working programme until CoP11.  Resolution Conf. 11.22. Standard nomenclature.  Resolution 12.11. Standard nomenclature.	Fulfilled. Actions described in document 11.11.4.1.  Largely fulfilled. Report given in document 11.11.4.1  Fulfilled. Actions described in document CoP12 Doc. 10.3 (Rev. 1).  Fulfilled. Actions described in document CoP13 Doc.	
3.2. ii) upon its acceptance of a new or updated reference (or part thereof) for a given taxon, after following the procedure described below, present this to the Conference of the Parties for adoption as the standard reference for that taxon;  3.3. iii) ensure that the highest priorities in developing the		9.3.1./Ongoing process  Ongoing process  Ongoing process	
priorities in developing the standard reference lists of animal and plant names and synonyms be:  A. species names of animals and plants listed at the species level in the Appendices;			

B. generic names of animals and plants listed at the genus or family level in the Appendices; and  C. family names of animals and			
plants listed at the family level in the Appendices;			
	Decision 11.120. Nomenclature of amphibian species.	Fulfilled. Standard reference for amphibians reviewed.	
	Decision 13.94. Standard nomenclature for birds.	For birds: In progress.Ongoing process	
3.4. iv) review the existing Appendices with regard to the correct use of zoological and botanical nomenclature;	Decision 11.119 The Nomenclature Committee shall:  a) maintain and update the databases from which the orchid checklists were generated, to facilitate publication of updates to these lists as required by the Parties. In addition, all of the databases require work to enable them to be made available in electronic form to the Parties. The most work required is for the upgrade to the Cactus Checklist database. The key databases should be converted and maintained at a level to allow printing 'on demand' for future publications; and  b) at the same time, CD-ROMs should be developed and searchable checklists should be established on the World Wide Web. It is beyond the scope of the nomenclature programme to fund such projects fully. It is hoped that the provision of limited seed funding will encourage organizations and institutions to develop, host and maintain websites and transfer checklists to CD-ROMs.	Task completed using external funds	
<b>3.5.</b> v) upon request from the Secretariat, review proposals	Decision 12.55. Seahorses and other members of the family Syngnathidae.	Fulfilled. See proposal in document CoP13 Doc. 9.3.1	

to amend the Appendices to ensure that correct names for the species and other taxa in question are used;			
3.6. vi) ensure that changes in nomenclature recommended by a Party do not alter the scope of protection of the taxon concerned; and		Ongoing process	
3.7. vii) make recommendations on nomenclature to the Conference of the Parties, other committees, working groups and the Secretariat;		Ongoing process	
Other mandates	Decision 13.9. Review of the scientific committees.  Decision 13.12. Improving regional communication and representation.	In progress In progress	

TABLE 3. ASSESSMENT OF PERFORMANCE OF MEMBERS OF THE ANIMALS AND PLANTS COMMITTEES AND THEIR ALTERNATES				
Tasks/Duties assigned to Committees (and its members) by the CoP (Resolution Conf. 11.1)	How have you addressed this task/duty during the period you have been a member	Major problems encountered in fulfilling the task	Suggested measures to fix problems	
2.1. a) each member should collaborate with his/her alternate regarding the work to be done between the meetings of the Committee;	NA: keep communication with alternate to share workload. Not satisfactorily. Attempts to contact alternate unsuccessful. Contact was done. Communication via e-mail. Only contacted members by fax before and after meetings. No reply so no communication There were only few cases when needed I have had regular contact with my alternate and we have good collaboration (alternate responding) I was asked to do specific duties (regional report) No particular efforts Yes. Frequent contact by email During AC mtg or by email By means of a fluid and constant communication	Heavy workload, sometimes intermittent communication. Alternate has changed intersessionally Receiving responses from alternate and agreeing on tasks No response, cannot reach. No response, mainly because address is not correct. Alternate has no email No problems Lack of answer from parties No problem My alternate did not attend to AC mtg No response from members	Organizing regular meetings of regional reps. Updating directory. Updating the directory or address. Visit alternate but this is impractical Mandatory regular communication Maybe appropriate to send by email and a copy to Chair The only way is to seek a mechanism to punish the member	
2.2. b) each member should maintain regular communication with the Parties in his/her region;	NA: Almost constant communication. Well. Not always. Sometimes. Circulated key documents and reports at meetings We have met several times I sent info and agenda to all	Getting responses – obligations and commitment.  Communication problems, change of personnel  Only two responses to requests for advice for this meeting  No problems  I do not know if I really reached the correct individuals. Some emails jump back	Establishing better communication system to each party.  Should have active contact person in each Party.  Continue to conduct 2 regional meetings Parties should provide contacts Institutional support  The only way is to seek a mechanism to punish the member	

	parties in my region No particular efforts Yes By sending email before AC meeting By means of a fluid and constant communication	regularly Time constraints. Too many parties Some communications are difficult Not response and changing the persons and addresses No response from members	
2.3. c) when a region has more than one representative, the representatives should also agree which Parties each represents. Contact persons should be identified in those countries. Contact should also be established with non-Parties in the region;	Contacts with parties and communication is frequent.  Agreed to allocate responsibilities – English and French speaking countries.  Two of us agree to work on all Parties. No contact was conducted with all Parties.  The work not divided for each representative. No contact with non-parties.  N/A  We divided our region but I do not need contact persons; we have worked altogether (MA and SA)  This has been done well (see however 2.2 above concerning contacts)  No particular efforts. Only one rep during my term  No. Both the reps have contacts with all the parties  We divided countries within region between two reps  Through committee meetings and CoP's	Fulfilling the assignments as agreed due to party commitments that lacks (sic).  Communication is difficult because not all Parties are active. No communication with non-Parties – no information and address.  Communication is a major problem. The message cannot reach the Parties.  N/A  No problem  Some communications are difficult  Changes of people and their contact info are not provided	Recognition of regional reps by management authorities and pending resources.  Should have active contact person in each Party.  Each Part should send the names and addresses to Secretariat and inform the representative.  N/A  - Should be informed AC Chair or CITES Secretariat  Provide current information through communication
2.4. d) each member should increase	All 3 parties in NA are well	Sometimes time constraints	In NA, teleconference, email, and trilateral

