

Significant trade in plants
Implementation of Resolution Conf. 12.8

PROGRESS WITH THE IMPLEMENTATION OF SPECIES REVIEWS

**Review of information and confirmation of categorisation by the Plants Committee –
Recommendations of the Significant Trade working group**

1. This document has been prepared by the working group on the Review of significant trade in specimens of Appendix-II species.
2. The working group comprised of regional representatives of Africa, Asia, Oceania and observers from Botswana, Democratic Republic of Congo, Germany, Ireland, Malaysia, Namibia, South Africa, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland (UK), United Republic of Tanzania, United States of America and the European Commission, TRAFFIC East/South Africa, Fauna and Flora International (FFI), Species Survival Network (SSN) and UNEP-WCMC. The working group was Chaired by the United Kingdom.
3. The Chairman introduced Resolution Conf. 12.8 explaining that the task of the working group was to review the information found in the Significant Trade reviews carried out to date (East African Aloes, *Aquilaria malaccensis*, *Pericopsis elata* and Cycads), confirm or revise the preliminary categorizations proposed and formulate recommendations.
4. The recommendations of the working group are outlined in Annex 1.
5. The working group also considered document PC14 Doc. 6.4 *Aquilaria* spp. (Decisions 12.66-12.71): Progress Report and reviewed their status. The results of this review are included in Annex 2.

PC14 Doc. 9.2.2 Annex 1 - Review of the Significant Trade – Cycads

The regional representative of Africa introduced document PC14 Doc. 9.2.2 Annex 1.

Provisional categorisations:

- a) 'Species of urgent concern' shall include species for which the available information indicates that the provisions of Article IV, paragraph 2 (a), 3 or 6 (a), are not being implemented – all species of *Cycas* from Viet Nam and Thailand because there is some doubt as to the taxonomy of species in trade and where the basis for non-detriment findings is not known (e.g. *C. dolichophylla*, *C. elongate*, *C. inermis*, *C. lindstromii*, *C. micholitzii*, *C. multipinnata*, *C. pachypoda*, *C. pectinata*, *C. siamensis*).
- b) 'Species of possible concern' shall include species for which it is not clear whether or not the provisions of Article IV, paragraph 2 (a), 3 or 6 (a), are being implemented – includes *C. thouarsii* from Madagascar, where more information is required on the making of non-detriment findings.
- c) 'Species of least concern' shall include species for which the available information appears to indicate that the provisions of Article IV, paragraph 2 (a), 3 or 6 (a), are being met – included here are all other species included in the review.

The working group confirmed the categorisation of 'species of urgent concern' of all species of Appendix II *Cycas* from Viet Nam and Thailand where there is some doubt as to the taxonomy of species in trade and where the basis for non-detriment findings is not known (e.g. *C. dolichophylla*, *C. elongate*, *C. inermis*, *C. lindstromii*, *C. micholitzii*, *C. multipinnata*, *C. pachypoda*, *C. pectinata*, and *C. siamensis*). The working group also upgraded *C. thouarsii* from Madagascar from a preliminary categorisation of 'species of possible concern' to 'species of urgent concern' due to the fact that the basis for non-detriment findings is not known.

In Thailand recent taxonomic studies have resulted in the description of several new species (7 of which are classified as threatened by the IUCN) and it is unclear whether species in trade are correctly identified, and that there appears to be no information on the size of populations or the impact of harvesting. It is unclear what procedures are in place to implement the provisions of Article IV.

In Viet Nam there is commercial export of wild collected *Cycas* plants. The identification of species in trade is uncertain due to recent changes in *Cycas* taxonomy with 15 out of 24 species of *Cycas* listed as threatened by the IUCN. There is also a large domestic trade in *Cycas*, and reports of unregulated trade between Viet Nam and China, and there appears to be no information on which to base non-detriment findings.

The working group confirmed the categorisation of 'species of least concern' and recommended that these be eliminated from the review.

Formulation of Recommendations and their transmission to the range States:

Thailand

Within 3 months:

- a) The Management Authority to stop issuing export permits for commercial trade in wild collected *Cycas* species until the scientific basis for non-detriment findings has been established and there are clear procedures in place for issuing non-detriment findings.
- b) The Management Authority should clarify how it determines the level of trade is not detrimental to the populations concerned.
- c) The Management Authority should report to the Secretariat on what mechanisms are in place to ensure that wild harvested species are correctly identified.

Viet Nam

Within 3 months:

- a) The Management Authority to suspend issuing export permits for commercial trade in wild collected *Cycas* species until procedures are in place to ensure that the provisions of Article IV can be implemented.
- b) The Scientific Authority to report to the Secretariat on what basis non-detriment findings are made.
- c) The Management Authority should report to the Secretariat on what administrative procedures are in place to ensure that exported specimens of wild origin are properly identified.

Within 1 year:

- a) The Management Authority must develop and implement plans to control unregulated trade between Viet Nam and China.

Additional recommendations

China

- a) The Management Authority to report on what steps have been taken to control unregulated trade between Viet Nam and China and the effectiveness of existing regulations.

Madagascar

- a) The Management Authority to provide information on the non-detriment finding procedure they are following to allow exports of wild harvested specimens of *Cycas thouarsii*.
- b) The Secretariat to liaise with the Management Authority on the implementation of the provisions of Article IV through the Action Plan for country based Significant Trade survey for Madagascar.

China

- a) The Management Authority to provide information on the monitoring of illegal trade between Viet Nam and China and the effectiveness of regulations implemented in 2000 to curb illegal trade.

South Africa

- a) The Management Authority to provide the CITES Secretariat with information on seizures of plants crossing the border between South Africa and Mozambique or appearing in trade within the country and what steps have been taken to regulate trade.

Mozambique

- a) The Management Authority to provide the CITES Secretariat with information on seizures of plants crossing the border between South Africa and Mozambique or appearing in trade within the country and what steps have been taken to regulate trade.

The Plants Committee

- a) The Plants Committee to consider Mozambique as a potential candidate for a country- based Significant Trade study.
- b) The Plants Committee to write a letter to southern African range States for *Encephalartos* species to express the concern of the Plants Committee that Appendix-I cycads are continuing to decline in these countries and request information on what additional management strategies are being proposed to deal with this situation.

IUCN-SSC Cycad Specialist Group

- a) To notify UNEP-WCMC and the CITES Nomenclature Committee when new world lists of cycads are published.

The Secretariat

- a) Formulate a Notification to the Parties to encourage Parties to use species names when reporting on trade in cycads and to use standardized units (need to define what units?).
- b) To develop a checklist of species of concern to be used by enforcement officers.

PC14 Doc. 9.2.2 Annex 2 - Review of the Significant Trade – *Aquilaria malaccensis*

The consultant (TRAFFIC East/South Africa) introduced document PC14 Doc. 9.2.2 Annex 2.

The working group confirmed the categorisation assigned by the consultants (see document PC12 Doc. 9.2.2 Annex 2)

Formulation of Recommendations and their transmission to the range States:

Malaysia

Within six months

- a) The Management Authority and Scientific Authority of Malaysia to collate internal license data from 1998 to 2002, cross referenced to harvesting locations in terms of CITES Plants Committee document PC14 Doc. 9.2.2 recommendation b) and report:
 - i) How much of the agar wood harvest and trade is legal,
 - ii) How harvest and trade is being managed or could be better managed,
 - iii) To cross check the trade statistics referred to above.
- b) The CITES Secretariat to request the Management Authority of Sarawak to collate internal license data from 1998 to 2002, cross referenced to harvesting locations in terms of CITES Plants Committee document PC14 Doc. 9.2.2 recommendation b) and report:
 - i) How much of the agar wood harvest and trade is legal,
 - ii) How harvest and trade is being managed or could be better managed,
 - iii) To cross check the trade statistics referred to above.
- c) The Management Authority and Scientific Authority of Malaysia to liaise with Indonesia and other range states to explore the possibility of having a workshop to discuss and resolve regional *Aquilaria* spp non-detriment finding methodologies.
- d) The Management Authority of Peninsular Malaysia in conjunction with the Scientific Authority of Malaysia to establish a cautious quota to be managed through the Malaysian licensing system.
- e) Malaysian government reports progress being made on implementation of recommendations to CITES Plants Committee.