the awareness of the role and function of the Committee, its mandate and the issues of concern to his/her region through mechanisms such as participation in seminars or in related meetings organized by the Secretariat and by other organizations at regional or sub-regional level;	aware of Committee functions and roles. At least one regional meetings every year Fair — especially during scientific committee meetings. Not always able to attend activities in the region. Have participated in and made presentations to regional capacity building workshops There were 3 seminars in the last year in Hungary sponsored by NGOs If ever such events are organized and participation is possible I participated Report submission to, and presentation on the task at the regional meeting held before CoP Yes. Annual regional meetings have been Organized in the region. Some regional level, regional meeting in the EU Informing by sending news and events to parties	Lack of organized meetings and seminars.  No financial support to attend all regional/subregional activities.  Not practical to hold such workshops more than once per one or two per year.  No problem.  Not invited to such events. Not much aware of such events. No funding and or lack of time due to other obligations.  Low response. Time and budget constraints.  No problems.  Many parties are not attending to the meeting and no feedback.	meetings. Improve planning and prioritization process Available funds to attend seminars at regional and subregional levels. Seeking funds to attend the activities of regional rep. Not a major problem No measures Increase recognition of position within region and parties. Allow funds and time Institutional support
2.5. e) before the meetings of the Committee, the members should inform and consult the Parties in their regions about the agenda and in particular on matters specifically relevant to the countries of the region;	Regional meetings and teleconferences previous to meetings. Carried out effectively but no results. Yes. Have done this as a matter of course I have sent a letter about it Done – or at least refered to the CITES website	Occasional time constraints. Communication and response. Not all Parties gave response. Very few parties respond Very few responses No problem Practically no feedback Low response No problems Do not provide too much info	Allocate time slots to issues and keep timing Improve modes of communication. Accessibility of internet to specific. ? Target parties with specialized questions of key importance to each party No measures

2.6. f) the members should submit a written report, covering the preceding period, to each meeting of the Committee;	By sending mail or email to SA and/or MA Yes. Above all in the context of EU Be requested in particular case for a given country By communications and reports of participation Input is requested and received for regional reports weeks in advance to deadline. This is done at every Scientific Committee meeting. Yes. Yes; the task has been accomplished Achieved I have asked info from my region The report has been regularly submitted By asking related activities through mail/email Yes. See Doc PC 16 5.4 Send all report we receive from parties to Secretariat We have not concluded our period: was no done in the past	Resources and non-response from Parties. Lack of information from many Parties. Not enough information The major problem is the reports do not convey much useful information Lack of response Getting info for the report is difficult. Little input by the parties of the region Low response and too many parties Some difficulties to receive information from some parties Not responding	Commitment by Parties. Do not complicate or increase reporting requirements There are too many reporting tasks and only few persons working for CITES Reconsider the necessity for the submission of annual reports Correct directory of the region; update the contact person's list We need to develop a mechanism for this issue
2.7. g) the members should inform the Parties in their regions of the results of each meeting of the Committee;	Communication is fluent in region.  Not good communication. Yes. Yes, we will Achieved	Ranging interests of each Party. OK. No feedback I do not feel it is important. Everybody can get information from CITES website Practically no feedback	Improve communication network Can probably be done effectively by the Secretariat. No suggested change Revise the necessity for this obligation in view of availability of the results in the internet Each party should refer the summary

	I have not fulfilled this job Done. Referred the region to the CITES website, when the summary is published By contacting SA/MA of particularly concerned parties and report submission Yes Send a summary of CITES report Through communication and	Some difficulties to receive information from some parties No feedback	record
2.8. h) the members must inform the alternates well in advance if they will not attend a forthcoming Committee meeting; and	reports of participation  Communication constant.  No need has arisen yet.  Yes.  Has not applied I have done  Have never been in this situation  No such case I attended all PC meetings  By email before each meeting  Through communication and reports of participation	Communication and response.  OK.  N/A  No problem  No problem  No problem; rep regularly attends	Provide and confirm availability to attend meetings. No suggested change No suggested measures
2.9. i) the members should provide to their successors all relevant information on the activities in the region;	Not much; only what happens in regional mtgs.  Never done previously.  Yes.  Has not applied as yet  I will do it  Have not received such information  No particular efforts but by term overlapping  No problem at the moment	New reps sometimes do not recognize or are not familiar with top priority issues Knowing successors and their addresses. OK. N/A No problem Difficult to know what the successor needs to know No problems Don't know who will be elected	Debriefing sessions with incoming members and outgoing members should provide a short written report. Build capacity. No suggested change No suggestions Preparation of a document describing the information It should be coordinated through Secretariat

SC54
lnf. 5
I
0
ω
7

	In written format and will be	
	sent by email	
	Has not been done in the past	