Within one year:

- f) The Scientific Authority of Malaysia to convene, in conjunction with the Malaysian Timber Industries Board (MTIB – the CITES Management Authority for tree species in Peninsular Malaysia), the Peninsular Malaysia Forestry Department, the Sarawak Forestry Department (the CITES Management Authority for Sarawak), the Forest Research Institute of Malaysia (FRIM) and associated technical experts (for instance, IUCN; CITES Plants Committee and TRAFFIC South East Asia), a working group to develop a robust Non-Detriment Finding methodology to be used to monitor agarwood harvest and trade.
- g) Report back on progress being made with the National Forest Inventory 4 (NFI-4) and the ability of the inventory to provide baseline data for establishing the Non-detriment Finding Methodology for *Aquilaria* species.
- h) Malaysian government reports progress being made on implementation of recommendations to CITES Plants Committee.

Indonesia

Within 6 months

- a) The Indonesian Scientific Authority clarify the methodology currently being used for the Non Detriment Finding assessments, with particular attention being paid to the calculation of the real amount of *A. malaccensis* (within the quota including four other agarwood-producing species) being harvested and traded.
- b) Indonesian authorities, including the representative to the CITES Plants Committee, work with the Indonesian agar wood trading association to develop a robust Non Detriment Finding methodology.

Within one year

- a) Implement the NDF recommendations made in (a) above
- b) The Management Authority and Scientific Authority of Indonesia to liaise with Malaysia and other range states to explore the possibility of having a workshop to discuss and resolve regional *Aquilaria* spp non-detriment Finding methodologies.

India

Within 6 months

- a) The Indian government clarifies the regulatory and management framework currently in operation that distinguishes imported stock from any production from native populations of *Aquilaria malaccensis*.

Within one year

- a) The Indian government implements a Non-Detriment Finding process for “formulations” derived from *A. malaccensis* and re-examines national legislation to ensure that incentives for good management are in place.

Bangladesh

Within 3 months

- a) The CITES Secretariat to request the Bangladesh government to provide recent trade data for *A. malaccensis* and if evidence of trade is found then the Secretariat should consider revising the categorization for Bangladesh to “Species of Possible Concern”.

State of Sabah, Malaysia

Within 3 months

- a) The CITES Secretariat to request the Scientific and Management Authority of Malaysia to clarify the existence of internal transport of *A. malaccensis* cargoes between Sabah and the other two Malaysian jurisdictions and whether it is being monitored by relevant authorities, and how many harvesting permits for *A. malaccensis* are issued in Sabah on an annual basis.
- b) If exports are occurring then the Secretariat should consider revising the categorization for State of Sabah to "Species of Possible Concern".

Thailand

Within 3 months

- a) The CITES Secretariat to request the Thai government to provide recent trade data for *A. malaccensis* and if evidence of trade is found then the Secretariat should consider revising the categorization for Thailand to "Species of Possible Concern".

Additional Recommendations

The CITES Secretariat

- a) The CITES Secretariat to ask Singapore to clarify how it controls imports and re-exports, particularly with regard to differentiating between individual agarwood-producing species.

The Plants Committee

- a) In association with the Secretariat liaise with the Indonesian Management Authority to review the need to prepare proposals to list all agarwood producing genera (*Aquilaria* spp., *Aetoxylon* spp., *Gonocarpus* spp. and *Gyrinops* spp.) on CITES Appendix II.

PC14 Doc 9.2.2 Annex 3 – Review of Significant Trade – *Pericopsis elata*

The consultant (FFI) introduced document PC14 Doc. 9.2.2 Annex 3.

Provisional categorisations:

- a) 'Species of possible concern' for which it is not clear whether or not the provisions of Article IV paragraph 2 (a) and (b) are being implemented shall include Cameroon, Central African Republic, Congo and Democratic Republic of Congo.

The working group confirmed this categorisation of 'species of possible concern' for Cameroon, Central African Republic, Congo and Democratic Republic of Congo and that of 'species of least concern' for Cote d'Ivoire, Ghana and Nigeria.

Representatives from Democratic Republic of Congo, European Commission, Fauna & Flora International and Species Survival Network formulated the following recommendations.

Formulation of Recommendations and their transmission to the range States:

Cameroon

Within six months:

- a) Notwithstanding information available from other sources, the Scientific and Management Authorities should provide to the Secretariat confirmation that the existing policies in place provide an adequate scientific basis for the formulation of non-detriment findings for *Pericopsis elata*, the procedures for issuing export permits on the basis of the non-detriment finding and for monitoring the volume of exports in accordance with the requirements of Article IV.

Central African Republic

Within six months:

- a) The CITES Authority should provide information on the distribution and abundance of *Pericopsis elata* within the country and any other information relevant to the formulation of non-detriment findings. Information should also be provided on the measures in place to issue export permits and to monitor the levels of exports and to what extent this is based on Article IV paragraph 2(a) and (b).

Congo

Within 12 months:

- a) The CITES Secretariat should work with the Scientific and Management Authorities to ensure that the procedures in place for the management and export of *Pericopsis elata* are in full compliance with Article IV.

Democratic Republic of Congo

Within 12 months:

- a) The CITES Secretariat should work with the Scientific and Management Authorities to ensure that the procedures in place for the management and export of *Pericopsis elata*, which remains relatively abundant within the country, are in full compliance with Article IV.

In all of the above cases the information provided could include information on:

- the national forest estate;
- protected areas;
- concession policies;
- species inventories;
- quotas;
- current areas of harvesting;
- information regarding minimum felling diameters; and
- compliance and enforcement measures.

In this regard the relevance of this information to the implementation of Article IV to *Pericopsis elata* is particularly important.

- b) 'Species of least concern', for which the available information appears to indicate that the provisions of Article IV, paragraphs 2(a) and 3 are being met, shall include Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana and Nigeria are proposed for inclusion in this category because the levels of export of *Pericopsis elata* are limited, or no longer take place, as a consequence of reduced stocks and national controls.

Additional Recommendations

1. Evaluation of the current mechanisms to implement Article IV for *Pericopsis elata* may be facilitated by expert visits to Cameroon, Congo and Democratic Republic of Congo, for which funding would be required. The expert visits should be undertaken in consultation with the CITES Secretariat and results reported to the Plants Committee at its 15th Meeting.
2. The exporting states should be encouraged to work together to share experiences in the implementation of Article IV, to exchange information on procedures in place and to take common steps to improve monitoring of trade in the species.
3. Attention was drawn to possible routes and methods for illegal and unreported trade in *Pericopsis elata* – for example consignments being smuggled and shipped from non-range state ports, possibly labelled as non-CITES species. The Secretariat should draw this to the attention of importing (and re-exporting) countries and urge them to be especially vigilant in this regard.

4. It is apparent from information that has become available through the review process that abundant stocks of *Pericopsis elata* remain in parts of its range, that conservation and control measures are in place and that a re-evaluation of the IUCN Red List Threat Status may be required.

PC14 Doc. 9.2.2 Annex 4 - Review of the Significant Trade – East African Aloes

The consultant (FFI) introduced document PC14 Doc. 9.2.2 Annex 4.

Provisional categorisations:

- a) 'Species of urgent concern' shall include species for which the available information indicates that the provisions of Article IV, paragraph 2 (a), 3 or 6 (a), are not being implemented – *Aloe scabrifolia*, *A. secundiflora* and *A. turkanensis*. These species are included in this category because of the levels of exploitation in Kenya for the export trade of the wild harvested extract. No provisions exist for making non-detriment findings or for monitoring level of exports as required under Article IV paragraph 3. In addition, it is possible that other species are also being impacted by incidental collection for the trade.
- b) 'Species of possible concern' shall include species for which it is not clear whether or not the provisions of Article IV, paragraph 2 (a), 3 or 6 (a), are being implemented – no species were included in this category.
- c) 'Species of least concern' shall include species for which the available information appears to indicate that the provisions of Article IV, paragraph 2 (a), 3 or 6 (a), are being met. All *Aloe* species in Djibouti, Eritrea, Ethiopia, Mozambique, Somalia, Sudan, Tanzania and Uganda for which there is not current evidence of international trade are included in this category.

The working group confirmed these categories.

The representatives from Fauna and Flora International (FFI) and the regional representative for Africa formulated the following recommendations and additional remarks to be implemented for this review:

Formulation of Recommendations and their transmission to the range States:

Kenya

Within six months:

- a) The Management Authority and Scientific Authority should agree and specify their clear roles and responsibilities for controlling and monitoring *Aloe* trade;
- b) With assistance from the Secretariat the Management Authority should investigate the apparent high levels of unpermitted trade, determine and implement appropriate actions to regulate it and report to the Secretariat.

Within one year:

- a) Terms of reference shall be established and a programme implemented for the Scientific Authority to carry out annual field monitoring of *Aloe* harvesting and its impact on wild populations.
- b) The Management Authority should ensure that new CITES implementing legislation under development includes provisions and administrative procedures to regulate the export of *Aloe* extracts and is enacted within deadlines established under the National Legislation Project.

Additional recommendations

- a) The Secretariat formulate a Notification to the Parties to; i) encourage importing countries to improve reporting in *Aloe* extracts and treat *Aloe* extract as readily recognizable under the terms of the

Convention; ii) remind all range States of East Africa of the potential risk to wild populations of *Aloe* species, particularly the narrow endemics, of the developing Aloe extract industry in the region, noting that if well regulated this could provide benefits to rural communities in semi-arid areas;

- b) IUCN-SSC Cacti & Succulent Specialist Group in association with the IUCN-SSC East African Plant Specialist Group urgently review and update the conservation assessment for East African *Aloe* species using the latest version of the IUCN Red List Categories and Criteria.

Aquilaria spp. (Decisions 12.66-12.71) Progress Report

12.66 *The DNA work currently being undertaken by the National Herbarium of the Netherlands under contract with the Secretariat should continue and should be aimed at investigating the options for the development of identification tools based on molecular analysis.*

Recommendation - Recommended that DNA work conducted by the Netherlands is continued.

12.67 *More detailed information on the distribution of species should be compiled and assessed as an aid to better trade reporting, using point-of-origin data.*

Recommendation - Recommended that this work be conducted as part of Dec. 12.69 and co-ordinated by IUCN-SSC with input from the IUCN Global Trees Specialist Group. This decision can then be deleted

12.68 *As the trade is in the readily identifiable product of agarwood, studies should include all known agarwood-producing taxa and not only the CITES-listed species *A. malaccensis*.*

Recommendation - Retain this Decision and recommend discussion on the possible listing of all agar wood producing taxa on Appendix II.

12.69 *IUCN should be invited to re-evaluate the threatened status of all agarwood-producing taxa according to the 2000 IUCN criteria.*

Recommendation - Recommended that IUCN re-evaluation is a much needed activity and it be co-ordinated by IUCN-SSC with input from the IUCN Global Trees Specialist Group.

12.70 *A standard method for determining the population status of CITES-listed agarwood-producing taxa should be developed to assist Scientific Authorities in advising that exports will not be detrimental to the survival of the species in compliance with Article IV of the Convention. Such a standard method could be used to verify populations across all agarwood-producing areas, and allow not only the setting of appropriate quotas but also the verification of species being harvested.*

Recommendation - This decision is dealt with under recommendations for Malaysia from the Significant Trade Review outlined in Annex 1 of this document.

12.71 *Further field research should be conducted on trade dynamics, including in the major import and re-exporting States and territories (Japan, Saudi Arabia, Singapore, Taiwan, province of China, and the United Arab Emirates).*

Recommendation - It is recommended that this decision be retained as it has only been partly completed with work in South East Asia. Work in East Asia and the Middle East is required to complete this decision.